never, ever, again...

Why Australian abortion law needs reform

Caroline de de Costa
never, ever, again...

*Why Australian abortion law needs reform*

2nd Edition

*With new chapter reporting on the Cairns abortion trial and its implications for abortion practice and law reform in Australia*
never, ever, again...

Why Australian abortion law needs reform

CAROLINE DE COSTA
acknowledgements

Many people have helped me with information and advice in the preparation of this book. My daughters, Viveka and Naomi; Cait Calcutt and Kate Marsh and many others at Children by Choice in Brisbane; Mrs Beryl Holmes, one of the original founders of CbyC and always a stalwart; Doctors Mike Carrette, Darren Russell, Chris Harmston and David Grundmann in Australia and Kate Paterson and David Paintin in London; Sir Donnell Deeny of Belfast; Associate Professor Heather Douglas of the University of Queensland; the staff of the Cairns Base Hospital Library; the staff of the Queensland State Archives and the staff of the Queensland Supreme Court Library.

I am grateful to them all.

Finally special thanks to Jonathan Richards, described in reviews of his own book as a ‘fixture’ at the State Archives, an extraordinarily painstaking researcher who kindly gave me directions to the twelve inquest records used in the book to tell the stories of some of the many Queensland women who have died from unsafe abortion.
So many trials. So many courts.

So many inquests.

So many women – dead, or damaged.

So many women – blamed.

Never, ever again.
contents

Glossary 11
Operation Hotel Tennant 13
A Horse With A Green Tail 25
So Many Women – Dead 39
So Many Women – Damaged 65
Let’s Have Our Children By Choice 75
Is This Or Is This Not A Farce? 83
The ‘Controversial Abortion Drug RU486’ 95
Mifepristone in Australasia 123
The Politics of Abortion in Queensland 1986-2010 129
Unplanned Pregnancy in Australia 133
Accessing Abortion in Australia – State By State 141
The Other Uses of Mifepristone 151
Why Australian Abortion Law Needs Reform 157
“Noxious” drugs – and “reasonable doubt 161
References 173
Abortifacient — a drug intended to bring about an abortion, usually used in the context of unlawful abortion and not in the context of drugs (such as mifepristone and misoprostol) used for lawful medical abortion.

Abortion / miscarriage / termination of pregnancy — the intentional expulsion or removal of the products of conception (embryo or fetus, placenta and membranes) from the uterus or womb. In this book these terms are used interchangeably to indicate induced abortion, as although 'abortion' is more commonly used by the general public today, 'miscarriage' is often used in legal documents and legislation to describe induced abortion. In the few instances in the book where spontaneous natural miscarriage is mentioned, this is clearly spelt out.

Bayliss, Bayliss and Cullen — when used in italics indicate the 1986 case in which Drs Bayliss and Cullen were charged with procuring an abortion and were acquitted.

Bourne — when used in italics this indicates the 1938 case in which Mr Aleck Bourne was charged with procuring an abortion and was acquitted.

Cervix — the lower part or ‘neck’ of the uterus.
Chemist – a pharmacist.

Curette, curettage – surgical procedure to empty the contents of the uterus – loosely used in the 20th century to refer to an abortion performed by a doctor.

Davidson – when used in italics indicates the 1969 Victorian case in which Dr Ken Davidson was charged with procuring an abortion and was acquitted.

Levine – Judge hearing the Wald case.

McGuire – Judge hearing the Bayliss and Cullen case.

Macnaghten – Judge hearing the Bourne case.

Medical abortion – abortion performed using drugs such as mifepristone and misoprostol.

Menhennitt – Judge hearing the Davidson case.

Methotrexate – drug used for medical abortion.

Mifepristone – RU486 – drug used for medical abortion.

Misoprostol – drug used for medical abortion.

RANZCOG – Royal Australian and New Zealand College of Obstetricians and Gynaecologists.

Shilling – unit of currency used in Australia prior to the introduction of decimal currency in 1966. There were twelve pence (pennies) to one shilling, twenty shillings to one pound, twenty-one shillings to one guinea. The shilling was also known colloquially as a ‘bob’.

Surgical abortion – abortion performed using instruments or suction apparatus to remove the pregnancy from the uterus.

Uterus – womb.

Wald – when used in italics indicates the 1971 case in which Dr Wald was charged with procuring an abortion, and was acquitted.
references

operation hotel tennant

Bita N. Insurer warns doctors on abortions. The Australian, 28/8/09
Cavanagh R. Body found in murder mystery. ntnews.com.au, 9/5/09
Chamberlin T. Murder fear as search widens. Cairns Post, 31/1/09
Children by Choice website— at www.childrenbychoice.org.au
Elks S. No drug evidence in abort case. The Australian, 4/9/09
Horin A. Use of abortion pill to quadruple. Sydney Morning Herald 6/6/09
Horin A. Time to stop dragging our heels on abortion law reform. Sydney Morning Herald, 10/10/09
Judge, B. Call to change abortion laws. The Sunday Mail, 7/9/09
Miles J, Odgers R. Stalemate on abortion. Courier-Mail, 1/9/09
Ryan B. Sobieralski killed after drug deal failed, court told. Cairns Post, 7/12/09
Taylor, P, compere. WIN Local News, Cairns, 24/11/09
Thompson H. The Times blog 18/9/09
Tom E. Pious pill posturers blind themselves to women's real pain. The Australian, 6/8/09.
Walker J. Abortion statute on the cards for repeal. The Australian, 24/8/09
Walker J. Bligh widens abortion law as doctors revolt. The Australian, 22-23/8/09
Walker J. Out of step with this day and age. The Australian, 22-23/8/09
Walker J, Hyde V. First illegal termination case for 25 years. The Australian, 12/9/09
Zlotowski M. Miscarriage of justice. Cairns Post, 17/4/09
Zlotowski M. The story that has put abortion back in the dock. Cairns Post, 28/9/09
a horse with a green tail

Rex v. Bayliss and Cullen (1986). *9 Qld Lawyer Reports* 8 (Dist Court) McGuire J at 45
Rex v. Bourne (1939) 1 KB 687
Rex v. Wald (1971) 3 NSWDCR 25 at 29

so many women – dead

Inquest records from Queensland State Archives:
JUS/N505, inquest 477 of 1912
JUS/N956, inquest 893 of 1932
JUS/N958, inquest 954 of 1932
JUS/N974, inquest 8 of 1934
JUS/N981, inquest 382 of 1934
JUS/N997, inquest 416 of 1935
JUS/N1006, inquest 64 of 1936
JUS/N1049, inquest 529 of 1938
JUS/N1085, inquest 463 of 1940
JUS/N1087, inquest 556 of 1940
JUS/N1097, inquest 184 of 1941
JUS/N1322, inquest 354 of 1958

so many women – damaged

JUS/N1049, inquest 529 of 1938
R.v. Gould and Barnes (1960 Qd R 283)
R. v. Neil (1908 St R Qd 225)
R.v. Neil (1909 QWN 36)
K. v. T. (1983 1Qd R 396)
R. v. Manuel (1953 QWN 14)
R. v. Moore (1945 QWN 1)
R. v. Jones (1929 QWN 44)
R. v. Toogood (1944 QWN 1)
Humphries v. The King (1943 CCA April 21, June 1 1943)

let’s have our children by choice

www.childrenbychoice.org website

is this or is this not a farce?

Anonymous. ‘Tactics of smear’ used in abortion case – barrister. Courier-Mail, 31/1/86
Anonymous. Clinic charges dismissed. Courier-Mail 4/7/85
Anonymous. Clinic mum tells of pain. Sunday Sun, 2/2/86
Anonymous. Courier-Mail Poll. Courier-Mail, 1/6/85
Anonymous. Full Court to rule on clinic raids. Courier-Mail, 8/6/85
Anonymous. Trial doctor finally breaks her silence. Sunday Mail, 2/2/86
Blanch K. Clinic telephones bugged, says Bayliss. Courier-Mail, 5/6/85
Dibben K. Doctors cleared. Daily Sun, 1/2/86
Gerber P. Seizure of medical records. Medical Journal of Australia, 8/7/1985
Hairine M. Police stop abortion. Telegraph, 28/8/85
Howard S. Raids Net 47,000 Names. Daily Sun, 21/5/85.
Koch T. Doctors ‘treat worried women’. Courier-Mail, 8/6/85
McKean B. A judge’s ruling goes under the microscope. Courier-Mail, 3/2/86
Morey P. No more clinic charges, says Harper. Courier-Mail 3/7/85
Mortison D. Police “followed up” files. Courier-Mail 3/7/85
Petersen D. Backbencher Bailey hits at abortion raid. Courier-Mail, 5/6/85
Reinhardt D. Abortion raids kill promising political career. The Bulletin, 4/6/85
Rex v. Bayliss and Cullen (1986). 9 Qld Lawyer Reports 8 (Dist Court) McGuire J at 45
Rex v. Bourne (1939) 1 KB 687
Rex v. Wald (1971) 3 NSWDCR 25 at 29

‘the controversial abortion drug RU486’

American College of Obstetricians and Gynecologists – www.acog.org/from_home/publications
Anderson, L. Women buy abortions on the web. The Advertiser, Adelaide, 20/11/06
Bateman D. Abort law, women say. Cairns Post, 8/2/10
De Costa CM. Medical abortion for Australian women – it’s time. Medical Journal of Australia, 2005; 183: 378-80
Dickson R. Fast-track debate on new laws. Cairns Post, 3/9/09
Dickson R. GPs fear backyard abortions. Cairns Post, 3/9/09
Elks S. Bligh refuses abortion reform. The Australian, 29/12/09

175
Hack (Triple J) – 3/6/09 – Kate O'Toole interviewing Caroline de Costa
Harris S. Both aborted and applauded. The Australian, 4/6/09
King G. Ban on abortion sparks exodus. Sunday Mail, Brisbane, 6/9/09
Jones T, presenter. Lateline. www.abc.net.au/lateline/content/2009/s2358722
Qld Attorney-General, letter to Caroline de Costa, 17/9/09
Mc Cutcheon P. Queensland abortion laws under scrutiny. ABC 7.30 Report, 3/9/09
Mamers P et al. Women's satisfaction with medical abortion with RU486
Medical Journal of Australia 1997 167:316-17
Marsh K. New coalition to pursue abortion law reform. Media release, Children by Choice, 5/6/09
Michael P. Abortion doctor halts pill supply. Courier Mail, 3/6/09
Rouse R. Medical abortion now routinely available. Medical Observer, 15/6/07
Tuttiett H. Abortion law forcing doctors to drop drug. Cairns Post, 3/6/09
Walker J. Abortion pill saved my life, says patient. The Australian, 6/8/07
Walker J. Abortion statute on the cards for repeal. The Australian, 24/8/09
Walker J. Bligh widens abortion law as doctors revolt. The Australian, 22-23/8/09
Walker J. Out of step with this day and age. The Australian, 22-23/8/09
Walker J. Abortion statute on the cards for repeal. The Australian, 24/8/09
Walker J. Hyde V. First illegal termination case for 25 years. The Australian, 12/9/09

mifepristone in Australasia

Anderson, L. Women buy abortions on the web. The Advertiser, Adelaide, 20/11/06
Dickinson J, Brownell P et al. Mifepristone and second trimester pregnancy termination for fetal abnormality in Western Australia; Worth the effort. ANZJOG 2010; 50(1): 60-4
Sparrow M. A woman’s choice. ANZJOG, 2004; 44:88-92

the politics of abortion in Queensland 1986-2010

Children by Choice website www.childrenbychoice.org.au
Editorial, The Sun Herald 4/12/05 (Sydney)
Hansard, Senate, 8 and 9 February 2006; House of Representatives 15 and 16 February, 2006; at www.aph.gov.au
unplanned pregnancy in Australia


Halpern V, Grimes D, Lopez L, Gallo M. Strategies to improve adherence and acceptability of hormonal methods of contraception. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews* 2006 CD004317

Horin A. There’s got to be a morning after. *Sydney Morning Herald* 28-29/6/03 (quoting from *Family Planning Perspectives* Journal 2000)


McLean T. Women using 'unreliable' contraception. *Herald Sun* 7/7/08 (quoting Jayne Lucke senior researcher in population health at UQ)


accessing abortion in Australia – state by state


Children by Choice website www.childrenbychoice.org.au

Mackenzie M, comperce. ABC Radio National, Bush Telegraph, 17/8/06

Letter from Queensland Attorney-General to Dr T Wright, 5/10/09

Letter from SA Minister for Health to Dr T Wright, 7/10/09

Rex v. Wald (1971) 3 NSWDCR 25 at 29

CES v. Superclinics (Australia) Pty Ltd (1995) 38 NSWLR 47


the many other uses of mifepristone


Check JH et al. Efficacy of the progesterone receptor antagonist mifepristone for palliative therapy of patients with a variety of advanced cancer types. *Anticancer Research* 2010; 30(2): 623-8

Dickinson J. Late pregnancy termination within a legalised medical environment. *ANZJOG* 2004; 44:337-41
Fiscella K et al. Effect of mifepristone for symptomatic leiomyomata on quality of life and uterine size – a randomized controlled trial. Obstetrics and Gynecology, 2006; 108:1381-7
Surrey ES The role of progestins in treating the pain of endometriosis. Minimally Invasive Gynecology, 2006; 13:528-34
Tom E. Pious pill posturers blind themselves to women’s real pain. The Australian, 6/8/09.

the “noxious” drugs – and “reasonable doubt”

Family Planning Queensland. Doctors and nurses risk prosecution, Media release 8/10/10.
Schwarten E, Agius K. Pressure for new laws as couple free over abortion. The Age, 15/10/10.
Elks S. Jury frees abortion couple in less than an hour. The Australian, 15/10/10.
Wainer J. Abortion case proves need for law change. The Age, 18/10/10.
State Reporting Bureau, Queensland Government. Transcript of Proceedings, District Court, Criminal Jurisdiction. Judge Everson; Indictment No 74 of 2010.
other titles by Caroline de Costa

fiction

• Clone Baby
• Rookwood Island
• Under the Skin

non-fiction

• All About Hysterectomy
• A Woman's Concise Guide to Common Medical Tests
• Cesarean Section - Understanding and Celebrating Your Baby's Birth
• Dick - a Guide to the Penis for Men and Women
• Do You Really Need Surgery?
• Hail Caesar
• Just The Facts - an A-Z for Abortion
• Mid Life New Life - Pregnancy and Parenting After 35
• RU-486
• Sensible Decisions - a Guide to Gynaecological Surgery for Women
• Tying the Tubes - a Guide to Sterilisation for Men and Women
• With Dr Michele Moore

textbooks

• Caesarean Section - a Manual for Doctors
• Clinical Cases in Obstetrics, Gynaecology and Women's Health
• With Dr Paul Howat