ResearchOnline@JCU

This is the **Accepted Version** of a paper published in the journal Tourist Studies:

Osbaldiston, Nick, and Petray, Theresa (2011) The role of horror and dread in the sacred experience. Tourist Studies, 11 (2). pp. 175-190..

http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/1468797611424955

JAMES COOK UNIVERSITY AUSTRALIA

The Role of Horror and Dread in the Sacred Experience.

Nick Osbaldiston

University of Melbourne

School of Resource Management and Geography

221 Bouverie Street, Melbourne, VIC, 3010

+61415212211

no@unimelb.edu.au

Theresa Petray

James Cook University

School of Arts and Social Sciences

Townsville, QLD, Australia

+6174781 5071

theresa.petray@jcu.edu.au

This is the Accepted Version of a paper published in *Tourist Studies*:

Osbaldiston, Nick, and Petray, Theresa (2011) *The role of horror and dread in the sacred experience.* Tourist Studies, 11 (2). pp. 175-190.

Biographies of Authors.

Nick Osbaldiston is a postdoctoral research fellow at the University of Melbourne. His work concentrates on the role of place in Amenity Migration/Lifestyle Migration and the cultural appreciation of perceived authenticity. He is also working more recently on the impacts of climate change adaptation on small coastal communities. Nick is the current co-convenor of the Cultural Sociology Thematic Group in Australian and co-editor of the Nexus newsletter for The Australian Sociological Association.

Theresa Petray is a lecturer in sociology at James Cook University in Townsville, Queensland. She has published widely on the subjects of activism and social movements within Australian Aboriginal groups. Her main interests however range from social movement theory to cultural anthropology. Recently, she has been interested in the role of place in tourist development in areas of Indigenous value.

Subfields.

Durkheimian Studies; Dark Tourism; Sacredness and Tourism.

Abstract.

In this article we seek to add to the debate/discussion into so called 'Dark Tourism' (Lennon and Foley 2000). While a plethora of studies analyse this phenomenon through binaries such as authentic/inauthentic (MacCannell 1992; Urry 1995), we seek here to approach sites of historical death with a less sceptical view. Rather, like others such as West (2010), we understand tourist engagement with 'dark' sites as a source of ritualistic engagement. Using the Australian and New Zealand iconic place of Gallipoli in Turkey as a case study, this article will argue that the experience of pilgrims to sites of death is best discussed through the concept of the sacred. However, it is true that these sites can also disturb visitors. Thus, we propose that the often under-utilised figure in sociology, Hertz, can be consulted in order to comprehend how people negotiate places of 'dark' properties, particularly those with national or international heritage value.

Keywords.

Place, Sacred, Impure/Pure, War Memorials, Pilgrimage, Durkheimian, Hertz, Hubert, Culture.

Word Count of Manuscript (including references, abstract and endnotes) - 7857

Introduction.

Dealing with death through rituals and taboos is not a recent phenomenon. As the early Durkheimians and other anthropologists such as Douglas, Levi-Strauss, Spencer, Evans-Pritchard, Turner and others showed us; societies across history have engaged with the dead and dying in ways that are rich with symbolism and collective value. Often, and as a result of a religious interdiction, places and even people are avoided until such time that their 'polluted' states are reconciled through ritual practices and traditions (Hertz 2009[1907]). The danger that surrounds death is contagious to those alive and is only removed through acts which assist the spirit of the deceased to leave this world and enter the next. The dead do not rest peacefully until such practices are undertaken.

In secular times however, the avoidance of sites of death and destruction is not as pronounced. While in some instances certain 'profane' places such as murderer's homes and even the Berlin Wall attract ritualistic destruction (Smith 1999), many others appear less offensive. Termed 'Dark Tourism' (Lennon and Foley 2000), 'Thanotourism' (Seaton 1996) and/or 'Black Spots Tourism' (Rojek 1993), the phenomenon of visiting sites of previous horrors and death has become increasingly attractive to tourists, and also to tourism studies. Everything from journeying to places of past wars through to glancing at car accidents and following murder tours have been captured under the theme of 'dark tourism'. The result is a proliferation of academic work which cuts up categories for the purposes of analysis and which explores in detail the motivation of those heading to 'dark' spots (Lennon and Foley 2000; Seaton 1996; Rojek 1993; Cohen 2009; Slade 1993; Biran, Poria and Oren 2011; Bowman and Pezzullo 2009). Amongst these is a rigorous debate on the appropriateness or morality of tourism attracted by death and destruction (MacCannell 1992; Urry 1995). In particular, the discussion on the commodification or mechanisation (MacCannell 1976) of past atrocities and horrors for the purposes of the tourist experience is criticised for significant reasons (Bowman and Pezzullo 2009). In some

instances, tourists are treated as fleeting and colonizing, seeking only small glimpses of the horrific as an aside from the everyday. Yet as Cohen (2009: 195) suggests in his discussion into 'educational dark tourism', tourists who have a deeper connection to the site visited may well experience something more meaningful, a type of self-actualisation.

Cohen's (2009) comments are reminiscent of recent discussions into the role of secular pilgrimage to sites of past battles such as Gallipoli (Slade 2003; West 2008, 2010; McKenna and Ward, 2007). In this particular World War One heritage spot, tourism is not just a liminal or ludic experience of postmodernity (West, 2010: 211) but rather embedded in a concern for 'nationhood' and patriotism that impacts greatly upon the self (Slade 2003: 792; see also Breathnach 2006). The motivation to tour 'dark' sites in this instance is argued as an attempt on the part of the individual to engage with places where collective identities were forged (West 2010). In Durkheimian terms, a rejuvenation of secular pilgrimage to Gallipoli for instance is a form of re-enchantment, reuniting the individual to 'authentic' national roots.

In this paper, we seek not to engage with the ongoing debate on why people seek out 'dark tourist' sites in their journeys. Nor is our concern that of arguing what to label this relatively new phenomenon in tourism studies (see Bowman and Pezzullo 2009). Rather, what we aim to explore in this paper is a better grasp on the experiences of people at dark sites such as Gallipoli. Using this specific place as a case study (see below), we argue that in order to comprehend dark tourism within heritage sites, we must appreciate that these sites have a sacred aura. Indeed, as Bowman and Pezzullo (2009) and contemporary cultural sociologist Smith (1999) acknowledge, there is a unique mystical force which alters tourist behaviour and emotional engagement in such places. For Smith (1999), this performative element of the experience cannot be left at small microanalyses of behaviour but also need to be connected to a wider 'theme of ascent', to use Northrop Frye's (1976) literary framework. Sacredness,

as the Durkheimians display, has an intimate relationship to the individual through collective values and narratives, which brings them out of the mundane world and into a distinct experience.

The sacred, however, is well embedded in tourism studies (Franklin 2003) and dates back to MacCannell's (1976) discussion of the tourist expedition as a 'quest' for the authentic. Since then, a number of studies have elaborated on this theme (Cohen 1979; Slade 2003; see also Shields 1992). However, few have concentrated on the role of narrative within culture that lifts sites in value and subsequently imposes a ritualised experience to those engaging with it. Smith (1999) has considered this in some detail in his *Elementary Forms of Place* model. Here, as mentioned, sacrality is underpinned by collective 'themes of ascent' (Frye 1976). For instance, myths and narratives which signify heroism, 'self sacrifice and risks taken on behalf of the collectivity' (Smith, 1999: 17) promote specific areas as hallowed ground. As mentioned earlier, it is auras such as these which produce or provoke a response within the individual visiting the site. Not through surveillance or some other panoptic type form of self-regulation, but through the mythologies that promote the area in the first instance. Smith (1999: 19) writes,

> Consider, for example, the occidental tourist visiting a cathedral or the pilgrim visiting the assassination spots of John F. Kennedy or Martin Luther King. Nearing the sacred place a penumbra of solemnity imposes itself on human behaviour, inviting, for example, the hushed tones, the straightened back, silent footsteps, slow breathing which in turn invoke physiological changes and direct memory towards the sacred…Such micro rituals of the body (Collins, 1975; Bell, 1992) often progressively increase in their discipline and intensity as the centre of sacrality is approached.

Thus, approaching a sacred site requires a form of comprehension on behalf of the individual; if they know the history or the identity of the place intimately or even vaguely, their behaviour alters and their

mood changes. As West (2010) and Slade (2003; see also Cohen 2009) discuss, it is perhaps these 'narratives' or 'themes of ascent' (Frye 1976) which draw tourists to locations considered sacred. Their experience within the boundaries of the sacred place, such as for instance Gallipoli, is often intense and leads to a further concretisation of their association with national and collective identities.

However, there is a 'darker' side to this experience which is often not appreciated in discussions of 'sacred' places (MacCannell 1992; Smith 1999; West 2010). While purity, collective effervescence and unity are all values found in abundance in places like Gallipoli, there are also the harsh, dreadful and disturbing realities of war that remain embedded both physically and aesthetically in those fields where so many died horrifically. It is our argument that two types of sacredness are present in these areas. One is the pure which has been explored extensively, the other an underappreciated form, the impure. Using predominantly early Durkheimian Robert Hertz (2009[1907, 1909) alongside others such as Hubert (2009[1919]), we argue that the horrors of death and suffering are complementary to a pure sacred experience of places considered 'dark' in the literature (see Seaton 1996; Lennon and Foley 2000; Slade 2003). Rituals and small events, both collective and individual, help the experience to be reconciled into a holistic sacred moment. Of particular importance is the role of the hero and the myths which increase the value of the areas in the collective memories of today's pilgrims.

A Review: Hertz, the Impure and Dark Tourism.

Before considering this main point further, however, we first briefly discuss our reading of the pure/impure sacred distinction. As mentioned, we follow the underappreciated figure in the Durkheimian school, Robert Hertz, and his discussion of the 'left' sacred[i], alongside others such as Henri

Hubert and contemporary Phil Smith. Hertz himself published two important pieces on the impure sacred which were later translated by the Needhams and had significant influence on the world of social anthropology (Parkin, 1996) and our argument here; *A Contribution to a Study of the Collective Representation of Death* (1907) and *The Preeminence of the Right Hand: A Study of Religious Polarity* (1909). However, he also produced various other pieces including a study into the myth of *Saint Besse* (2009[1913]), a canon saint worshipped in the area of Mount Fautenio, in which Hertz gathered his own observational data through field work, a relatively unheard of feat within the *Année* group (Riley, Daynes & Isnart, 2009). After returning from his Saint Besse excursion, Hertz was about to set to task writing his doctoral thesis when war broke out. He was killed on the 13th of April, 1915 in combat duty at Wöevre, perhaps befitting the tragic theme of Durkheim's group[ii]. His uncompleted thesis was later published 1922 albeit in a limited form which Mauss himself attempted to fill through notes that Hertz had left behind (which Mauss later partially lost (Riley, 1999)).

Despite the tragedy which fell upon Hertz, his small contribution to Durkheimian scholarship has obvious significance for those considering the topic of the sacred (Riley, 2005). As one of the first amongst the group to examine the impure as a type of sacred, he provides theoretical explorations coupled with empirical examples of how this darker force influences culture and ritual. *The Collective Representation of Death* (2009[1907]), for instance, illustrates the ability of the impure pole of the sacred to inspire horror and dread. By using secondary data from anthropological work with the Dayaks of Borneo, amongst others, Hertz is able to show how death rituals performed are essentially the work of symbolically transferring the body from a state of spiritual pollution and fear to one of purity and sacrality. While death has the potential to pollute the moral order of an entire village, this risk is alleviated once proper rituals transform the dead body to one of purity. Later, we show how such ritual

activity can also be illustrated in those performed symbolically at dark tourist spaces where death is an underpinning theme.

While Hertz's work on *Death* provides important insights to consider, it is in his later work on the *Right Hand* (2009[1909]) where we find clear theoretical grounding for the binary distinction between the two poles of sacredness. Building on anthropologist Robertson-Smith's work, he writes,

> Supernatural powers are not all of the same order: some are exercised in harmony with the order of things and have a regular and august character that inspires veneration and confidence; others, contrarily, violate and trouble universal order and the respect they impose is constructed above all from aversion and fear…In this sense Robertson Smith was correct to say that the notion of taboo envelops at once the sacred and the impure, the divine and the demonic. But the perspective of the religious world changes if one sees it no longer from the point of view of the profane but from that of the sacred (Hertz, 2009[1909]: 91).

From this perspective, the sacred acquires a dualistic nature. In his analysis of the left and right hand, Hertz (2009[1909]) shows how this then impacts on daily life and ritual activity as the left is symbolic of the impure and the right, pure. Thus in certain circumstances, the left hand attends to those activities considered filthy or degrading, whereas the right hand must be protected as the pure object used only in rituals and religious rites which promote harmony and awe. Thus, the two hands have their purpose and while the distinction and protection from each is vehemently sought after, Hertz (2009[1909]) makes it clear that they complement rather than antagonise each other. This is an important point in our analysis which will be discussed later.

The impure, however, should not be confused with the profane. The latter is a form which, as Smith (1999) considers, imposes ritualistic efforts to avoid or even destroy. Our reading of the profane and its separation from the impure revolves around this principle, whereas the impure sacred is infused with

the pure. The profane is often tied to political discourse and cultural stigmatisation and is often found in the 'backstage' of tourism (MacCannell 1976). One such example in contemporary Australian tourism is the case of Palm Island, off the North Queensland coastline in Australia where policy actively attempts to guide visitors away from problem areas. With a dark history, Palm Island began its journey into the profane in 1918 when under the island became a reserve for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples[iii], purportedly to 'protect' them from the negative influences of settler society (Cuneen and Libesman, 1995; Chesterman & Galligan, 1997; McGregor, 1997). Due to its isolation from the mainland however, the Queensland Protector of Aborigines identified Palm Island as a penitentiary for 'individuals we desire to punish' (in Watson, 1995: 151). These individuals included adults who were considered 'disruptive' on other reserves, recently released prisoners, children who were born with 'mixed blood', and women who fell pregnant to non-Indigenous men (Watson, 1995; Hooper, 2008). Palm Island quickly became notorious for its harsh punishments, and Watson (1995: 155) calls the island's white administration a 'reign of terror'.

In its more contemporary history, Palm Island has shifted to a landscape 'deeply symbolic' of profane qualities accentuated by political authority and governance strategies. For instance in 1957, resistance towards the heavy handed administration of the Island community culminated in a strike involving nearly all of the 1400 Indigenous residents on Palm Island (Thaiday, 1981; Watson, 1995). By 1986 Australia had entered the 'self-determination era' of Indigenous policy, and the Queensland government transferred the administration of the Island to a community council. Palm Island captured international attention in 1999, when it was listed in the *Guinness Book of World Records* (Young, 1999) as the most violent place on earth, outside a combat zone. While this claim was contested by both the Queensland government and the Palm Island Council (Meade, 1998) the popular opinion of Palm Island was one of dread and disgust. Five years later, the community was again the focus of international scrutiny after a

death in police custody sparked riots resulting in the torching of the police station and courthouse (Hooper, 2008; Waters, 2008). Palm Island is also known for unemployment levels higher than 90%, an average of 17 people per house, and a life expectancy of 50 years (Hooper, 2008). Such statistics and claims created an outlook of disdain towards the place and created a symbolic dissonance with mainland European Australia. In particular, political authority sought to intervene as exemplified in this comment by member of parliament representing Palm Island (and other nearby regions), Peter Lindsay: 'If the Indigenous leaders are not prepared to change the hopeless conditions that the community currently live in, then perhaps it's time to move them all to the mainland and integrate into mainstream Australia' (ABC News, 2006). From this standpoint, it appears that Lindsay's comments reflect a symbolic desire to destroy that which is profane within the Palm Island community. However, more stark evidence of the cultural symbolism of the place as profane is found in Tourism Queensland's attempts to steer visitors away. While its pristine beaches and coastal aesthetic which reflects Australia's iconographic landscapes are actively promoted by Tourism Queensland (2009), the Indigenous community located in the place is avoided. While there is some suggestion that 'indigenous culture...is of potential interest to tourists' (Tourism Queensland, 2009: 29), the major focus remains on the physical landscape. It could be suggested that this latter point may well push the area into a liminal tourist adventure in the future. However, our point here is to clarify and demonstrate what we consider alongside Smith (1999) as the profane place. One that is actively avoided, culturally profane and in some cases destroyed symbolically through discourse.

Thus, the impure sacred and the profane sit, in our reading, in two completely distinct positions on the theoretical landscape. It is from this conceptualisation embedded in Hertz's (2009[1907; 1909]) understanding of the 'left' sacred that we seek to investigate the experience of 'dark tourism' spots that hold deep cultural heritage values. It is not our contention here that the sacred experience always

reflects both poles. Nor is it our argument that those tourists who visit sites such as Gallipoli seek to be horrified, such as perhaps is the case with murder tourist trails which have gained popularity over the last decade (see Gibson, 2006). Rather we argue that in certain spaces, sacrality is visually, aesthetically and symbolically represented through dread and awe. How this is dealt with is similar to Hertz's explorations above as will be shown in our empirical example.

The Case of Gallipoli: A National Icon and a Pure/Impure Sacred Place

Located deep in Australia and New Zealand's national identity, the place of Gallipoli has in recent times garnered much interest not just from tourism studies but also from historians and other social scientists (Scates, 2006, 2007; West, 2008, 2010; McKenna & Ward, 2007). This is no doubt due to the increasing rates of secular pilgrimage that the site currently attracts from both nations. Often these visits coincide with the April 25th ANZAC day memorial rituals carried out at the site itself. These secular rituals are becoming increasingly popular especially with younger generations (Scates, 2006; West, 2008). Reasons for this hinge for historians such as Scates (2006) on the quest for meaning that lay unsatisfied within the Australian collective (see also Slade 2003). For others, an increased desire amongst the collective to visit the World War One conflict zone can be attributed to political rhetoric and commercial interests (McKenna & Ward, 2007). Such thoughts open up the debate on the morality of peddling 'death tours' for monetary gain (see above). Our article here seeks not to enter this ongoing debate, both in 'dark tourism' studies and on Gallipoli itself. However, what we explore below might enter into the ongoing discussion of what is encountered in 'dark tourism' and if it is appropriate to label it thus.

As suggested earlier, our purpose for using the case of Gallipoli is to comprehend the relationship of the impure with the pure in sacred places. This is perhaps more pronounced in places where the symbols of

death and horror are found in abundance. Gallipoli itself has a significant mythology associated with themes of dread. Through various mediums including the successful film from Peter Weir aptly titled *Gallipoli*, the hills and slopes on the coastline of Turkey, where around 8,700 Australians and 2,721 New Zealanders lost their lives, are now synonymous with images of horrific and senseless violence. However, associated also with this is a patriotic admiration for the bravery and courage of those who paid the dearest cost for a battle that would eventually be lost. Despite the conflict claiming fewer numbers of Australian and New Zealand Army Corps (ANZAC) troops than battles at Passchendaele, the Somme or Fromelles, Gallipoli contributes considerably to the national imagination. In a recent address at the Australian War Memorial, author Les Carlyon (2004: para.9) considers the place as 'part of the folklore, one of the few words spoken in Australia with something approaching reverence'. The conflict has been narrated by themes of 'courage, ingenuity and mateship' (West,2008: 258) which then feed national identity.

The pilgrimage to the place of Gallipoli often occurs around the time of ANZAC Day. The sacrality of this date is worth considering briefly as it ties back, in our view, to the sacrality of the experience. For the secular rituals performed across Australia and New Zealand on this day are designed for individuals to reflect on these conflicts (amongst others) of which Gallipoli is a predominant feature. The date itself now constitutes, as Hubert (1999[1905]: 76) discusses, a sacred time invested with qualities that make it 'as sacred as things themselves'. Journeying to places such as Gallipoli, we surmise, is considered the highest form of secular worship found in Australian and New Zealand culture. The ability to perform and participate in rituals on ANZAC day within these sacred sites is significant for those who journey to these locations. To use Smith's (1999) thoughts on the sacred place, ANZAC Day further concretises the 'themes of ascent' (Frye, 1976) which characterise the area. Yet as Inglis (2005) considers, this is

indicative of other secular sacred sites located in home countries such as war memorials, plaques and statues.

To further our point here, we now turn to some empirical illustrations that enable further insight into the experience individuals have here. Our motivation for this is to expose the negotiation of the sacred across these sites where the impure also is consumed. However, before discussing the darker side of the sacred in Gallipoli, we first wish to show the role of the pure which we contend is accentuated by the impure, as will be shown later. It is clear however, that the fervour shown at ANZAC day is twofold. Firstly, the sense of collective identity, nationalism and patriotism shines through in the experiences of those participating in rituals at Gallipoli. Later, we will also show that a certain awe and reverence is also apparent which can be associated with a heroicisation (Hubert, 2009[1919]) of those who participated in the conflict. Yet it is evident that participation in rituals at Gallipoli is well embedded in a type of collective effervescence (Durkheim, 1995[1912]), as shown in these quotes from participants:

> Contrary to what everyone tells you – including the media – there were no Aussie pissheads to be found…At the end of the service came the Turkish national anthem…followed by the Australian anthem. The crowd yelled it out and it could be heard all over Anzac Cove. It was a fantastic feeling (Scates, 2006: 191).

> Very touching and everyone was balling there (sic) eyes out….Next came the Turkish national anthem, [and] the Aussie national anthem [again]…The whole crowd went mental and sung (sic) as loud as it could…I could not [begin] to describe the feeling of togetherness with the people there, *real Aussie spirit* (Scates, 2006: 192, *italics added*).

> There was just something…I don't know if you can put a word to it, just that sort of atmospheric, that we were all experiencing the *same sort of emotions* and stuff like that…I was speaking to people, especially at Lone Pine and stuff when the *anthem and the last post and that was played,* and just

> talking to people in general, some just really struggled, you know, bottom lip started to quiver *and I think everyone felt the same sort of way* (Joseph – participant in West's (1998) study, *italics added*).

Two important points are to be considered from these illustrations. Firstly, the responses of the collective to deep symbolism such as the national anthem and the 'last post' are highly indicative of that pure collective effervescence which Durkheim (1995[1912]) discussed in detail. It is within these rituals that those present are bound together, reinforcing a particular national identity. As one individual in Scates' (2006) study suggested, it is here where people at one, imbuing an aesthetic of 'real Aussie spirit'.

These emotional responses of collectiveness and identity are located throughout supposed 'dark tourist' spaces across the west. For instance, at the crash site of Flight 93 in Pennsylvania, we can see the role that flags, memorials and other patriotic symbols play in promoting 'practicality, duty, religion and faith, selflessness…that is present throughout a long tradition of narratives of American identity' (Riley, 2008: 15). Furthermore, despite the apparent tragedy of the events of September 11, there is an aura, according to Riley (2008: 16), of 'victory' where 'the American people demonstrate their elect status' found within the monuments and memorial objects at the Flight 93 location. Similar thoughts could be applied to the scene at Gallipoli where Australians reaffirm a national identity of down to earth mateship, bravery and courage against all odds. This emerges despite the apparent heavy losses and the ultimate fact that the mission was a failure resulting in a mass retreat of allied forces.

Yet this collective effervescence is only made possible through various positive myths of the ANZAC troops and an elevation of their status from ordinary soldiers to that of the 'superhuman' (Hubert, 2009[1919]: 42). Their short lives are discussed at length in books and through tours held at Gallipoli. Furthermore and of most importance, the rituals of ANZAC day are such that these fallen soldiers are actively remembered, making them eternal, 'back to earth and close to his [sic] people' (Hubert,

2009[1919]: 53). For Hubert (1999[1905]) it is these qualities of remembrance which distinguish moments of sacrality from the mundane. The ceremonies and events of a sacred time transcend temporality and bring back to life myths which are far in the distant past.

The role of the hero in producing the collective effervescence discussed above is evident in this short illustrative quotation from a participant in Scates' (2006: 176) study;

> The sun was starting to set, and the beach was bathed in a golden glow...the breeze picked up enough to take the flag out to full flight. It was then standing on North Beach, where all those years ago so many men had lost their lives under the flag that I was flying...that I finally felt like an Australian.

In another quotation from West's research, further examples are given which connects the heroic status of the ANZACs to a national pride and identity;

> From yesterday and from my time in Turkey it's [patriotism] probably got stronger. To hear our guide yesterday, especially getting so passionate and emotional about what the Australians went through there and how they dealt with it and how they just got on with the job, it was really, it just put a lot of pride in me, my girlfriend and I both came home and said 'God it is great to be Australian' (Lionel – Participant in West's (1998) study).

From these two examples, a certain connection between the hero and the tourist is revealed. Understanding, comprehending and acknowledging the sacrifice of the ANZAC troops as well as being amongst symbols such as monuments and cemeteries helps these two individuals experience an authentic relationship to the dead and to their national identity. In other words, connecting to the hero provokes a sense of collective belonging for the participant. From this perspective, the 'themes of ascent' (Frye, 1975) which underpin Gallipoli and other similar sacred sites are embedded heavily in the heroicisation of everyday people.

Understanding the hero from Hubert's (2009[1919]) perspective, however, reveals something more of the sacred not discussed elsewhere. In his preface to Czarnowski's 1919 book the *Cult of Heroes,* Hubert (2009[1919]) discusses the darker nature to the hero which promotes them to a higher mythical status. He writes;

> A hero is complete only if he [sic] meets a tragic end and, more still, it seems, if the society that sees itself in him has suffered over his [sic] disaster. It is astonishing that people take pleasure in commemorating their defeats. The retrospective suffering that they experience here is a source of intimate satisfactions. The aesthetic taste for suffering is not a sentimental depravity of an aged humanity, nor is it a sophistication of its maturity. Its origins are very deep and very early…The game of suffering, the recalling or the anticipation of grief, which does not harm because it is anticipated or past, is a contrast to joy or laughter, but it is also their equivalent and perhaps their stimulant (Hubert, 2009[1919]: 75).

From here we can see the 'important place for the tragic…and even evil' amongst the construction of Durkheimian take on the hero (Riley, Daynes & Isnart, 2009: 5). The impure, or the horrific and tragic, and the pure, the awe inspiring, appear to collate in order to produce the complete hero worthy of secular ritual worship. Throughout the west and beyond, a number of examples demonstrate the power of this process in culturally constructing the hero. Specifically, those who sacrifice their lives for some perceived greater good, such as Jeanne d'Arc or the passengers of the Flight 93 terrorist attack, appear to have cemented their position as extraordinary figures across culture. Smith (1999: 17) recognises this in his work when he pronounces that the sacred is often created through 'narratives of violence, heroic actions of self sacrifice, and risks taken on behalf of the collectivity'. These notions easily account for places such as Gallipoli and the Flight 93 memorial, but require further unpacking through Hertz's (2009[1909;1907]) work.

Other themes aside from those of patriotism and awe discussed above become apparent when reviewing the Gallipoli experience. These include those explored thoroughly by Hertz (2009[1907]) on death, horror and dread. It is often the case, however, that those objects and emotions that are connected to the impure are actively promoted rather than being avoided or destroyed as the profane would direct. For instance, the Australian Government official walking tour of the Gallipoli site quotes frequently from eyewitness accounts of the destruction and deplorable conditions that ANZAC troops faced. In one example, the tour quotes directly from poet Leon Gellert who highlights the dreadful experience of war;

> Anzac Cove, There's a lonely stretch of hillocks: There's a beach asleep and drear: There's a battered broken fort beside the sea. There are sunken trampled graves: And a little rotting pier: And winding paths that wind unceasingly. There's a torn and silent valley; There's a tiny rivulet With some blood upon the stones beside its mouth. There are lines of buried bones: There's an unpaid waiting debt: There's a sound of gentle sobbing in the south (cited in Department of Veteran Affairs, 2009: para.5).

This graphic description of the 'fields of war' paints a very different picture to that of the pure sacred experience discussed by participants in the rituals of ANZAC Day. However, this highlights the dual nature of the sacred experience at Gallipoli.

In many instances, participants remark at length on the tragic loss of life. In particular, the violent cutting short of lives disturbs some as illustrated in the two following examples;

> On Gallipoli…there are the graves of so many nations, I really felt the personal tragedy of way and thinking about the experience of…these men transcended nationalities. I thought about human loss, human bravery, etc. not purely Australian. My visits made me feel sorrow for these people, all they never got to experience, the loss their families would have felt (Scates, 2006: 200).

> Yeah I thought the graves…I mean he [the guide] could sit there and tell you about something but as soon as you see the graves and the names and the mother's little writings down the bottom and *the age*, that's where *reality sort of hits you* (Gillian – Participant from West's (1998) study, *italics added*)

Within Hertz's (2009[1907]: 144) analysis of death rituals amongst various Australian Aboriginal people, he proposes that 'all those who die violent or accidental deaths…inspire the most intense horror'. It appears from the examples above that youths who die at war are likely to disturb more for the cutting short of their potentially fulfilling lives. In the case of Gallipoli and other war memorials, the experience of mass graves provokes intense contemplation over what was lost.

Yet another more significant theme is located within the reflections of those wandering through the area. As Hertz (2009[1909]) proposes, the impure is designated by a violation and troubling of order which we extend in this article to include the personal rather than simply the 'universal'. For instance, the following illustrative examples accentuate the emotional experience of participants while walking the fields of battle;

> The dawn service was sombre, dignified, and ghostly with the dawn lights throwing a soft sheen over the gently breaking sea. A morning you would imagine the Anzacs experienced only with starbursts of shell and rattle roar of machine gun. *I [thought] of a quiet expectant death on a lapping shore* (Scates, 2006: 188, *italics added*).

> Anzac cove is...strange. It is so beautiful, the water is clear, and still, and it is just so peaceful. It's hard to believe that anything so horrible could've happened here...We visited the tiny cemeteries, tens of them, as soon as you think that's all there could possibly be, there are more, dotted all over...the ravines...*it was pure massacre* (Scates, 2006: 175, *italics added*).

> Not all the dead rest peacefully. At the Nek and Chunuk Bair, 'Alice' complained of something 'eerie', the 'smell, the adrenalin, sweat, blood, tears' seemed to seep through the landscape, '*sent goose*

> *bumps up my spine*'...Others relived the trauma of those long dead soldiers. 'I believe I was there in another life', one man told me, '*I felt naked and vulnerable [on the battlefields]. I found myself clinging, trembling. It was horrible*...' (Scates 2006: 118, *italics added*).

In all three instances, personal thoughts reflect on that which inspires dread. In the final conglomeration of discussions by Scates' (2006) participants, specific 'micro-rituals of the body' (Smith, 1999: 19) reflect not awe and admiration, but a dark and disturbing experience. We might surmise that this could be located as a profane moment. But, we propose that the sacred, as Hertz (2009[1907; 1909]) and others (Caillois, 1959[1946]) suggests, is itself dualistic. In comprehending sacred experiences such as Gallipoli, we offer the alternative theoretical consideration.

Firstly, we contend that the horror and dread experienced in these types of locations provides a further accentuation of the heroic status of the fallen soldiers, following Hertz's (2009[1909]) interpretation of the left and right hand and that of the hero by Hubert (2009[1919]). In other words those 'themes of ascent' (Frye, 1976) which promote the place as sacred are further concretised by the consumption of narratives at the place itself (Smith, 1999). Yet as Hubert (2009[1919]) argues, the hero is given further sacred status through tragedy. From this perspective we contend that the Gallipoli experience provokes troubling emotions and reflections on the horrors of war. These, however, concretise other attributes and myths such as courage, bravery and sacrifice for higher causes. Thus, as the left hand serves a symbolic purpose to accentuate the right hand as pure (Hertz, 2009[1909]), the horrors of war serve to invite further awe and inspiration of fallen ANZACs. As Caillois (1959[1946]: 45) considers, the impure in this circumstance is 'an instrument of purification' or in more general terms, pure sacralisation.

The theoretical consideration of the Gallipoli experience is furthered when considering Hertz's (2009[1907]) earlier work on *Death*. Here he shows that through ritual, the fear surrounding a dead body is alleviated, thus transforming the object into one of purity again. Similarly, places which provoke

similar experiences are also purified through ritual activity and symbolism. Caillois (1959[1946]: 49) agrees with this point when he examines similar processes which turn the 'dead person, bearer of evil and fearful power' into a 'tutelary spirit, beseeched with awe and reverence'. It is not our argument here that 'dark' sites need purifying. Rather, we suggest that there are specific rituals and symbols which transfer the aesthetics of dread and horror into more pure sacral emotions such as awe, reverence and the collective effervescence shown earlier.

At Gallipoli, our contention is that rituals symbolically reconcile the experience of horror and dread. From opening addresses to the reading of 'The Ode'[iv] and the playing of the last post, and finally the raising of the Australian flag and playing of the national anthem, these activities serve a strong cultural purpose of constructing a collective effervescence and pure sacred moments. Though the remembrance of the dread felt at various stages in the Gallipoli experience would no doubt remain, the role of the ritual is more than simply acknowledgement. It is a reconciliation of violent death and a symbolic gesture to the participant of their transition to another world (Hertz, 2009[1907]). Further evidence of this is found in the Turkish memorial where the famous words of President Atatürk in a 1934 address to visiting Australians and New Zealanders is engraved;

> Those heroes that shed their blood, and lost their lives ...You are now lying in the soil of a friendly country. Therefore, rest in peace. There is no difference between the Johnnies and the Mehmets to us where they lie side by side, Here in this country of ours. You, the mothers, who sent their sons from far away countries ... Wipe away your tears. Your sons *are now lying in our bosom and are in peace*. After having lost their lives on this land, they have become our sons as well (cited in Department of Veteran Affairs, 2009: para.1, *italics added*)

This consideration is not limited to Gallipoli, however. Further investigation into all war memorials (Inglis, 2005) would reveal similar cultural symbolism. Contemporary sites of horrific death underpinned

by nationalistic pride and patriotism reflects these notions (see Riley, 2008). The Flight 93 crash site for instance is marked by symbolic gestures such as the pinning of American flags and messages for those who perished horrifically there. Our purpose in bringing this to the fore is to show that the experience of the sacred in 'dark tourist' sites can be horrific. However, the holistic sacred experience is rounded off through rituals and performances that reconcile this horror. In discussing these types of tourist experience, we need to recognise the power of the impure and acknowledge the role of the ritual in relation to them. Narratives of violence, death and destruction are countered through themes of patriotism, respect and peace. The dead is laid to rest and the hero lives on in collective memories.

Conclusion.

It is our belief that these thoughts do not just relate to Gallipoli and Flight 93. Sites where life is tragically taken, cut short or ended violently can invoke unpleasant and horrific experiences for individuals. Car accidents are perhaps a minor case in point for family members. These spots are marked frequently with expressions of love and respect, such as flowers and engraved messages. However, it is within the broader and deeply symbolic places that we can see this 'impure' sacred impacting upon people. The experiences of the people in the discussion of Gallipoli above demonstrate how landscapes where death and tragedy occurred impact on the self in very different ways than through the usual 'sacrality' that is discussed in tourism studies. It provokes feelings of horror, dread and isolation, whereas the collective rituals of national anthems, poems and even monuments invite a reconciliation of these into feelings of joy, patriotism and collective effervescence. We propose that similar experiences are likely felt in other war memorial sites and places of great political and social upheaval. More empirical work should explore these themes.

While our work may not inject itself into the ongoing debate about 'dark tourism', in particular what drives people to seek out impure places, we conclude here that this paper demonstrates the complexity of experience at sites like Gallipoli. People are not merely reflections of a postmodernist obsession with the dark. Rather, they experience something meaningful which impacts deeply on their sense of identity. In some instances, the realities of war are never reconciled and participants return angry and determined that we should never expose our nations to such violence again (see Scates 2006). However, in many cases, the exposure to the impurities of war enables people to engage with rituals and performances that connect deeply to their individual and collective identities. As Slade (2003) and West (2010) argue, this is something to be taken seriously in analysis. Culture frames the experience through narratives and themes, but the experience of the area is what alters perceptions and perhaps even assists in a type of self-actualisation.

Acknowledgements.

We would like to thank Brad West for allowing us access to his empirical data for the collation of this paper. We would also like to thank Bruce Scates for allowing us to use his work as secondary data for our empirical investigation. We also wish to acknowledge Brad West, Alexander Riley, Philip Smith and the anonymous reviewers for comments on earlier drafts and ideas.

References.

ABC News (2006) 'Palm Island needs drastic changes: MP', ABC Online, viewed 10 August 2009, http://www.abc.net.au/news/australia/qld/townsville/200601/s1542608.htm.

Biran, A., Poria, Y. and G.Oren (2011). 'Sought Experiences at (Dark) Heritage Sites', Annals of Tourism Research 38: 820-841.

Bowman, M.S. and P.C. Pezzullo (2009). 'What's so 'Dark' about 'Dark Tourism'?: Death, Tours and Performance', Tourist Studies 9: 187.

Breathnach, T. (2006) 'Looking for the Real Me: Locating the Self in Heritage Tourism', Journal of Heritage Tourism 1: 100-120.

Caillois, R. (1959[1946]) Man and the Sacred, trans. M. Barash. Glencoe: The Free Press.

Carlyon, L. (2004) 'Gallipoli: In a Nation's Remembrance', Australian War Memorial, viewed 17 August, 2009, http://www.awm.gov.au/events/talks/oration2004.asp.

Chesterman, J. and B. Galligan (1997) Citizens Without Rights: Aborigines and Australian Citizenship. Melbourne: Cambridge University Press.

Cohen, E.H. (1979) 'A Phenomenology of Tourist Experiences', Sociology 13: 179-201.

Cohen, E.H. (2009) 'Educational Dark Tourism at an In Populo Site: The Holocaust Museum in Jerusalem', Annals of Tourism Research 38: 193-209.

Cuneen, C. and T. Libesman (1995) Indigenous People and the Law in Australia. Sydney: Butterworths.

Department of Veteran Affairs (2009) 'Anzac Cove', Australian War Memorial, viewed 17 August, 2009, http://www.anzacsite.gov.au/2visiting/walk_03anzaccove.html.

Durkheim, E. (1995[1912]) The Elementary Forms of Religious Life, trans. KE Fields. New York: The Free Press.

Franklin, A. (2003) Tourism: An Introduction. London: Sage.

Frye, N. (1976) The Secular Scripture: A Study of the Structure of Romance. London: Harvard University Press.

Gibson, D.C. (2006) 'The Relationship Between Serial Murder and the American Tourism Industry', Journal of Travel and Tourism Marketing 20: 45-60.

Hertz, R. (2009[1907]) 'The Contribution to a Study of the Collective Representation of Death', pp.108-180 in A.T. Riley, S. Daynes & C. Isnart (trans.) (eds.) Saints, Heroes, Myths, and Rites: Classical Durkheimian Studies of Religion and Society. London: Paradigm Publishers.

Hertz, R. (2009[1909]) 'The Preeminance of the Right Hand: A Study of Religious Polarity', pp.88-107 in A.T. Riley, S. Daynes & C. Isnart (trans.) (eds.) Saints, Heroes, Myths, and Rites: Classical Durkheimian Studies of Religion and Society. London: Paradigm Publishers.

Hertz, R. (2009[1913]) 'The Myth of Saint Besse', pp.180-211 in A.T. Riley, S. Daynes & C. Isnart (trans.) (eds.) Saints, Heroes, Myths, and Rites: Classical Durkheimian Studies of Religion and Society. London: Paradigm Publishers.

Hooper, C. (2008) The Tall Man. Camberwell: Hamish Hamilton.

Hubert, H 1999[1905]. *Essay on Time: A Brief Study of the Representation of Time in Religion and Magic*, trans. R Parkin & J Redding, Bergham Books, Oxford.

Hubert, H. (2009[1919]) 'Preface to Saint Patrick and the Cult of the Hero', pp.39-78 in A.T. Riley, S. Daynes & C. Isnart (trans.) (eds.) Saints, Heroes, Myths, and Rites: Classical Durkheimian Studies of Religion and Society. London: Paradigm Publishers.

Inglis, K.S. (2005) Sacred Places: War Memorials in the Australian Landscape. Melbourne: Melbourne University Press.

Lennon, P and M. Foley (2000) Dark Tourism: The Attraction of Death and Disaster. London: Continuum.

MacCannell, D. (1976) The Tourist: A New Theory of the Leisure Class. New York: Schoken Books.

MacCannell, D. (1992) Empty Meeting Grounds. London: Routledge.

McGregor, R. (1997) Imagined Destinies: Aboriginal Australians and the Doomed Race Theory, 1880-1939. Melbourne: Melbourne University Press.

McKenna, M. & S. Ward (2007) '"It Was Really Moving Mate": The Gallipoli Pilgrimage and Sentimental Nationalism in Australia', Australian Historical Studies: 38: 141-151.

Meade, K. (1998) 'Welcome to Palm Island, the Most Violent Haven on Earth', The Australian, November 13th: 1.

Parkin, R. (1996). The Dark Side of Humanity: The Work of Robert Hertz and its Legacy. Amsterdam: Overseas Publishers Association.

Riley, A.T. (1999) 'Whence Durkheim's Nietzschean Grandchildren?: A Closer Look at Robert Hertz's Place in the Durkheimian Genealogy', European Journal of Sociology 40: 29-59.

Riley, A.T. 2005 'Renegade Durkheimianism and the Trangressive Left Sacred', pp.274-303 in J.C. Alexander & P. Smith (eds.) The Cambridge Companion to Durkheim. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Riley, A.T. (2008) 'On the Role of Images in the Construction of Narratives about the Crash of United Airlines Flight 93', Visual Studies 23: 4-19.

Riley, A.T., Daynes, S. & C. Isnart (2009). 'Editors' Introduction.' pp.1-12 in A.T. Riley, S. Daynes & C. Isnart (trans.) (eds.) Saints, Heroes, Myths, and Rites: Classical Durkheimian Studies of Religion and Society. London: Paradigm Publishers.

Rojek, C. (1993) Ways of Escape: Modern Transformations of Leisure and Travel. London: MacMillan.

Seaton, A. (1996) 'From Thanatopsis to Thanatourism: Guided by the Dark', International Journal of Heritage Studies 2: 234-244.

Scates, B. (2006) Return to Gallipoli: Walking the Battlefields of the Great War. Melbourne: Cambridge University Press.

Scates, B. (2007) 'The First Casualty of War: A Reply to McKenna's and Ward's 'Gallipoli Pilgrimage and Sentimental Nationalism', Australian Historical Studies 38: 312-321.

Shields, R. (1992) Places on the Margin: Alternative Geographies of Modernity. London: Routledge.

Slade, P. (2003) 'Gallipoli Thanatourism: The Meaning of ANZAC', Annals of Tourism Research 30: 779-794.

Smith, P. (1999) 'The Elementary Forms of Place and Their Tranformations: A Durkheimian Model', Qualitative Sociology 22: 13-36.

Thaiday, W. (1981) Under the Act. Townsville: North Queensland Black Publishing Company.

Tourism Queensland (2009) Townsville North Queensland Tourism Opportunity Plan 2009-2019. Brisbane: Queensland Government.

Urry, J. (1995) Consuming Places. London: Routledge.

Watson, J. (1995) '"We Couldn't Tolerate Any More": the Palm Island Strike of 1957', Labour History 69: 149-170.

West, B. (1998) *Unpublished Data from Gallipoli Experience Project*, Flinders University.

West, B. (2008) 'Enchanting Pasts: The Role of International Civil Religious Pilgrimage in Reimagining National Collective Memory', Sociological Theory 26: 258-270.

West, B 2010. 'Dialogical Memorialization, International Travel and the Public Sphere: A Cultural Sociology of Commemoration and Tourism at the First World War Gallipoli Battlefields', Tourist Studies 10: 209.

Young, M.C. (1999) The Guinness Book of World Records. New York: Facts on File.

---

[i] Readers are encouraged to consult Robert Parkin's (1996) excellent work on Hertz's life located in the reference list for a more detailed biography.

[ii] As Parkin's (1996) research shows however, it is possibly the case that Hertz volunteered a sacrifice of his life for a greater good rather than in tragic circumstances.

[iii] Pre-colonisation, Australia was home to two distinct groups of people, the Aboriginal peoples of mainland Australia, and the Torres Strait Islander peoples from north of Cape York. For the purposes of this article, the term 'Indigenous' applies to both groups.

[iv] The Ode, written by Laurence Binyon in 1914 reads 'They shall grow not old, as we that are left grow old; Age shall not weary them, nor the years condemn. At the going down of the sun and in the morning, We will remember them'.