E M PIRICAL A PPROACHES TO LINGUISTIC THEORY

# Language at Large Essays on Syntax and Semantics

Alexandra Y. Aikhenvald and R.M.W. Dixon



## Empirical Approaches to Linguistic Theory

Managing Editor

Brian D. Joseph
The Ohio State University, USA

Editorial Board

Artemis Alexiadou, University of Stuttgart, Germany
Harald Baayen, University of Alberta, Canada
Pier Marco Bertinetto, Scuola Normale Superiore, Pisa, Italy
Kirk Hazen, West Virginia University, Morgantown, USA
Maria Polinsky, Harvard University, Cambridge, USA

**VOLUME 2** 

The titles published in this series are listed at brill.nl/ealt.

### Language at Large

Essays on Syntax and Semantics

Ву

Alexandra Y. Aikhenvald and R. M. W. Dixon

The Cairns Institute
James Cook University



LEIDEN • BOSTON 2011

This book is printed on acid-free paper.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Aikhenval'd, A. IU. (Aleksandra IUr'evna)

Language at large: essays on syntax and semantics / by Alexandra Y. Aikhenvald and R. M. W. Dixon.

p. cm. — (Empirical approaches to linguistic theory; v. 2)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-90-04-20607-6 (alk. paper) 1. Typology (Linguistics) 2. Grammar, Comparative and general—Syntax. 3. Semantics. I. Dixon, Robert M. W. II. Title. III. Series.

P204.A45 2011 415—dc23

2011018141

ISSN 2210-6243 ISBN 978 90 04 20607 6

Copyright 2011 by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands. Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Global ●riental, Hotei Publishing, IDC Publishers, Martinus Nijhoff Publishers and VSP.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use is granted by Koninklijke Brill NV provided that the appropriate fees are paid directly to The Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Suite 910, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Fees are subject to change.



#### CONTENTS

Preface xi Abbreviations xi		
PART A		
TOPICS IN LINGUISTIC TYPOLOGY		
1. Versatile Cases	3	
1. Case on Verbs?	3	
2. Typological Perspective on Versatile Case	7	
3. Versatile Case in Manambu	28	
4. What Can We Conclude?	39	
Appendix 2. Sources for Languages Cited in	41	
Tables 1.2 and 1.3	43	
2. A Typology of Argument-Determined Constructions	44	
1. Argument Transferring	46	
2. Argument Focussing	58	
<ol> <li>Argument Manipulating</li> <li>Marking the Referential Status of Arguments—Inverse</li> </ol>	66	
Systems	73	
5. Comparison	76	
6. Conclusion	80	
Appendix—Terminology	80	
3. Causatives which do not Cause: Non-Valency-Increasing		
Effects of a Valency-Increasing Derivation	86	
1. What this Chapter is About	87	
2. Preamble. Causatives and Applicatives	90	

#### CONTENTS

List of Tables and Figures	XÎ
Preface	xiii
Abbreviations	xix
PART A	
TOPICS IN LINGUISTIC TYPOLOGY	
1. Versatile Cases	3
Alexandra Y. Aikhenvald	
1. Case on Verbs?	3
2. Typological Perspective on Versatile Case	7
3. Versatile Case in Manambu	28
4. What Can We Conclude?	39
Appendix 1. Languages with Cases on Verbs, and the	
sources	41
Appendix 2. Sources for Languages Cited in	
Tables 1.2 and 1.3	43
2. A Typology of Argument-Determined Constructions	44
R. M. W. Dixon and Alexandra Y. Aikhenvald	
1. Argument Transferring	46
2. Argument Focussing	58
3. Argument Manipulating	66
4. Marking the Referential Status of Arguments-Inverse	
Systems	73
5. Comparison	76
6. Conclusion	80
Appendix—Terminology	80
3. Causatives which do not Cause: Non-Valency-Increasing	
Effects of a Valency-Increasing Derivation	86
Alexandra Y. Aikhenvald	
1. What this Chapter is About	87
2. Preamble. Causatives and Applicatives	90

#### CONTENTS

	3. The Semantics of Causatives	97
	4. Causative-Manipulative Derivation in Manambu	101
	5. Causatives and Other Valency-Increasing Derivations in	
	Tariana	109
	6. Non-Valency Increasing Causatives: A Cross-Linguistic	
	Perspective	120
	7. Causatives which do not Cause: An Appraisal	133
	Appendix. Causatives that do not Cause: Evidence for	155
	Historical Development	139
	Thistorical Development	133
4.	Non-Ergative Associations between S and O	143
	Alexandra Y. Aikhenvald and R. M. W. Dixon	
	1. Introduction	143
	2. Core Syntactic Relations	144
	3. Ways of Marking Core Arguments—Accusative and	
	Ergative Systems	146
	4. Inter-Clausal or Syntactic Accusative and Ergative	
	Patterns	148
	5. Associations between S and A (Apart from Accusative	
	Marking)	150
	6. Associations between S and O (Apart from Ergative	
	Marking)	151
	7. Why S and O?	160
	8. Other S/O and S/A Groupings	162
	9. Conclusion	165
5.	Dependencies between Grammatical Systems	170
	Alexandra Y. Aikhenvald and R. M. W. Dixon	
	1. Introduction	170
	2. Systems Considered	171
	3. Markedness	176
	4. Dependencies	179
	5. The Overall Hierarchy	195
	6. Rationale behind the Hierarchy	196
	7. Conclusion	200
	Appendix. Definiteness	200

CONTENTS	vii

6.	The Semantic Basis for a Typology	205
	1. Syntactic Functions and Semantic Roles	205
	2. Correspondences between Functions and Roles	206
	3. A Semantic Typology	209
	4. Envoi	220
7.	Word-Class Changing Derivations in Typological	
	Perspective	221
	Alexandra Y. Aikhenvald	
	1. What this Chapter is About	221
	2. Delineating Word Classes	222
	3. Word-Class-Changing Derivations	230
	4. Derived Verbs, and their Properties	232
	5. Derived Nouns, and their Properties	247
	6. Derived Adjectives, and their Properties	271
	7. Derived Adverbs, and their Properties	276
	8. Summing Up	280
	9. Questions and Suggestions for Fieldworkers	284
8.	Speech Reports: A Cross-Linguistic Perspective	290
	1. Speech Report Constructions: An Overview	290
	2. Multiclausal Speech Report Constructions	291
	3. Monoclausal Speech Report Constructions	304
	4. Syntactic Status of Speech Reports	309
	5. Reporting Verbs and 'Quote Framers'	314
	6. Functions of Speech Reports	321
	7. Further Issues	323
	8. Points to be Addressed when Investigating Speech	
	Reports in a Language	324
9.	Semi-Direct Speech in Typological Perspective	327
	1. The Problem: Speech Reports with Incomplete Person	
	Shift	328
	2. Speech Report Constructions in Manambu	333
	3. Beyond Manambu: Semi-Direct Speech World-Wide	348
	4. To Conclude	364

#### PART B

#### EXPLAINING LANGUAGE

10.	Naive Linguistic Explanation	369
11.	Multiple Marking of Syntactic Function and Polysynthetic Nouns in Tariana  Alexandra Y. Aikhenvald  1. Grammatical Background  2. Multiple Marking  3. Discussion	377 378 386 390
12.	Palikur and the Typology of Classifiers  Alexandra Y. Aikhenvald and Diana Green  1. Introduction  2. Noun Classification Devices  3. Gender in Palikur  4. Numeral Classifiers  5. Verbal Classifiers  6. Locative Classifiers  7. Classifiers in Possessive Constructions  8. Palikur Genders and Classifiers: An Evaluation  Appendix 1. Typological Characteristics of Palikur  Appendix 2. Cross-Referencing and Adpositions in Palikur	394 395 401 410 418 430 435 436 446 448
13.	Zero and Nothing in Jarawara  R. M. W. Dixon  1. Introduction—Zero and Nothing in Pāṇini  2. Phonological Change  3. Syntactic Constructions  4. Morphological Structures  5. Grammatical Systems  6. Zero and Nothing in Jarawara	452 453 453 454
	PART C ENGLISH GRAMMAR AND LEXICOLOGY	
14.	Pronouns with Transferred Reference	465

CONTENTS	ix

15.	Comparative Constructions in English	472
	1. Introduction	472
	2. Form of the Index of Comparison	473
	3. The Syntax of Comparative Constructions	484
	4. Inherently Comparative Expressions	491
	5. The Verb Compare	492
16.	Features of the Noun Phrase in English	494
	1. Introduction	494
	2. The Articles in English	495
	3. The Grammatical Status of the Same	510
17.	Twice and Constituency	519
	1. Introduction	519
	2. Three Senses of <i>Time</i>	521
	3. Comparative Constructions	526
	4. Conclusion	528
18.	Australian Aboriginal Word in Dictionaries—A History R. M. W. Dixon	529
	1. Introduction	529
	2. The Five Most Common Loans from Australian	
	Languages	531
	3. Dictionaries until 1987	536
	4. From 1987 to 1990	545
	5. After 1990	549
	6. New Edition of Australian Aboriginal Words in	
	English	553
	7. Conclusion	553
Bib	liography	555
	thor index	589
	guage index	596
	iect index	602

#### LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

Table 1.1. Case morpher	nes on verb roots and on inflected
	ases having core uses, with noun
phrases and with claus	es
Table 1.3. Meanings of c	ases lacking core uses, with noun
phrases and with claus	es
Table 1.4. Versatile case	marking suffixes in nominal and
verbal contexts in Kha	m
Table 1.5. Meanings and	functions of cases in Manambu on
nouns and verbs	
	f properties of types (I)–(IV)
Table 3.1. Causatives of	intransitive verbs marked with prefix
kay-: examples	
Table 3.2. Manipulatives	of (ambi)transitive verbs marked
with prefix kay-: exam	ples
	l causatives and their meanings in
Tariana	
Table 3.4. Semantic para	meters shared by morphological
causative markers in the	neir valency-increasing and
	ictions
Table 3.5. Non-valency-i	ncreasing meanings of causative
markers: summary of	examples
	g polysemous -ing forms in English
Table 8.1. Syntactic poss	ibilities for direct speech report
Table 9.1. Coreferentiali	ty of the Original Speaker and the
participants within spe	eech reports
Table 9.2. Coreferentialit	ty of the Current Speaker, the
Original Speaker and t	he participants in speech reports
(the Current Speaker i	s feminine)
Table 9.3. Direct and inc	lirect speech reports in Manambu:
	irect and indirect speech reports in
	on
-	variation in semi-direct speech
	*

Table 10.1. Conjugational classes for disyllabic verbs in
Nyawaygi
Table 11.1. Grammatical relations and core cases in Tariana
Table 11.2. Oblique cases in Tariana
Table 12.1. Demonstratives in Palikur (singular)
Table 12.2. Cross-referencing affixes and independent
pronouns
Table 12.3. Gender marking on verbs in Palikur
Table 12.4. Morphological divisions of numeral classifiers
Table 12.5. Incorporated body parts
Table 12.6. Locative classifiers in Apalai
Table 12.7. Possessive classifiers in Palikur
Table 12.8. Numeral, verbal and locative classifiers
Table 12.9. Properties of classifiers and genders
Table 12.10. Semantics of classifiers and genders
Table 12.11. Semantic and functional properties and origin
of classifiers
Table 15.1. Choice of -er or more
Table 15.2. Comparative forms of adjectives and adverbs
Figure 3.1. Semantic features of causative markers with
non-valency-increasing uses
Figure 8.1. Speech reports as a continuum
Figure 8.2. Polysemous patterns in speech report
constructions
Figure 12.1. Gender assignment in Palikur
Figure 12.2. Semantics of Palikur sortal numeral classifiers
Figure 12.3. Semantics of Palikur mensural numeral
classifiers
Figure 12.4. Palikur verbal classifiers
Figure 12.5. Palikur locative classifiers

#### **PREFACE**

Over the past couple of decades, Alexandra Y. Aikhenvald and R. M. W. Dixon have been major players on the world linguistic scene, contributing in a number of areas. The present volume brings together some of the essays they have written—either individually or together—on various themes. Five chapters are published here for the first time. Earlier versions of the remainder have appeared in print but all have been revised for this volume, some very significantly modified and extended. Each essay is self-contained, and can either be read on its own or as part of a themed sequence (for instance, Chapters 8 and 9, and Chapters 2, 3 and 4). There is a little repetition between chapters; this has been retained so that each chapter may be read on its own.

A major field of endeavour has been linguistic typology. Vide Aikhenvald'sthree volumes: Classifiers: A typology of noun categorization devices (2000b), Evidentiality (2004) and Imperatives and commands (2010a). Plus Dixon's Ergativity (1994) and the first two volumes of his Basic linguistic theory (2010a, b). The seven chapters in Part A investigate further typological issues.

Chapter 1, 'Versatile cases', explores what happens when cases expand beyond their canonical role of marking the syntactic functions of noun phrases. In many languages, some cases may also be attached to verbs, and may then either take on an aspectual or modal meaning, or mark a type of clause linkage. Chapter 2 presents 'A typology of argument-determined constructions', distinguishing between constructions which transfer an argument (passive, antipassive, causative, applicative), those which focus on an argument, those which manipulate an argument, and those which mark the referential status of an argument ('inverse systems'). A particular grammatical marker may have a central meaning and also secondary functions. Chapter 3 considers 'Causatives which don't cause'. That is, in addition to marking causation, a certain marker may indicate an applicative derivation, or intensity of action, or manipulative effect.

In terms of case marking or clause linking, S (intransitive subject) may be associated with either A (transitive subject) or O (transitive object), giving rise to a nominative-accusative or an absolutive-ergative system. But not all associations between S and A are indications of

XiV PREFACE

an 'accusative' system, nor are all associations between S and O to be classified as 'ergative'. Chapter 4 discusses 'Non-ergative associations between S and O'. Then, chapter 5 investigates the ways in which languages show 'Dependencies between grammatical systems'. For example, there may be more tense choices available in positive than in negative clauses, or more genders distinguished in singular than in plural.

In every language, a verb describes an action which relates to a number of participants. Chapter 6 sets out 'The semantic basis for a typology', showing that in some languages the meanings of verbs are oriented towards type of participant (for example, 'eat meat' or 'eat vegetables') whereas in others they relate to type of action ('eat where a good deal of chewing is involved', 'eat by sucking', etc.). For every language, a set of open word classes can be recognised on language-internal criteria (typically: noun, verb and adjective). Languages vary as to the number and types of ways they have for deriving a stem of one class on the basis of a form from another word class. Chapter 7 deals with 'Word-class changing derivations in typological perspective'.

Chapter 8, 'Speech reports: a cross-linguistic perspective', discusses direct speech—as when we hear 'The nurse said to me "Come and see me"—and indirect speech—'The nurse said to me that I should come and see her'. Monoclausal and multiclausal speech report constructions are discussed, together with their syntactic status and functions. We then venture into a seldom-explored area, constructions which fall between straight direct and straight indirect reports, as when we hear 'The nurse said to me "Come and see her".' Chapter 9 examines 'Semi-direct speech in typological perspective'.

Aikhenvald and Dixon have also been active in providing theoretically-informed documentation of previously undescribed (or scarcely described) languages. Aikhenvald has published on three Arawak languages from north-west Brazil. She worked with the last speaker of Bare (1995), then produced grammars of Warekena (1998) and Tariana (2003). These were followed by her magisterial *The Manambu language from East Sepik, Papua New Guinea* (2008a). Between 1972 and 1991 Dixon published grammars of five Australian languages—Dyirbal, Yidiñ, Warrgamay, Nyawaygi and Mbabaram—plus a full account of the Boumaa dialect of Fijian. From 1991 he undertook immersion fieldwork in Brazil, resulting in his award-winning monograph *The Jarawara language of southern Amazonia* (2004b). The four chapters in Part B are offshoots from this descriptive work.

PREFACE XV

Speakers of out-of-the-way languages, who 'adopt' a linguist, are typically of high intelligence, but do not have available appropriate terminology which would enable them to explain some tricky point of grammar. Chapter 10, 'Naive linguistic explanation', shows the sorts of 'lateral thinking' which speakers invoke in order to get their point across. The dauntingly complex structure of Tariana involves noun phrases showing double marking for syntactic function—that within a lower clause (or an embedded noun phrase) and that within a higher clause (or an embedding noun phrases). This is explained in Chapter 11, 'Multiple marking of syntactic function and polysynthetic nouns in Tariana'.

Chapter 12, 'Palikur and the typology of classifiers', examines another Arawak language, which is spoken in north-west Brazil and over the border into French Guiana. It has three genders—whose use is motivated by an array of semantic parameters—plus numeral classifiers, two varieties of verbal classifiers, locative classifiers, and possessive classifiers. To round out part B we have Chapter 13, 'Zero and nothing in Jarawara', dealing with a language from the small Arawá family (no connection with Arawak). 'Zero' is a recognised artefact of linguistic analysis (for example to mark singular number in English as opposed to the explicit plural marker, orthographic -s). This chapter follows the great Indian grammarian Pāṇini in showing that 'zero' is not at all the same thing as nothing.

It is natural that a linguist, in between spells of fieldwork in exotic locations, should spend some time analysing their own language. Dixon's A new approach to English grammar, on semantic principles (1991) went through half-a-dozen reprints before being expanded (with three chapters added) and revised as A semantic approach to English grammar (2005). The first four chapters of Part C extend this work.

Chapter 14, 'Pronouns with transferred reference', begins with the well-known McCawley/Lakoff sentence *I dreamed that I was Brigitte Bardot and that I kissed me*, exploring which pronouns can have their reference transferred and under what circumstances. Following this, Chapter 15 'Comparative constructions in English' works in terms of the general parameters for comparative constructions—as set out in Dixon (2008a)—investigating in some detail how they apply to English. The essential nature of articles, and the grammatical status of *the same*, are dealt with in Chapter 16, 'Features of the noun phase in English', and then Chapter 17 examines the circumstances under

XVI PREFACE

which twice can or must be used in place of two times, and what can be inferred from this concerning constituency.

Dixon has combined interest in the indigenous languages of Australia with that in English, by co-authoring Australian Aboriginal Words in English: Their origin and meaning, published as Dixon et al. (1990) with an expanded second edition in 2006. Chapter 18, 'Australian Aboriginal words in dictionaries: A history', sketches the background to this lexicographic endeavour.

#### Sources

Chapters 3, 4, 7, 8 and 14 are here published for the first time. We are grateful to the publishers of earlier versions of the remaining chapters to use material from them here.

- 1, 'Versatile Cases', is a revised and enlarged version of a paper from the *Journal of Linguistics* 44: 565–603, 2008; © Cambridge University Press, used with permission.
- 2, 'A typology of Argument-Determined Constructions', is a revised version of a paper published as pp. 71–113 of *Essays on language function and language type*, edited by Joan Bybee, John Haiman and Sandra Thompson, 1997. Used with kind permission of John Benjamins Publishing Company, Amsterdam/Philadelphia (www. benjamins.com).
- 5, 'Dependencies between Grammatical Systems', is a revised version of a paper from *Language* 74: 56–80, 1998.
- 6, 'The Semantic Basis for a Typology', is a truncated and revised version of 'Semantic roles and syntactic functions: the semantic basis for a typology', from the *Proceedings of the 35th Annual Meeting of the Chicago Linguistic Society*, Part 2: *Papers from the Panels*, 323–41, 1999. Parts of this chapter, in very similar form, are in Dixon (2004a: 550–7).
- 9, 'Semi-Direct Speech in Typological Perspective', is a revised version of 'Semi-direct speech: Manambu and beyond', *Language Sciences* 30: 383–422, 2008.
- 10, 'Naive Linguistic Explanation', is a shortened and revised version of a paper from *Language in Society* 21: 83–91, 1992; © Cambridge University Press, used with permission.

PREFACE XVII

- 11, 'Multiple Marking of Syntactic Function and Polysynthetic Nouns in Tariana', is a corrected version of a paper from the *Proceedings of the 35th Regional Meeting of the Chicago Linguistic Society*. Part 2: The Panels. 235–48, 1999.
- 12, 'Palikur and the Typology of Classifiers', is a revised version of a paper from *Anthropological Linguistics*, 40: 429–480, 1998. It is used with permission of the University of Nebraska Press.
- 13, 'Zero and Nothing in Jarawara', is a corrected version of a paper published as pp. 125–37 of Form and function in language research: Papers in honour of Christian Lehmann, edited by Johannes Helmbrecht, Yoko Nishina, Yong Min Shin, Stavros Skopeteas and Elisabeth Verhoeven, Berlin, Mouton de Gruyter, 2009.
- 15, 'Comparative Constructions in English', appeared in *Studia Anglica Posnaniensia* 41: 5–27, 2005.
- 16, 'Features of the Noun Phrase in English', is the amalgamation of two papers, 'The articles in English' and 'The grammatical status of the same', from Studia Anglica Posnaniensia 42: 31–36, 2006 and 45: 3–11, 2009.
- 17, 'Twice and Constituency', appeared in Studia Anglica Posnaniensia 44: 193–202, 2008.
- 18, 'Australian Aboriginal words in Dictionaries—a history', is a revised version of a paper published in the *International Journal of Lexicology* 21: 129–52, 2008.



#### **ABBREVIATIONS**

These are abbreviations employed in interlinear glossing of examples; or instance, ERG for ergative and CL for classifier. However, where an example is short, with plenty of room on the line, a full label ERGATIVE or CLASSIFIER is written out. It would be pedantic (and otiose) to insist on always employing ERG and CL when there is no spatial limitation which requires abbreviation. Our aim, through the volume, has been to try to be as reader-friendly as circumstances permit.

1	first person
2	second person
3	third person
A	transitive subject
ABI.	ablative

ABL ablative
ABS absolutive
ACC accusative
ACT.FOC action focus

AD location 'ad' (in the vicinity of)

ADDR addressee ADESS adessive

ADJ adjective, adjectivizer

ADVZ adverbializer
AG agentive
AGT agent
ALL allative
ANIM animate

AO actor orientation
AP animate plural
APPL applicative
ART article
ATT attributive
AUG augmentative
AUX auxiliary

BAS basic person marking

BAS.NP basic non-past cross-referencing

BE bound element

BIV bivalent bound root BR CAUS causative CERT certain CL classifier CNTR contrast COLL collective COMIT comitative

COMPL completive non-main clause

COMPLZR complementizer COND conditional

CONF confirmation marker CONJ conjugation marker

CONS consequential CONT continuative

CONT.LOC localization continuative

COP copula

CS current speaker
CUST customary

D durative marker

DAT dative
DECL declarative
DEF definite

DEM demonstrative
DENOM denominal
DEP dependent
DES desiderative
DIM diminutive
DIR directional

DIR.SP.REP direct speech report

DIST distal

DR bivalent direct
DS different subject

du dual

e eyewitness

E extended argument of a ditransitive verb

ERG ergative exclusive F, f, fem feminine

FN function marker

FOC focus FP far past **FUT** future **GEN** genitive habitual HAB immediate **IMM IMPF** imperfective **IMPV** imperative **INCH** inchoative INCL, incl inclusive

IND.SP.REP indirect speech report INDEF indefinite person

INDIC indicative
INF infinitive
INSTR instrumental
INT intention
intr intransitive
IO indirect object
IP immediate past

**ITER** iterative intentional ITN LK linker LOC locative LOGOPHOR, log logophoric LV linking vowel masculine M, m, masc **MANIP** manipulative

N noun

n non-eyewitness

NARR narrative NEG negative NEUT, n neuter

nf non-feminine
NMZR nominalizer
NOM nominalization
NOMIN nominative
NONVIS non-visual
NP noun phrase

nsg non-singular NT non-topic O transitive object

OBJ object
obl oblique
OBLIG obligative
OPT optative

OS Original Speaker

person p P past PART participle **PASS** passive pauc paucal PEI pejorative PERF perfect PERFV perfective PERI peripheral PERM permissive PL, pl plural

pl.a plural absential

POS positive POSS possessive **POSSN** possession POT potential PRES present **PRET** preterite **PRIV** privative PRO free pronoun

**PROC** process PROG progressive PROH prohibitive PROP proprietive case PROPR proprietive PROX proximate PT past tense **PURP** purposive

Q question QUOT quotative REC reciprocal