A critique of Post Modernism(s) in Nursing Literature from the Perspective of Habermas’ Critical Theory

Thesis submitted by
Irene Bugeja RN,
Grad. Dip. Quality Improvement in Health (Newcastle)
M. Ed (Deakin)

for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
in the School of Nursing Sciences
James Cook University
October 2007
Statement of the contribution of others

**Supervision:** Professor C. Holmes
Dr F. Thompson
School of Nursing Sciences, James Cook University, Townsville, Qld

**Editorial assistance:** Ms Nena Bierbaum

**Financial assistance:** to cover costs relating to air travel and accommodation to attend Research Schools and completion seminar approve by Associate Professor K. Usher.
Acknowledgements

I wish to thank my principal supervisor, Professor Colin Holmes, for his invaluable advice and guidance, during my candidature.

I wish to thank Professor A. Summers for approving Staff Assisted Study Leave, on half pay to allow release from teaching duties at the School of Nursing and Midwifery at the University of South Australia from July 2005 to June 2006.

I wish to thank my family for tolerating my pre-occupation with this thesis for the last six years.
Abstract

A critique of Post Modernism(s) in Nursing Literature from the Perspective of Habermas’ Critical Theory

The aim of the thesis was to examine the strengths and weaknesses of postmodernism(s) and the influence it had on the nursing discourse. This was to be achieved by using Fairclough’s critical discourse analysis to examine the nursing literature. A literature search was conducted on major data bases of nursing journals, and after inclusion and exclusion criteria were applied 167 articles became the data for the study. The order of the discourse revealed that the dominant features included the following findings: 75% of the articles make reference to the theme of power; Foucault was the dominant theorist; and 73% of the articles were published in five nursing journals.

Further analysis was conducted concerning the theme of power relating to articles that utilised Foucault and postmodern critical theory. Articles that drew primarily from Foucault articulate an approach to power that exhibits high levels of consistency. This was not the case when Foucault was used in conjunction with other theorists or in the case of the postmodern critical theory articles. These articles included a high level of variation, confusion and contradiction. The Foucauldian critique of critical theory has had a profound impact on the discourse and this was particularly evident concerning issues relating to emancipation, empowerment and reflection. From the Foucauldian perspective these concepts were considered to be overly ambitious and privileged particular groups. In the case of reflection they undermined the ‘self’ by engaging in self-surveillance. Stripped of their emancipatory agenda, the postmodern critical theory articles lose their raison d’être.

The findings have been interpreted using a framework based on Habermas’ critical theory concerning his theories of communicative action and instrumental rationality. Further impact on the discourse emanates from societal and contextual issues concerning publishing and government funding since the discourse almost entirely originates from the university sector. This reveals that the postmodern nursing discourse, as a whole, is marginalised through issues relating to journal ‘impact factor’ ratings and research quality frameworks.
Contents

CHAPTER 1 ........................................................................................................................................1

INTRODUCTION TO POSTMODERNISM AND CRITICAL THEORY .............................................1

What is postmodernism? ................................................................................................................1
Critical theory ..............................................................................................................................6
Critical theory and critical social theory .....................................................................................7
Critical theory and positivist Marxism .......................................................................................9
Postmodernism and critical theory ............................................................................................10

CHAPTER 2 ......................................................................................................................................13

CRITICAL THEORY OF THE FRANKFURT SCHOOL ...............................................................13

The Frankfurt School ..................................................................................................................14
Adorno’s contribution to the Frankfurt School ............................................................................21
Marcuse’s contribution to the Frankfurt School ..........................................................................23
The influence of Freud ..................................................................................................................24
Habermas and the Frankfurt School heritage ..............................................................................24
Habermas’ differences with the Frankfurt School ......................................................................26
Instrumental reasoning ................................................................................................................28
Theory of communicative action ...................................................................................................29
Habermas and Marx .....................................................................................................................29
Habermas and Freud ...................................................................................................................33

CHAPTER 3 ......................................................................................................................................39

METHODOLOGY ..........................................................................................................................39

What is discourse analysis? ..........................................................................................................40
The relationship between Fairclough and Habermas ................................................................52
Fairclough’s methodology .............................................................................................................60
Analysis of language and text ......................................................................................................61

Language ........................................................................................................................................61
Modality ........................................................................................................................................62
Transitivity .....................................................................................................................................64
Theme ..........................................................................................................................................66

Word meaning ..............................................................................................................................67

Wording ..........................................................................................................................................69

Over-wording and rewording .......................................................................................................70

Metaphor .......................................................................................................................................70
Analysis of articles that utilise Foucault

Knowledge
Disciplinary technologies
Hierarchical observation
Normalising judgement
The examination
Subjectification and self-formation
An alternative perspective of subjectification
Scientific classification
Dividing practices
Foucault combined with other theories
Foucault and language
Foucault and feminism
Foucault and race
Resistance
A minimalist approach to change
Examples of strategies of resistance
‘Specific intellectuals’
Articles that are critical of critical theory
Effectiveness of strategies
Articles that are predominantly Foucault but use a more eclectic approach

Strategies to overcome the issues of power imbalance in the eclectic articles

Neo-liberalism
Examples of eclectic resistance
CHAPTER 7.............................................................. ................................................... 211

ANALYSIS OF ARTICLES THAT USE POSTMODERN CRITICAL THEORY .......... 211
How power is presented ...................................................................................... 214
The ‘self’ .............................................................................................................. 216
How is linguistics used as a methodological tool to explain how power functions? .............................................................................................................. 225
The creation of a bridge between modernism and postmodernism ................. 231
Strategy .............................................................................................................. 232

CHAPTER 8........................................................................................................... 245

CONCLUSIONS ABOUT POSTMODERN DISCOURSES OF POWER IN NURSING LITERATURE
.............................................................................................................................. 245
Habermas’ framework ...................................................................................... 245
The postmodern discourse ............................................................................... 247

BIBLIOGRAPHY..................................................................................................... 264

APPENDIX 1 ........................................................................................................ 278
LIST OF JOURNALS ............................................................................................ 278

APPENDIX 2 ........................................................................................................ 280
PROFORMA FOR DATA COLLECTION ................................................................ 280

APPENDIX 3 ........................................................................................................ 281

ALPHABETICAL LISTING OF RESEARCH DATA ARTICLES FROM 02 SEARCH .... 281

APPENDIX 4 ........................................................................................................ 291

FINAL LIST OF ARTICLES ................................................................................... 291

   Alphabetical listing of research data articles merged from 02 and 05 searches 291

APPENDIX 5 ........................................................................................................ 307

YEAR OF PUBLICATION OF POSTMODERN ARTICLES ................................ 307

APPENDIX 6 ........................................................................................................ 308

YEAR OF PUBLICATION AND LOCATION OF AUTHOR .................................. 308

APPENDIX 7 ........................................................................................................ 309

YEAR OF PUBLICATION AND JOURNAL .......................................................... 309

APPENDIX 8 ........................................................................................................ 310

LIST OF ALL FOUCAULT ARTICLES ................................................................. 310

APPENDIX 9 ........................................................................................................ 315

LIST OF ECLECTIC FOUCAULT ARTICLES ..................................................... 315

APPENDIX 10 ..................................................................................................... 317
LIST OF CRITICAL THEORY ARTICLES ........................................................................317
List of tables

Table 4.1: Country / institution of origin and number of articles ..................................99
Table 4.2: Author position and articles published ..........................................................102
Table 6.1: Dominant forces identified in the Foucault articles....................................156
Table 7.1: Dominant forces identified in critical theory and Foucault articles ............212