

**Jo Mensinga**

# **Quilting Professional Stories**

**A Gendered Experience of Choosing Social  
Work as a Career**

**VDM Verlag Dr. Müller**

---

### **Impressum/Imprint (nur für Deutschland/ only for Germany)**

Bibliografische Information der Deutschen Nationalbibliothek: Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation in der Deutschen Nationalbibliografie; detaillierte bibliografische Daten sind im Internet über <http://dnb.d-nb.de> abrufbar.

Alle in diesem Buch genannten Marken und Produktnamen unterliegen warenzeichen-, marken- oder patentrechtlichem Schutz bzw. sind Warenzeichen oder eingetragene Warenzeichen der jeweiligen Inhaber. Die Wiedergabe von Marken, Produktnamen, Gebrauchsnamen, Handelsnamen, Warenbezeichnungen u.s.w. in diesem Werk berechtigt auch ohne besondere Kennzeichnung nicht zu der Annahme, dass solche Namen im Sinne der Warenzeichen- und Markenschutzgesetzgebung als frei zu betrachten wären und daher von jedermann benutzt werden dürften.

Coverbild: [www.purestockx.com](http://www.purestockx.com)

Verlag: VDM Verlag Dr. Müller Aktiengesellschaft & Co. KG  
Dudweiler Landstr. 99, 66123 Saarbrücken, Deutschland  
Telefon +49 681 9100-698, Telefax +49 681 9100-988, Email: [info@vdm-verlag.de](mailto:info@vdm-verlag.de)  
Zugl.: Rockhampton, Central Queensland University, Diss., 2005

Herstellung in Deutschland:  
Schaltungsdienst Lange o.H.G., Berlin  
Books on Demand GmbH, Norderstedt  
Reha GmbH, Saarbrücken  
Amazon Distribution GmbH, Leipzig  
ISBN: 978-3-639-21153-5

### **Imprint (only for USA, GB)**

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek: The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available in the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

Any brand names and product names mentioned in this book are subject to trademark, brand or patent protection and are trademarks or registered trademarks of their respective holders. The use of brand names, product names, common names, trade names, product descriptions etc. even without a particular marking in this works is in no way to be construed to mean that such names may be regarded as unrestricted in respect of trademark and brand protection legislation and could thus be used by anyone.

Cover image: [www.purestockx.com](http://www.purestockx.com)

Publisher:  
VDM Verlag Dr. Müller Aktiengesellschaft & Co. KG  
Dudweiler Landstr. 99, 66123 Saarbrücken, Germany  
Phone +49 681 9100-698, Fax +49 681 9100-988, Email: [info@vdm-publishing.com](mailto:info@vdm-publishing.com)

Copyright © 2010 by the author and VDM Verlag Dr. Müller Aktiengesellschaft & Co. KG and licensors  
All rights reserved. Saarbrücken 2010

Printed in the U.S.A.  
Printed in the U.K. by (see last page)  
ISBN: 978-3-639-21153-5

## Table of Contents

	Page
<b>Acknowledgements .....</b>	<b>vi</b>
<b>Foreword to my Readers.....</b>	<b>viii</b>
<b>Chapter 1: .....</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>The Identification of the Research Puzzle .....</b>	<b>11</b>
Preamble.....	11
Why career choice? .....	14
Autobiographical influences affecting my exploration of social work as a career choice .....	16
The past.....	16
The not so distant past.....	19
The past merging with the present.....	20
Exploring career choice as an experience .....	22
The relevance of the research puzzle .....	24
Story 1 – My reflections on preparing for the first year residential experience .....	28
<b>Chapter 2: .....</b>	<b>35</b>
<b>Career Choice as a Culturally Constructed Narrative .....</b>	<b>35</b>
Theoretical mandates within the vocational guidance sector .....	37
Research exploring career choice in social work .....	41
Discerning the social work discourse .....	47
Themes associated with the social work discourse in Australia .....	48
Understanding a narrative social work identity.....	52
Distinguishing between and/or integrating the social justice and caring discourses.....	55
Story 2: Geraldine's reflections during the 'Quilting Professional Identities' session.....	57
<b>Chapter 3: .....</b>	<b>65</b>
<b>'Thinking Narratively' – A Holistic Insight into     Students' Choice of Social Work as a Career.....</b>	<b>65</b>
Experience as a cultural artefact for personal and professional practice, education and research .....	66
Communications theory .....	68
Systems theory .....	69
Feminism .....	69
Critical theory (Marxism) .....	70
Narrative therapy.....	70
Moving from practice to research.....	71
Locating experience in narratology .....	71

Researchers' experiences of narrative as a research approach .....	73
Researchers' experiences of narrative and its links to career choice	75
The purpose of professional life stories (Linde 1993).....	76
An exploration of therapists' professional stories (White 1997).....	77
Understanding craftartist's stories of identity (Mishler 1999).....	78
The significance of social positioning in stories (Riessman 2001) ...	80
Shaping and understanding teachers' professional identities (Glandinin and Connelly 2000; Connelly and Glandinin 1990) .....	81
Positioning myself in the narrative template.....	86
Using the quilt as a heuristic device to link theory and method.....	87
Negotiating ethical considerations and entrance into the field .....	90
The immersion phase.....	91
The reflective phase.....	93
The integration phase .....	95
Ethical considerations for the reader.....	96
Collecting field texts as material.....	97
Appreciating the texture and nuances present in the field texts .....	97
The immersion phase.....	98
The reflective phase.....	99
The integration phase .....	100
Piecing the material together .....	102
Story 3: John's reflections during the 'Quilting Professional Identities' session.....	105
<b>Chapter 4: .....</b>	<b>112</b>
<b>Geraldine's Experience of Choosing Social Work as a Gendered Profession.....</b>	<b>112</b>
Dear John, .....	114
Reflecting on my role in the career choice experience.....	117
Awareness of a gendered identity.....	121
No men in Geraldine's story!.....	124
Learning caring skills from the women in Geraldine's story .....	130
In Conclusion: Turning To Jane Addams.....	138
Research process .....	140
<b>Chapter 5: .....</b>	<b>142</b>
<b>John's Experience of Choosing Social Work as a Gendered Profession.....</b>	<b>142</b>
Dear Geraldine,.....	143
Women as characters in John's 'stories of lived experience' .....	145
Negotiating the male career discourse.....	149
The importance of group membership .....	156
Returning to the care theme.....	158
The future.....	162
<b>Chapter 6: .....</b>	<b>165</b>
<b>Exploring Gender As An 'Obstacle' In Career Choice Stories.....</b>	<b>165</b>

Gender as a significant 'obstacle' in the career choice narrative ...	166
Encountering gendered career discourses in the community.....	168
Negotiating gendered agendas in the family .....	170
Challenging the gender discourse informing education and work agendas .....	173
Accounting for the gendered career discourse in the profession ...	176
Returning to explore gender in pre-existing research stories .....	179
The process of quilting a professional story .....	182
<b>Chapter 7: .....</b>	<b>185</b>
<b>Reflecting On My Experience Of Narrative Inquiry As A Method To Explore Career Choice.....</b>	<b>185</b>
Dear Chris, .....	188
<b>Bibliography .....</b>	<b>198</b>
<b>Appendix A – Describing the terms used to structure this inquiry.....</b>	<b>212</b>
<b>Appendix B(1) – Letter to Respondents.....</b>	<b>216</b>
<b>Appendix B(2) – Letter to respondents .....</b>	<b>218</b>
<b>Appendix B(3) – Letter to respondents .....</b>	<b>220</b>
<b>Appendix C – Checklist of theories for analysis of stories .....</b>	<b>222</b>
<b>Appendix D – Example of table used to analyse social positioning.....</b>	<b>226</b>
<b>Appendix D – Example of table used to analyse social positioning.....</b>	<b>226</b>

## **List of Tables and Illustrations**

	Page
Table 3.1: Summary of the ways researchers can interact with narrative material .....	75
Table 3.2: Summary of assumptions underpinning the exploration of career choice stories.....	83

## **Acknowledgements**

There have been many people who have helped and encouraged me throughout the process of co-constructing this book. Like any defining experience, there are some who have played minor roles while others have had larger roles to play. While I wish to express my gratitude to all those who have contributed to my research experience (family, friends, the staff and larger student body in the School of Social Work and Welfare Studies), there are particular people to whom I wish to acknowledge particular indebtedness.

Very special thanks are offered to 'Geraldine' and 'John' – the students who participated in the study. Not only did they give of their time freely, they willingly immersed themselves in the narrative process providing honest insights into their experience of choosing social work. I have greatly appreciated the opportunity to learn more of their narrative worlds and have benefited both personally and professionally from their reflections and as a result of their challenges.

I would also like to express my gratitude to Professor Michael Connelly, Associate Jane Maidment and the late Associate Professor Frances Killion. Without their support, advice and encouragement my research experience would not have eventuated or been as rich. Associate Professor Killion provided me with the opportunity and gave me the confidence to pursue a research approach that was not well recognised. Professor Connelly gave me the technical support, professional advice and personal enthusiasm I needed to see the project through to fruition. Associate Professor Maldment offered me professional guidance and personal confirmation when and where it was needed.

My final thanks are offered to my sister, Christine; my parents, Janet and Wiert, and; to my partner and friend, Graham Chandler. Their confidence, tolerance and encouragement of and in me have been invaluable hallmarks that I will always treasure. They have contributed both a warmth and richness to a research experience that would have otherwise been missed.

## **Foreword: A letter to my readers**

*Dear colleagues,*

*Welcome and thank you for taking the time to read my research text. As I reflect on the process of writing this text, I am reminded that you have already, if only inadvertently, been a participant of sorts in this inquiry. All narratives are told with an audience in mind (Sawyer 1976). As such, I assume that like me you are either an academic and/or a social worker (although you may be neither!) and that you have expectations of how this particular text will be written. However, because of the nature of the phenomenon being studied, and because I want to convey the experience I have had during the course of this inquiry, I have chosen to present the findings in a slightly less than conventional way.*

*Geraldine, John and I came together over a period of four years to tell and retell our 'stories of lived experience' in an effort to better understand what choosing social work entails. Whereas many texts describe career choice as a linear experience, for us choosing social work as our preferred career was a far more complex and 'patchy' process that involved revisiting and revising our stories as we became aware of impacting personal, institutional and social agendas. While some of these agendas were readily integrated into our 'stories to live by', others remained and continue to linger on the edge awaiting our attention at some later time. As you can imagine, representing this process has proved quite difficult to capture in a two-dimensional space provided by words on a page.*

*The research approach itself renders an assortment of data, academic deliberations, personal reflections and the like, which are difficult to separate into discrete sentences, paragraphs and chapters. While many research texts using narrative inquiry as method overcome this by interweaving these emerging features*

*throughout the manuscript (Connelly 2002 -2004), in the main I have conformed to accepted forms of writing. Nevertheless, there are occasions within each chapter where a separate story (delineated by bolding of the text), is presented seemingly with little introduction or warning. While I acknowledge this can be somewhat disconcerting for you as the reader, I employ this as a deliberate device. As such, I hope to continually remind you that although convention dictates that the inclusion of new pieces of material in a career story and research text should be made imperceptible to maintain a semblance of congruence and coherence (Linde 1993), when they are first encountered by the teller, they are experienced as separate and distinct events.*

*However, even though I have chosen to present 'unlinked stories' in this text, by the time you reach the end, I trust that you as the reader will be able to see that the stories do indeed form an emerging pattern – much like the separate pieces in a completed patchwork quilt do. I anticipate in presenting the text in the way that I have, I not only illustrate John, Geraldine and my own experience of choosing social work, but I also create a space for you to revisit and include career choice stories of your own. This way I hope that we will all continue to contribute to an evolving narrative that acknowledges and describes the passion and purpose that motivates and sustains social workers in the work that they do.*

*Oh yes, there is another thing I wanted to note before you started reading this account, the stories themselves are just that. While they are based on fact and collected field texts, the stories are also 'fictionalised'. That is, the order of events, names and overarching themes have been reconstructed to both maintain a level of confidentiality for the participants and to provide some narrative coherence for you the reader. Moreover, in writing the stories this way, I have attempted a departure from an engrained academic style to capture the genre of 'story making' that prevails in the everyday*

*world of the social worker. Although this contributes to the resulting text appearing somewhat 'patchy', it is intended to reflect Geraldine, John and my experience of entering and performing our career choice stories in a number of different contexts. Once again, welcome.*

*Regards,*

*Jo Mensinga*