Resolving Australian tax controversies of the future: does the European Convention on Human Rights suggest a better way?

Associate Professor Justin Dabner
Resolving Australian tax controversies: does the tax the ECHR suggest a better way?

Introduction

- Administrator over-reach and taxpayer rights
- The taxpayers’ charter
- Inspector General of Taxation review
- Human rights protection in Australia
- European Convention on Human Rights (“ECHR”) and the European Court of Human Rights (“ECtHR”)
- A blueprint to resolve Australian tax controversies?
Protecting taxpayers’ rights in Australia

Avenues available:
- Part IVC of the *Taxation Administration Act 1953*
- Administrative *Decisions (Judicial Review) Act 1977*
- S.39B of the *Judiciary Act 1903*
- ATO complaints system
- Ombudsman / Inspector-General of Taxation
- *Freedom of Information Act 1982*
- *Public Governance, Performance and Accountability Act 2013*
- *Privacy Act 1988*
Protecting taxpayers’ rights in Australia (cont)

Are these adequate?

- Non-reviewable decisions: oral advice, access to accountants’ advices
- Taxpayers’ charter and the rise of soft law
- Co-operative compliance and practical compliance
- What happens when common sense is lacking?
- The inadequacy of the common law rights: Harris v DFCT
Protecting human rights in Australia

No bill of rights

Ad hoc legislation: eg privacy and anti-discrimination laws

National Human Rights Consultation Committee 2009, the Human Rights (Parliamentary Scrutiny) Act 2011 and the Parliamentary Joint Committee on Human Rights
The International Human Rights framework

The Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the International Conventions on Civil and Political Rights and on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

Human Rights Committee

ECHR and the ECtHR
ECHRR and Taxation

Particular rights relevant to taxation:
- Right to property (Article 1 of the 1st Protocol)
- Right to a fair trial (Article 6)
- Non-discrimination (Article 14)
- Right to privacy (Article 8)

Primary interpretation principles:
- Margin of appreciation
- Proportionality

Tax jurisprudence controversies:
- Tax policy and state sovereignty
- Ordinary tax matters and the fair trial mandate
Application to Australian controversies

Non-binding advices (access to accountants’ opinions)
Mass marketed tax schemes
Delayed refund payments
Excessive taxation of superannuation contributions
High net worth individuals, risk based audits and threats
The tax accountants’ strike
The collection of disputed tax
Miscellaneous instances of no review (eg revision of rulings, demands for withholding tax, failure to issue a ruling)
Conclusion

What prospects of a taxpayers’ or citizens’ bill of rights?
Adequate protection for taxpayers under a citizens’ bill?
ECHR lessons:
• State sovereignty and excessive taxation
• Article 6 and ordinary tax matters
• Article 6 and tax investigations
Systemic issues and tax oversight
A final caveat