# ResearchOnline@JCU

This file is part of the following reference:

### Tanner, Jason Elliot (1995) Factors affecting community dynamics of scleractinian corals: competition, succession, keystone species and history. PhD thesis, James Cook University.

Access to this file is available from:

http://eprints.jcu.edu.au/24129/

The author has certified to JCU that they have made a reasonable effort to gain permission and acknowledge the owner of any third party copyright material included in this document. If you believe that this is not the case, please contact <u>ResearchOnline@jcu.edu.au</u> and quote <u>http://eprints.jcu.edu.au/24129/</u>



# Factors affecting community dynamics of scleractinian corals: Competition, succession, keystone species and history.

#### Thesis submitted by

#### Jason Elliot Tanner BSc (Hons) JCUNQ

in July 1995

for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the Department of Marine Biology James Cook University of North Queensland.

#### Statement of Access

I, the undersigned, the author of this thesis, understand that James Cook University of North Queensland will make it available for use within the University Library and, by microfilm or other means, allow access to users in other approved libraries. All users consulting this thesis will have to sign the following statement:

In consulting this thesis I agree not to copy or closely paraphrase it in whole or in part without the written consent of the author; and to make proper public written acknowledgment for any assistance which I have obtained from it.

Beyond this, I do not wish to place any restriction on access to this thesis.

27.2.96

#### Statement on Sources Declaration

I declare that this thesis is my own work and has not been submitted in any form for another degree or diploma at any university or other institution of tertiary education. Information derived from the published or unpublished work of others has been acknowledged in the text and a list of references is given.

27.2.96

#### Abstract

A major focus of ecology is to determine the causes of community structure. In this thesis, I examine the role of interactions between sessile organisms, primarily scleractinian corals and algae, in structuring the benthic assemblage of a coral reef. Specifically, I look at four main factors: competition, succession, keystone species, and the role of history or ecological memory. While competition among corals has received a certain amount of attention to date, its consequences for the individuals involved, and for the community, have not yet been ascertained. The other three processes that I investigate have all been virtually ignored on coral reefs, with very few exceptions. This is the first time that the effect of competition on the fitness of scleractinian corals has been examined, and is also the first detailed investigation of succession, keystone species and the effects of history in coral reef benthic assemblages.

There have been few reports on the intensity of competition experienced by coral colonies in their natural habitat. I examined the frequency with which competitive encounters occurred between corals, and between corals and algae, at three sites around Heron Island and Wistari reefs. Intensity of competition was found to be linearly related to coral cover, with a mean encounter rate of 1 per colony once cover reached approximately 50%.

Competition was found to have a significant negative impact on the fitness of competing colonies. Colonies engaged in competition with other scleractinian corals experienced a decreased growth rate compared to noncompeting controls, and a localised decrease in fecundity. Mortality rates of corals were not affected by competition however. Competition with macroalgae was also found to cause a decrease in growth rate, and caused a decline in whole colony fecundity by approximately 50%. Again, survivorship was not affected to any significant extent.

Patterns of succession and community dynamics of three reef crest coral assemblages were further investigated by the use of matrix models. The pattern of succession observed most closely fits the tolerance model. Interactions between species groups almost always occurred in a reciprocal

fashion, with no species clearly dominating the rest. It was found that the model community structure took greater than 20 years to equilibrate, much longer than the time between cyclones, supporting the non-equilibrium nature of coral reefs. Sensitivity analysis of the model communities failed to show up any keystone species, although this technique is likely to be a powerful means for identifying the presence of such species in complex communities.

To examine the role of history in determining the structure of these coral assemblages, the models were extended to incorporate a knowledge of the communities past. I found no evidence that history was having any effect at the community level, although the probabilities of transition between different species did show a marked effect of history. The lack of an effect of history at the community level is likely to be due to the highly disturbed nature of the reef crest at Heron Island, with other more sheltered areas possibly not showing the same results.

#### Acknowledgments

I would like to thank my supervisor, Terry Hughes, for his support and encouragement throughout this project. Thanks also go to Danny Coomans for statistical advice, and Lachlan Marsh for advice on mathematical modelling. Special thanks to Joe Connell for allowing the use of his longterm data sets from Heron Island, without which much of this work would not have been possible. Carden Wallace and Jacquie Wolstenholm generously provided taxonomic assistance. Many people provided comments on various chapters through the coral reef discussion group including, but not only, Ross Alford, Andrew Baird, John Collins, Liz Dinsdale, Vicki Hall, Andrew Lewis, Natalie Moltschaniwskyj, Garry Russ, and Bette Willis. Thanks also to the reviewers and editors of the various papers contained within this thesis, who helped greatly to improve its content. Finally, I would also like to thank the staff at Heron Island Research Station for their assistance in carrying out the field work, and the numerous dive buddies who assisted me throughout the project. Funding for this work came from ARC grant to T.P. Hughes, and grants from ACRS, GBRMPA, Heron Island Research Station and JCU.

vi

#### Table of Contents

Statement of Access	ii
Statement of Sources	iii
Abstract	iv
Acknowledgments	vi
Table of Contents	vii
List of Figures	xi
List of Tables	xii

Ch. 1.	General introduction.	1	
		Competition	1
		Succession	4
	Keystone Species	5	
	History	6	
		Chapter Outlines	7

Ch. 2.		Intensity and mechanisms of competition among		
		scleractinian corals.	0	
		Abstract	9	
		Introduction	9	
		Methods	11	
		Results	12	
		Discussion	14	
		Tables	17	
		Figures	22	
Ch.	3.	Interspecific competition reduces fitness in		
		scleractinian corals.	•	
		Abstract	24	
		Introduction	25	
		Methods		
		Mortality & Growth	28	
		Reproduction	30	
		Modelling	- 31	

vii

	Results	
	Outcomes of Competition	32
	Mortality	32
	Growth	33
	Reproduction	33
	Transition Matrices	34
	Model Analysis	34
	Discussion	35
	Acknowledgments	39
	Tables	40
·	Figures	45
Ch. 4.	Competition between scleractinian corals and	
	macroalgae: An experimental investigation of	
	coral growth, survival and reproduction.	
	Abstract	48
	Introduction	49
	Material & Methods	
	Study site	52
	Natural encounters	52
	Growth, survivorship and recruitment	53
	Reproduction	54
	Results	
	Natural encounters	54
	Growth, survivorship and recruitment of corals	55
	Reproduction	57
	Discussion	07
	Natural encounter rates	57
	Demographic effects of macroalgae	58
	Acknowledgments	60
	Tables	61
		64
	Figures	04
Ch. 5.	Species coexistence, keystone species and succession: A sensitivity analysis.	
	A sensitivity analysis.	71

ŀ

Introduction

viii

73

The Model	75
Methods	
Fieldwork	76
Testing model assumptions	78
Model analysis	79
Results	
Transition probabilities 1963-1989	81
Community dynamics: Simulations	83
Model Analysis	
Eigenvalue analysis	84
Eigenvector sensitivity analysis	86
Discussion	
Community-level transition matrices	87
Markovian properties of the model	88
Sensitivity analysis and keystone species	91
Acknowledgments	93
Tables	94
Figures	105

~			
ſ	h		
ັ			

The role of history in community dynamics: A modelling 6. approach.

> Introduction First order models Second order models Semi-Markov models Transition probabilities Simulations

Discussion 120 Effects of history 123 Future studies of historical effects 124 Acknowledgments 125 Tables 129 Figures

General discussion. Ch. 7.

Abstract

Methods Results

132

109 110

112

112

114 115

117 118

References.		139
Appendix 1:	Lunar periodicity and seasonality in the reproduction	
	of pocilloporid corals.	
	Abstract	162
	Introduction	163
	Methods	165
	Results	
	Planula presence in fragments	167
	Direct observations of planula release	168
	Discussion	
	Temporal variation in planulation	170
	Spatial variation in planulation: Comparisons	5
	with previous studies	171
	Causes of temporal and spatial variation in	
	reproduction	172
	Interspecific comparisons	174
	Conclusions	175
	Acknowledgments	175
	Tables	177
	Figures	179
	References	183

х

# List of Figures

2.1	Number of encounters per colony.	22
2.2	Number of encounters versus coral cover.	23
		23
3.1	Effect of competition on growth of Acropora hyacinthus and	
	Pocillopora damicornis.	45
3.2	Effect of competition oncohort dynamics	46
3.3	Effect of competition on stable size composition	47
4.1	Coral and algae cover.	64
4.2	Algal cover versus competition.	65
4.3	Effect of macroalgae on coral cover.	66
4.4	Effect of macroalgae on coral growth.	67
4.5	Effect of macroalgae on coral survival.	68
4.6	Effect of macroalgae on number of colonies.	69
4.7	Effect of macroalgae on coral fission rates.	70
5.1	Cluster analysis of equilibrium community composition.	105
5.2	Species recovery in a first order model.	106
5.3	Equilibrium community composition for first order model.	107
5.4	Change in diversity with time.	108
6.1	Effect of history on persistence.	129
6.2	Effect of history on community recovery.	130
6.3	Effect of history on equilibrium community composition.	131
A1	Planula presence in Pocilloporid corals.	179
A2	Lunar periodicity of planula release in Pocilloporid corals.	180
A3	Planula release in <i>Pocillopora damicornis</i> .	181
A4	Lunar periodicity in planula release of <i>Pocillopora damicornis</i> .	182

## List of Tables

2.1	Species groups for natural encounters.	17
2.2	Species-group competitive abilities.	18
3.1	Effect of competition on reproduction in Acropora hyacinthus.	40
3.2	Effect of time and competition on population transition	
	matrices.	41
3.3	Transition probability matrices for differing competitive	
	regimes.	42
3.4	Effect of competition on cohort growth rate.	44
4.1	Temporal variation in algal composition.	61
4.2	Effect of macroalgae on coral cover.	61
4.3	Effect of macroalgae on coral growth.	62
4.4	Effect of macroalgae on coral survival.	62
4.5	Effect of macroalgae on number of coral colonies.	63
4.6.	Effect of macroalgae on coral fission.	63
5.1	Species groups for first order models.	94
5.2	First order transition probability matrices.	95
5.3	Markovian property of community dynamics.	97
5.4	Recovery rates of coral communities.	97
5.5	Damping ratio sensitivity analysis.	98
5.6	Eigenvector sensitivity analysis.	100
5.7	Community complexity ratios.	104
6.1	Species groups used for history models.	125
6.2	First order transition probability matrix.	126
6.3	Semi-markov transition probabilities.	127
A1 -	Sampling periods for collection of Pocilloporid fragments.	177
A2	Uniformity of lunar distribution of planula presence.	178
Δ3	Uniformity of lunar distribution of planulation.	179