

JCU ePrints

This file is part of the following reference:

**Yates, Karen (2010) *'My passion is midwifery'*:
midwives working across dual roles in the country. PhD
thesis, James Cook University.**

Access to this file is available from:

<http://eprints.jcu.edu.au/17226>



‘My passion is midwifery’: Midwives working across
dual roles in the country.

Thesis submitted by

Karen YATES

RN, RM, MN, Grad Cert. Ed (Tertiary Teaching)

For the Doctor of Philosophy

School of Nursing, Midwifery and Nutrition

James Cook University

Statement of Sources

Declaration

I declare that this thesis is my own work and has not been submitted in any form for another degree or diploma at any university or other institution of tertiary education. Information derived from published or unpublished work of others has been acknowledged in the text and a list of references is provided.

.....

Signature

30th September 2010

Date

Statement of the contribution of others

This thesis has been completed through the support of the following people:

Supervisors:

Principal supervisor:

Professor Kim Usher, School of Nursing, Midwifery and Nutrition, James Cook University

Secondary supervisors:

Associate Professor David Lindsay, School of Nursing, Midwifery and Nutrition, James Cook University

Dr Jenny Kelly, Senior Research Fellow, Anton Breinl Centre for the School of Public Health, Tropical Medicine and Rehabilitation Sciences, James Cook University

Previous Supervisor:

Professor Mary Fitzgerald, School of Nursing, Midwifery and Nutrition, James Cook University

Peer Reviewer:

Dr Jane Mills, School of Nursing, Midwifery and Nutrition, James Cook University, Cairns.

Ethics Approval:

Ethical approval was sought and approved by the James Cook University Human Ethics Review Committee (H3199) and the Cairns and Hinterland Health Service District Human Research Ethics Committee (534).

Acknowledgements

The work and effort to complete this thesis relied on the support of many others beside me. I sincerely thank the midwife participants who agreed to participate in this research. Without their generosity of time, information and stories, this thesis could not exist.

Professor Mary Fitzgerald's friendly guidance and gentle nudging moved me from curious interest onto the path of Doctoral Studies and her support as initial Principal Supervisor is greatly appreciated. I thank Professor Kim Usher, who took over as Principal Supervisor after the departure of Mary Fitzgerald, who provided great guidance, support and feedback during the PhD journey and helped keep me on track. One could not wish for a better guide on a journey such as this.

Special thanks also go to my Co-supervisors Associate Professor David Lindsay and Dr Jenny Kelly. David's feedback and constructive comments on each of my chapters was greatly valued and appreciated. As a midwife, Jenny provided invaluable support and feedback on my writing and helped steer me in the right direction.

To my family, in particular my husband Peter, I can't thank you enough for all your support over the years of my education endeavours. From taking the boys for a drive "so Mum can do her assignments" back in the post-registration degree days, to putting up with the laptop coming with us on holidays so that this thesis could be completed on time; you offered your support in innumerable ways for which I will always be grateful.

Conventions used within the thesis

The presentation of the data analysis chapters (Chapters 6 through 8), excerpts from the transcripts were presented. The following conventions were used in the thesis:

All participants were assigned pseudonyms to preserve their anonymity. Where other staff or family members were mentioned by name, these were also assigned a pseudonym.

All direct quotes were presented in italics. At the end of each quote a series of numbers were assigned in brackets. These numbers denote the participant number and the lines of the transcript that the quote was from. For example, (1:23-27) denotes this quote was from participant 1, and the quote is found in lines 23 to 27 of the transcript.

Where the participant may have expressed a word or phrase particularly forcefully or emphatically, this was presented in **bold** font. Three dots (...) at the beginning of a quote denote that the quote commenced part way through a sentence and if contained within the quote, they denote some words were left out, for the sake of brevity.

The words or comments of the author may have been included within the quote to enhance understanding or illustrate a question posed. In these cases the author's words are contained within brackets [] and are in normal font, not italics.

List of Figures and Tables

| | |
|--|----|
| Figure 1 – Trend in Perinatal mortality rate in Queensland by Indigenous Status | 13 |
| Figure 2 – Public Birthing Facilities in Queensland 1995 and 2005 | 15 |
| Table 1 – Rural and Remote Classification systems | 8 |
| Table 2 – Developing meaning from text | 90 |
| Table 3 - The themes and sub-themes that provide the meaning of working across dual roles of nurse and midwife in a small rural hospital. | 92 |

Abstract

Over 130 maternity units closed across Australia between 1995 and 2008 (Bryant, 2009). In the majority of cases these closures were in rural areas and caused by workforce shortages, both medical and midwifery. The potential for midwives to leave rural and remote areas as a result of the closures has serious implications for birthing women and their families residing in these areas, as well as for the already depleted rural workforce. The reduction in maternity services in rural areas has led to a situation where midwives have been required to work in dual roles as nurse and midwife. Midwives in rural and remote areas face many challenges including the difficulty in maintaining midwifery skills, being required to work in nursing-oriented areas for which they may have little current clinical experience or interest, and the fear of working beyond their scope of practice which may result in dissatisfaction with the work environment, a known contributor to staff attrition (Jackson, Mannix, & Daly, 2001). Little is known about the challenges faced by midwives who work in dual roles in rural and remote locations in Australia.

The aim of this study was to describe midwives' experiences of working in the dual role as nurse and midwife in rural areas of far north Queensland, Australia. The methodology was informed by Heidegger's interpretive phenomenological philosophy and data analysis was guided by van Manen's (1990) analytical approach. Data was generated by unstructured, conversational interviews with eight midwives. The interviews were recorded and transcribed verbatim, then analysed and interpreted using the van Manen (1990) hermeneutic phenomenological approach.

Three themes were identified that helped to explain what it is like to work in a dual role as nurse and midwife in rural far north Queensland. These were: Making choices between professional role and lifestyle: “Because I choose to live here”; Integration of maternity and general nursing: “All in together this fine weather” and, Shaped by location: “That’s part of working in a small place”. A number of sub-themes were also described under each of these themes. The findings revealed that the midwives saw their employment options limited by their rural location, however these limitations were largely accepted as being part of living in a rural area. A number expressed concern that they were deployed back and forth between midwifery and nursing areas, sometimes more than once during the same shift. There was philosophical conflict identified between the biomedical, illness based model of nursing and the partnership, wellness model of midwifery, and concern about the lack of support for midwifery services. While the midwives expressed a preference to work as midwives only, they did acknowledge that the variety offered by the dual role had some benefits in terms of maintaining nursing knowledge and skills. While the participants recognised that in rural areas it is important to be a multi-skilled generalist, they were concerned that midwifery skills could be eroded or even lost with the diminishing amounts of midwifery work available.

A number of recommendations arose out of this study. Further research is needed to examine the extent to which the requirement to work in a dual, or multi-faceted role is an impediment to the recruitment and retention of midwives to rural areas.

Appropriate re-structuring of maternity services could provide better utilisation of the midwifery workforce in rural centres, and reduce the current problems associated with transferring birthing mothers from rural centres to larger facilities to birth their baby.

This study also highlighted the need to explore the dual role of the rural nurse and midwife from a nursing perspective. Rigorous evaluation of current rural midwifery-led models of care is important to create awareness of how these models may be able to be effectively implemented in rural settings in the future.

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|------------|
| Statement of sources | ii |
| Statement of the contribution of others | iii |
| Acknowledgements | iv |
| Conventions used in this thesis | v |
| Figures and Tables | vi |
| Abstract | vii |
| Table of contents | x |
| | |
| Chapter 1 – Introduction and Background | 1 |
| Introduction | 1 |
| My background | 3 |
| The impetus for this study | 5 |
| Defining the concepts of rurality and remoteness | 7 |
| Health and demography of rural populations | 9 |
| Provision of maternity services in rural Australia | 13 |
| Culturally safe practice | 18 |
| Safe birthing services | 19 |
| Current issues in Australian midwifery | 21 |
| Conclusion | 25 |
| | |
| Chapter 2 - Literature Review | 28 |
| Introduction | 28 |
| The global and Australian health workforce | 29 |
| The rural health, nursing and midwifery workforce | 33 |
| The Australian midwifery workforce | 37 |
| The role of the midwife in Australia | 44 |
| The advanced practice midwife – mythical or essential? | 47 |
| Role theory | 50 |
| Role stress, role conflict and role ambiguity | 52 |
| Conclusion | 55 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| Chapter 3 - Methodology | 57 |
| Introduction | 57 |
| Phenomenology | 58 |
| Historical development of Phenomenology: From Husserl to Heidegger | 60 |
| The Hermeneutic Circle | 66 |
| ‘Traditional’ versus ‘American’ Phenomenology | 67 |
| van Manen | 69 |
| Phenomenology and nursing | 71 |
| Conclusion | 74 |
| | |
| Chapter 4 – Methods | 75 |
| Introduction | 75 |
| Turning to a phenomenon of interest | 76 |
| Investigating the experience | 78 |
| Reflecting on essential themes | 78 |
| Describing the phenomenon through the art of writing and re-writing | 79 |
| Maintaining a strong and oriented relation to the phenomenon | 80 |
| Balancing the research context by considering the parts and the whole | 81 |
| Participants | 81 |
| Data collection | 83 |
| Data analysis | 86 |
| Thematic analysis | 89 |
| Methodological rigour | 92 |
| Ethics | 93 |
| Conclusion | 95 |
| | |
| Chapter 5 – Introducing the participants | 96 |
| Overview of the participants | 96 |
| Participant 1 – Margaret | 98 |
| Participant 2 – Lesley | 100 |
| Participant 3 – Christine | 101 |
| Participant 4 – Alison | 103 |
| Participant 5 – Lauren | 104 |
| Participant 6 – Heather | 106 |
| Participant 7 – Helen | 107 |
| Participant 8 – Sandra | 108 |
| Conclusion | 109 |
| | |
| Chapter 6 - Making choices between professional role and lifestyle: “Because I choose to live here” | 111 |
| Introduction | 111 |
| Theme one: ‘Because I choose to live here’ | 112 |
| Sub-theme: ‘Nothing you can do about it’ | 112 |
| Sub-theme: Choosing to live rural | 115 |
| Sub-theme: ‘You’re a nurse first’ | 117 |
| Conclusion | 119 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| Chapter 7 – Integration of maternity and general nursing: “All in together this fine weather” | 121 |
| Introduction | 121 |
| Theme two: Integration of maternity and general nursing | 121 |
| Sub-theme: stress due to working across roles | 121 |
| Sub-theme: ‘It’s not right’, conflict with integration | 125 |
| Sub-theme: Enjoy the variety | 128 |
| Conclusion | 130 |
| Chapter 8 – Shaped by location: “That’s part of working in a small place” | 131 |
| Introduction | 131 |
| Theme three: shaped by location | 131 |
| Sub-theme: sense of belonging to a community | 131 |
| Sub-theme: ‘you deal with what comes through the door’ | 136 |
| Sub-theme: limitations of working in a rural hospital | 141 |
| Conclusion | 147 |
| Chapter 9 – Discussion | 148 |
| Introduction | 148 |
| Overview of themes identified | 149 |
| Making choices between professional role and lifestyle: “Because I choose to live here” | 149 |
| Integration of maternity and general nursing: “All in together this fine weather” | 155 |
| Shaped by location: “That’s part of working in a small place” | 159 |
| What does this mean for the rural midwifery work force? | 163 |
| Conclusion | 166 |
| Chapter 10 – Limitations and Recommendations | 169 |
| Introduction | 169 |
| Limitations | 169 |
| Recommendations | 171 |
| Conclusion | 173 |
| References | 175 |
| Appendices | 203 |