

JCU ePrints

This file is part of the following reference:

Stewart, Lee (2007) *How does a clinical governance framework contribute to the changing role of nurse leaders in Fiji?* PhD thesis, James Cook University.

Access to this file is available from:

<http://eprints.jcu.edu.au/2100>



How does a clinical governance framework contribute to the changing role of nurse leaders in Fiji?

Thesis submitted by

Lee Stewart

RN, RM

Diploma in Teaching (Nursing) (CAE, Armidale)

Bachelor of Health Science (Nursing) (CQU, Rockhampton)

Postgraduate Certificate of Education (JCU, Townsville)

Master of Dispute Resolution (UTS, Sydney)

In August 2007

for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

In the School of Nursing, Midwifery and Nutrition

James Cook University

STATEMENT OF ACCESS

I, the undersigned, author of this work, understand that James Cook University will make this thesis available for use within the University Library and, via the Australian Digital Theses Network, for use elsewhere.

I understand that, as an unpublished work, a thesis has significant protection under the Copyright Act and, I wish this work to be embargoed until: June 2008.

Signature

Date

ELECTRONIC COPY

I, the undersigned, the author of this work, declare that the electronic copy of this thesis provided to the James Cook University Library is an accurate copy of the print thesis submitted, within the limits of technology available.

Signature

Date

STATEMENT OF SOURCES

DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis is my own work and has not been submitted in any form for another degree or diploma at any university or other institution of tertiary education. Information derived from the published or unpublished work of others has been acknowledged in the text and a list of references is given.

Signature

Date

STATEMENT ON THE CONTRIBUTION OF OTHERS

This thesis has been made possible through the support of my supervisors as follows:

Supervisors:

Primary Supervisor: Professor Kim Usher

School of Nursing, Midwifery and Nutrition, James Cook University

Secondary Supervisor: Professor Colin Holmes

School of Nursing, Midwifery and Nutrition, James Cook University

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There are a number of people – colleagues and friends – who have contributed in some way to the development and completion of this thesis through their gift of time, advice, encouragement and support.

I am indebted to Professor Kim Usher for her continuing patience, careful supervision and incredible encouragement throughout the years of my candidature. My appreciation is also extended to Professor Colin Holmes for his valuable contribution to the completion of this thesis. Thanks also to Dr. Kim Foster and Professor Debra Jackson for their generous feedback regarding the thesis.

I would like to express my deep and sincere appreciation to the nurse leaders of Fiji, especially the key participants who assisted with this study, unselfishly sharing their time, thoughts and ideas about their experience of being nurse leaders in Fiji. In addition, my gratitude is extended to all personnel in the Fiji Ministry of Health, who unfailingly supported me during my time in Fiji. This thesis is the story of Fiji from a health care perspective, and the key participants' experiences during the time of the study make up much of this thesis.

I would also like to thank my family, friends and work colleagues for their continued encouragement, support and tolerance during the years of my candidature. My particular thanks to Margaret Heslop for her unfailing support and belief in me and to my mother, Betty Stewart, for her patience with my long absences from much of family life. My gratitude also to my colleagues in the School of Nursing, Midwifery and Nutrition who tolerated the 'highs' and 'lows' involved in completing this study and offered their unfailing support. Particular thanks to my colleagues Kim Foster, Pauline Taylor, Tanya Park and Nichole Harvey for listening during the hard times. Thanks also to my colleagues and fellow students David Lindsay and Joanne Tollefson for our efforts to 'keep each other on track'.

Finally, I dedicate this thesis to my late father, Allan George Stewart, who taught me to appreciate the joys of reading and writing; and to my late grandmother, Ruby Carlyle Egan Stewart, who kept giving me 'Cherry Ames' books as Christmas presents when I was a child in the hope that I would become a nurse. Dad and Nana, this thesis is for you.

KEY TO TRANSCRIPTS

In the presentation of the research findings (Chapters 4, 5 and 6) and elsewhere where excerpts from the participants are included, the following abbreviations and font styles have been used:

Long quotes: All the names used within this thesis are pseudonyms (refer to Table 3.1 for further information). Pseudonym name and transcript page identify excerpts from participant interviews. All long quotes are in italics, for example:

Nursing internationally has evolved, so a nursing leader in Fiji should be able to look outside and see what a major role that nursing in Fiji could take on a par with nursing practice worldwide (Coral, p.117)

Short quotes: Where excerpts or short quotations are used within the main text, these are specified through the use of quotation marks, for example:

‘You know, we belong to the Public Service, the government. We belong to the Public Service Commission’ (Alice, p.138)

Bold font: The use of bold font occurs within direct participant quotations to indicate emphasis in terms of tone of voice that the participant made.

KEY TO STYLE

1. Where direct quotations are used from referenced sources, this is a deliberate reference to authoritative voices.
2. Direct quotes from the text ‘Jonathan Livingston Seagull’ (1973) by Richard Bach are in italics.

ABSTRACT

The incidence of adverse clinical events in health care organisations is an international problem. While intense interest has focused on this issue world-wide, with various responses including the introduction of clinical governance in developed countries, it has been less of a focus in developing countries, where the struggle to provide minimal resources for health care is often a priority. In Fiji, with the introduction of health reform funded by international aid agencies, improving patient care is now topical. The role of nurses, and particularly leaders in the nursing profession, is of paramount importance in the goal to provide better and safer health care to communities. Research shows that a key component of the successful implementation of clinical governance is effective clinical leadership. My main interest with this study was about the impact of nursing leadership. While extensive research has been conducted into the impact of nurses on safer care and better health services, this has not yet extended into developing countries such as those in the Western Pacific. There is a gap, therefore, in knowledge about how nursing leadership, and the nursing profession, effects health care policy and practice leading to better patient care in this region.

This critical ethnography set out to expand understanding about the role that nursing leadership has in improving patient care in Fiji. The study pursued the question: ‘How does a clinical governance framework contribute to the changing role of nurse leaders in Fiji?’ The study had three specific objectives: 1) To undertake a critical literature review of the application of clinical governance principles within both developing and developed countries, with particular emphasis on the impact for nursing leaders; 2) To undertake a study of the evolution of nursing leadership in Fiji; 3) To critically investigate the situation for nurse leaders in Fiji, as the health care system embraced a continuous improvement framework and increased leadership accountability for effective nursing practice.

With the recognition that organisational life is socially constructed and that the nurse leaders functioned within the bureaucratic structure of the Fiji Ministry of Health, social constructionism formed a basis for this research. Taking a critical theory approach with the research proved vital, given Fiji’s extensive history of colonization

and the intention that participants had an opportunity for positive social change if they so chose. From a methodological perspective, Carspecken's (1996) five recommended stages for critical qualitative research provided a framework within which the study was conducted, analysed and used to partially explain findings. Habermas's theory of communicative action (1984) comprised the analytical lens through which participant interview data, field notes and various official documents and media reports were explored.

This critical ethnography involved conducting interviews with six nurse leaders in Fiji over a two-year period and extensive time spent with staff of the Fiji Ministry of Health. The participants in this study were all experienced nurse leaders who held senior leadership positions, either in hospitals and community health services, or in the Head Office of the Ministry. During the interviews, participants shared extensive information about what it meant to be a nurse leader in Fiji, and what the impact of clinical governance was having on their professional lives. Attention to postcolonial issues was vital throughout the conduct, analysis and writing up of this research. The participants were all indigenous Fijians and spoke explicitly about the effect of colonization on the nursing profession in that country. I carried a heavy responsibility to appreciate the issues inherent in conducting the research as a non-indigenous researcher.

Analysis from a critical perspective revealed three major themes, which are presented as distinct but related chapters in the thesis. The themes are: Findings our voices: understanding that we are powerful; Legitimizing our role as the facilitators of best patient outcomes; and Recognition of our capacity to take a leading role in health care. Themes are presented from the perspective of the participants' narratives as well as field notes and documents, with my interpretations, based upon the Carspecken methodology and a Habermasian reading of the data. The findings are presented initially from the perspective of the analytic themes and the literature comprehensively reviewed. They are then discussed in terms of the literature identifying a link between effective nursing leadership, nursing conditions and optimum safe patient care.

The recommendations from the study are identified as they emanate from the findings and include those concerning nursing leadership, education, nursing practice and patient care, as well as recommendations for potential further research.

Table of contents

Abstract	viii
Table of contents	xi
Chapter 1: Jonathan’s Gift - The Introduction	1
Context	2
Justifying this research	4
The significance of the research	8
The aims of the research	8
Explaining the thesis	9
Chapter 2: Literature review	13
Table 2.1 Components	15
Method	16
Clinical governance	17
Key components	18
Leadership and clinical governance	18
Time and education	20
Nursing leadership and clinical governance	21
Effective nursing leadership	21
Leadership in the 20 th and 21 st centuries	21
Effective leadership	23
Nursing leaders and empowerment	24
Nursing leadership and patient safety	25
The Western Pacific	25
Empowered nurses	27
Nursing conditions	28
Clinical governance and Fiji	29
Nursing migration	30
Women and leadership in Fiji	31
Nursing leadership in Fiji	34
Postcolonialism and decolonizing research	35
Chapter summary	38
Chapter conclusion	39

Chapter 3: Interpretive framework, methodology and method	40
Introduction	40
Interpretive framework – Habermas’s theory of communicative action	41
The lifeworld	42
Communicative action	43
Habermasian theory – origins	45
Habermasian theory applied	46
The Frankfurt School	47
Critical theory	49
Critical ethnography	52
Linking methodology and method	53
Ethical considerations	54
The participants	55
Table 3.1 The participants	57
Carspecken’s five stages for critical qualitative research	58
Stage 1: Compiling the primary record	59
Stage 2: Preliminary reconstructive analysis	61
Meaning fields	61
The pragmatic horizon	62
Stage 3: Dialogical data generation	65
Stages 4 and 5: Discovering systems relations; Using systems relations to explain findings	67
Researcher orientation/philosophical position	68
The Researcher – position taking	70
Chapter conclusion	72
Chapter 4, 5, 6 Analysis and findings	75
Table 4.1 Themes	74
Introduction	75
Chapter 4: Finding our voices: understanding that we are powerful	79
Being colonized	79
Christianity in Fiji	83

Recent Western influence	85
Being heard	87
Education as opportunity	89
Doing our time	93
Empowerment and the Fiji Ministry of Health as a system	99
Chapter 5: Legitimizing our role as the facilitators of best patient outcomes	102
Having the heart for nursing – understanding the nurses	103
Providing for the nurses	108
Wearing the uniform	110
Being patient focused/safe patient care	112
Personality and best patient outcomes	115
Our role in best patient outcomes	121
Chapter 6: Recognition of our capacity to take a leading role in health care	124
Redefining our sense of belonging to the nursing ‘group’	124
‘Raised eyebrows’	126
Nursing leadership worldwide	129
Being an effective leader	130
A bridge to the future	134
Overcoming our barriers to having a leading role	136
The Public Service and retirement	137
The problem of implementation	138
Workforce planning – the migration of potential nurse leaders	140
Taking the lead with clinical governance	142
Summary – analysis and findings	144
Table 4.2 Findings	146
Chapter 7: A Discussion	147
Introduction	147
The methodology revisited	149

Finding our voices: understanding that we are powerful	149
<i>'Our past nurses looked at Florence Nightingale'</i>	149
<i>'They invited us to go and present nationally – it was a beginning'</i>	151
<i>'It is seen that they are learning together'</i>	152
<i>'It's our culture that we get to listen to the older people, the elders'</i>	154
<i>'To be able to apply the new concept locally – to have the cultural identity of the place where you're from'</i>	155
Legitimizing our role as the facilitators of best patient outcomes	157
<i>'In your days, be with them, talk with them'</i>	157
<i>'Nursing leaders...are looking at safe patient care. You're looking at nurses and doctors actually providing this care for patients at the frontline'</i>	160
<i>'The client, the recipient of our care that is, they'll get the best care'</i>	162
Recognition of our capacity to take a leading role in health care	164
<i>'I don't think nursing can ever be on its own, no, it can never be on its own'</i>	164
<i>'And one of my biggest challenges, Lee, is losing my skilled nurses'</i>	165
<i>'You want to foresee the future, to be able to anticipate – who is able to identify trends, to look at today to envisage what will happen in the future'</i>	167
<i>'Then you realize that maybe you are leading, maybe you are leading'</i>	169
On becoming reflective	170
Chapter summary	172
Chapter conclusion	173
Chapter 8: The Conclusion	174
Introduction	174
Recommendations	175
For health policy	175
For nursing leadership	177
For education	179
For front-line nurses/nursing practice	180
Strengths of the research	181

Limitations of the research	181
Future research	182
My role as researcher – final reflections	182
References	186
Appendices	
Appendix A: Approval for Research (Fiji MoH)	204
Appendix B: Letter of Introduction and Information Sheet	205
Appendix C: Consent form	208
Appendix D: Outcomes from thesis	209
List of tables	
Table 2.1 Literature review – components	15
Table 3.1 The participants	57
Table 4.1 Themes	74
Table 4.2 Findings	146