

**AN EVALUATION OF GEOGRAPHIC VARIATION IN
THE LIFE HISTORY AND BEHAVIOUR OF
ANEMONEFISHES: A COMMON-GARDEN APPROACH**

PhD thesis submitted by

Karin BUECHLER (BSc & MSc)

in September 2005

**For the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
School of Marine Biology and Aquaculture
James Cook University
Australia**

ELECTRONIC COPY

I, the undersigned, the author of this work, declare that the electronic copy of this thesis provided to the James Cook University Library, is an accurate copy of the print thesis submitted, within the limits of the technology available.

Signature

Date

STATEMENT OF ACCESS

I, the undersigned, author of this work, understand that James Cook University will make this thesis available for use within the University Library and, via the Australian Digital Theses network, for use elsewhere. I understand that, as an unpublished work, this thesis has significant protection under the Copyright Act.

All users consulting this thesis will have to sign the following statement:

In consulting this thesis, I agree not to copy or closely paraphrase it in whole or in part without the written consent of the author, and to make proper public written acknowledgement for any assistance, which I have obtained from it.

Beyond this, I do not wish to place any restriction on access to this work.

.....

Signature

.....

Date

STATEMENT OF SOURCES

DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis is my own work and has not been submitted in any form for another degree or diploma at any university or other institution of tertiary education. Information derived from the published or unpublished work of others has been acknowledged in the text and a list of references is given.

.....

Signature

.....

Date

STATEMENT OF CONTRIBUTION OF OTHERS

This thesis was primarily funded by an *International Postgraduate Research Scholarship*, awarded by James Cook University. Additional field expenses were covered by Dr. J. Caley, and a stipend was provided by the *International Federation of University Women*. Dr. J. Caley also contributed to some theoretical and statistical aspects of this project. The swimming apparatus used in Chapter 5 was kindly provided by Prof. D. Bellwood, and Dr. R. Fisher provided technical instructions on how to set it up. This thesis also includes some collaborative work with M. Srinivasan (Chapter 2) for which we combined data sets in order to produce a more comprehensive publication. Finally, Dr. G. Jones and Prof. H. Choat provided assistance with the interpretation of results and editorial advice.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to thank everyone who has encouraged and helped me in any way throughout my candidature. Particularly I would like to thank:

- Geoff Jones and Julian Caley for financial and academic support
- Richard Evans, Ashley Frisch, Tim Prior, Andreas Bösch, Philippe Ziegler, Andrew Halford, Antoine Teitelbaum, Stefan Walker, Eddie Game, Jean-Paul Hobbs, Nicolai Konow, Paul Costello, and Nick Taylor for help in the field
- Peter Wruck and John Morrison from MARFU for technical assistance in the aquarium
- Ashley Frisch, Bridget Green, and Rebecca Fisher for teaching me how to rear anemonefishes
- David Bellwood for use of the swim channel and Rebecca Fisher for helping me to set it up
- Vanessa Thompson, Stephanie Miller, and Mindy Peterson for lab assistance
- Ken Anthony, Craig Syms, and Phil Munday for statistical advice
- Howard Choat, Phil Munday, Monica Gagliano, Tim Prior, Rebecca Fisher, and Line Bay for comments on draft chapters
- John Ackerman, Will Robbins, Bridget Green, Howard Choat, Ken Anthony, Michael Berumen, Line Bay, Liz Laman-Trip, Mikaela Bergenius, Maya Srinivasan, Sula Blake, Selma Klanten, and Monica Gagliano for general advice, discussions and encouragement
- The Department of Marine Biology and Aquaculture at James Cook University and the International Federation of University Women for funding and logistical support

Abstract

The parameters of a species life history and performance do not vary independently. Co-varying traits provide the basis for hypotheses as to how individuals allocate energy, as populations genetically adapt to or phenotypically adjust to different environments. In coral reef fishes, the extent and underlying causes of such patterns across large geographic scales are poorly understood. Intraspecific phenotypic variation may be evident on a broad geographic scale, for example when comparing populations that are geographically isolated or those along a latitudinal cline. Such variation may be the consequence of local genetic variation due to natural selection, and/or it may reflect phenotypic and behavioural plasticity that is largely environmentally determined. Discriminating between these potential causes of local population differentiation is an important goal of evolutionary ecology. This study provides a comprehensive description of geographic life history variation (reproduction, growth, mortality) and performance (swimming ability) in a long-lived group of coral reef fishes (subfamily Amphiprioninae). It presents a unique evaluation of the degree to which life history and performance traits may be coupled, and determines whether these traits are environmentally induced *vs.* genetically determined by employing an integrated set of common-garden experiments.

Chapter two of this thesis describes a comparative field study that examined latitudinal differences in the life history characteristics of three species of anemonefishes (*Amphiprion melanopus*, *A. akindynos* and *Premnas biaculeatus*) among three locations, including Kimbe Bay in West New Britain, Papua New Guinea (5°30'S/150°05'E), and Lizard Island (14°40'S/145°28'E) and One Tree Island (23°30'S/152°05'E) on the Great Barrier Reef, encompassing 18° of latitude. Life

history theory predicts that populations from higher latitudes should exhibit larger adult body sizes, but smaller size at age (i.e. slower growth). Concomitant with slow growth, a delay in sexual maturation is expected, which should be compensated through the fecundity advantage of a larger size and longer lifespan. As predicted, maximum age increased with increasing latitude in all three species. *A. melanopus* always had a higher maximum age than either *A. akindynos* or *P. biaculeatus* at each location, reaching 38 years at the highest latitude location. At this location, *A. melanopus* also had a larger adult body size, slower growth, lower mortality, greater proportional age and size at maturity and sex change, larger egg size and higher batch fecundity than at either of the lower latitude locations, and thus conformed well to life history theory. For the other two species, maximum body size was smaller at the higher latitude location, there were no differences among locations in growth and mortality rates, and no consistent trends in the timing of maturation or sex change. Thus, while longevity varied with latitude as expected in all three species, some of the other life history traits examined did not. The divergence in magnitude and direction of life history patterns among these species suggests that there are processes beyond simple trade-offs that determine life history strategies. I discuss the hypothesis that in anemonefishes, selection for flexibility in life histories imposed by a highly specialised habitat and rigid social structure may oppose selection over latitudinal environmental gradients.

Geographic variation in life history phenotypes between populations of a species is often assumed to reflect genetic divergence caused by natural selection. The relative contribution of genetic and environmental sources of phenotypic variation has never been determined in coral reef fishes. Yet, distinguishing between these sources of variation is fundamental to understanding the ecological and evolutionary significance of geographic life history variation. A conventional way of demonstrating the genetic

basis of adaptive variation in the wild is to perform a common-garden experiment, in which individuals from different local populations are compared under identical environmental conditions established in a laboratory. This approach formed the basis of the following three chapters.

In *chapter three* I determined whether the latitudinal variation in maternal reproductive traits observed in the wild has a genetic basis or whether it represents a phenotypic response to the environment. Adult fishes of the three species were collected from three latitudes along the Great Barrier Reef (Lizard Island, Britomart Reef at 18°23'S/146°63'E and One Tree Island) and their reproductive performance was monitored in a common-environment for up to 3 years. Based on life history theory and previous field observations I predicted larger egg sizes, but lower egg numbers in populations from higher latitudes. However, size-specific egg size, fecundity and reproductive output did not differ among populations in any of the three species held under identical environmental conditions. Thus, any divergence in these traits observed among natural populations most likely results from environmentally induced plasticity, rather than genetic divergence.

The next chapter describes another common-garden experiment with a full-sib design to examine differences in early growth rates and growth plasticity and among the latitudinal populations described above. Temperature and food availability were manipulated under controlled laboratory conditions to determine whether there is intraspecific variation in growth plasticity in response to these two environmental factors. Given that environmental variability generally increases with latitude I expected that offspring from high-latitude populations should display greater levels of plasticity compared to their low-latitude counterparts. In all three species, mean growth rates differed significantly among populations and were consistent with the co-gradient

variation hypothesis (i.e. offspring from low latitudes grew faster than offspring from high latitudes). Demonstrated under common-garden conditions, this implies that population-level variation in the growth capacity of juvenile anemonefishes has a genetic basis and should therefore respond to natural selection. Furthermore, significant genotype x environment interactions suggest the evolution of different growth reaction norms in response to temperature and food availability at different latitudes, although the variation did not always follow the predicted pattern. Overall, these results provide evidence for adaptive genetic differentiation for growth rate and growth plasticity in the early juvenile stages of these latitudinal populations.

Swimming abilities of larval fishes are important to their survival, potentially affecting their ability to avoid predators, obtain food and control dispersal and recruitment patterns. To date, no attempt has been made to quantify geographic and population-level differences in swimming performance of coral reef fishes. The aim of *chapter five* was to determine if, and to what extent, there is heritable variation for swimming performance among populations of the three anemonefish species across a latitudinal gradient. Flume-based trials were conducted to measure maximum sustainable swimming speeds (or U-crit) as an estimate of aerobic capacity of laboratory-reared pre-settlement larvae. My results confirmed that these fishes have different intrinsic swimming capabilities, such that offspring from high-latitude populations out-performed those from lower latitudes in all three species. These consistent behavioural differences between populations in the laboratory may reflect adaptive specialisation in response to latitudinal changes in coral reef environments. Mean swimming speeds were inversely related to mean body sizes among populations, suggesting that observed patterns may arise from a trade-off with growth rate. This demonstrates that developmental attributes and performance are interrelated in a

complex fashion, with multiple selection pressures acting on multiple aspects of the phenotype, and that adaptation involves trade-offs among competing functions.

This study has shown that both phenotypic plasticity and genetic differentiation across environmental gradients may exist for important fitness-related traits in coral reef fishes. The high potential for gene flow and lack of obvious barriers to dispersal in these species does not appear to preclude local adaptation in life history and larval swimming capacity along a latitudinal gradient. These results are significant steps forward in resolving the evolutionary and ecological processes that explain the substantial variation in the life histories and behavioural abilities of coral reef fishes.

Table of Contents

| | |
|-----------------------------|---|
| List of Tables | 3 |
|-----------------------------|---|

| | |
|------------------------------|---|
| List of Figures | 5 |
|------------------------------|---|

CHAPTER 1: General Introduction

| | |
|--|----|
| 1.1. Geographic variation and life history strategies | 7 |
| 1.2. The population comparative approach..... | 13 |
| 1.3. Adaptive differentiation: genes and phenotypic plasticity | 14 |
| 1.4. Common-garden experiments..... | 15 |
| 1.5. Local adaptation in coral reef fishes | 15 |
| 1.6. Aims of the thesis | 18 |
| 1.7. Structure of the thesis | 19 |

CHAPTER 2: Geographic variation in the life history traits of anemonefishes: are there latitudinal trends?

| | |
|---------------------------------|----|
| 2.1. Introduction..... | 26 |
| 2.2. Materials and Methods..... | 28 |
| 2.3. Results..... | 36 |
| 2.4. Discussion..... | 48 |

CHAPTER 3: Evaluation of the basis of geographic variation in the reproductive traits of anemonefishes

| | |
|---------------------------------|----|
| 3.1. Introduction..... | 53 |
| 3.2. Materials and Methods..... | 58 |
| 3.3. Results..... | 62 |
| 3.4. Discussion..... | 70 |

CHAPTER 4: Geographic variation in juvenile growth and growth plasticity of anemonefishes: a common-garden experiment

| | |
|---------------------------------|----|
| 4.1. Introduction..... | 77 |
| 4.2. Materials and Methods..... | 82 |
| 4.3. Results..... | 88 |
| 4.4. Discussion..... | 98 |

CHAPTER 5: Experimental evaluation of geographic variation in the sustained swimming ability of larval anemonefishes

5.1. Introduction..... 107
5.2. Materials and Methods..... 112
5.3. Results..... 116
5.4. Discussion..... 123

CHAPTER 6: General Discussion

6.1. Geographic life history variation in the wild 130
6.2. Reproductive performance is a phenotypically plastic trait..... 133
6.3. Genetic variation for growth rate in the early life history 134
6.4. Swimming performance of larvae differs among populations..... 136
6.5. Local adaptation in marine fishes 138
6.6. Implications for conservation and management 140
6.7. Conclusions..... 141

References 143

List of Tables

Chapter 2

| | |
|---|----|
| Table 2.1: Observed maximum sizes and ages of males and females of <i>A. melanopus</i> , <i>P. biaculeatus</i> , and <i>A. akindynos</i> at each location (Kimbe Bay, Lizard Island, and One Tree Island). | 38 |
| Table 2.2: Summary of Von Bertalanffy parameters for each species at each location. | 39 |
| Table 2.3: Results of likelihood ratio tests..... | 40 |
| Table 2.4: The timing of maturation of each species at each location..... | 44 |
| Table 2.5: The timing of sex change of each species at each location. | 45 |
| Table 2.6: Summary of one-way ANOVAs and post-hoc comparisons of means for batch fecundity, egg size, and batch fecundity-body weight ratio of <i>A. melanopus</i> at each location. | 47 |
| Table 2.7: Results of correlations between batch fecundity and age/weight for each species at each location..... | 47 |

Chapter 3

| | |
|---|----|
| Table 3.1: Mean egg sizes of <i>P. biaculeatus</i> , <i>A. akindynos</i> , and <i>A. melanopus</i> populations from three latitudes along the Great Barrier Reef. | 64 |
| Table 3.2: Mean relative fecundity of <i>P. biaculeatus</i> , <i>A. akindynos</i> , and <i>A. melanopus</i> populations from three latitudes along the Great Barrier Reef. | 66 |
| Table 3.3: Mean total reproductive output (cm ³) of <i>P. biaculeatus</i> , <i>A. akindynos</i> , and <i>A. melanopus</i> populations from three latitudes along the Great Barrier Reef..... | 68 |

Chapter 4

| | |
|--|----|
| Table 4.1: Feeding schedule for larval fish of each species during rearing..... | 83 |
| Table 4.2: Results of ANCOVA examining the effects of population, food (“fed” or “starved”) and temperature (23°C or 28°C) treatments on juvenile growth rate of <i>A. melanopus</i> , <i>A. akindynos</i> , and <i>P. biaculeatus</i> | 89 |
| Table 4.3: Results of ANOVA testing for effects of population origin and experimental treatments on survival of <i>A. melanopus</i> , <i>A. akindynos</i> , and <i>P. biaculeatus</i> | 95 |
| Table 4.4: Regression results of the relationships between growth rate and survival in each species at each location. | 98 |

Chapter 5

| | |
|---|-----|
| Table 5.1: Results of nested ANOVA testing for effects of population origin (location) and temperature on absolute swimming speed (U-crit)..... | 118 |
| Table 5.2: Linear regression results of mean U-crit <i>vs.</i> mean fish length (SL) at the time of swimming trials, based on clutch means for each population. | 119 |
| Table 5.3: Results of nested ANOVA testing for effects of population origin (location) and temperature on relative U-crit. | 122 |

List of Figures

Chapter 1

- Figure 1.1:** Predicted relationships between latitude, environmental characteristics and major life history traits according to life history theory. 22
- Figure 1.2:** Geographic ranges of the study species: *Amphiprion melanopus*, *Amphiprion akindynos*, and *Premnas biaculeatus*. 23
- Figure 1.3:** Map showing the locations of the study sites in the western Pacific Ocean: Kimbe Bay (PNG), Lizard Island, Britomart Reef and One Tree Island. 24
- Figure 1.4:** Seasonal changes in average sea-surface temperatures at each of the study sites. 25

Chapter 2

- Figure 2.1:** Sectioned sagittal otolith of the oldest (28 years) individual of *A. akindynos* collected from One Tree Island. 36
- Figure 2.2:** Von Bertalanffy growth functions fitted to size at age data of *A. melanopus*, *P. biaculeatus*, and *A. akindynos* at each location. 37
- Figure 2.3:** Mortality rates of each species at each location. 41
- Figure 2.4:** Sexual composition by age class for each species at each location. 42
- Figure 2.5:** Sexual composition by size class for each species at each location. 43
- Figure 2.6:** Reproductive parameters of each species at each location: (a) mean batch fecundity (number of eggs per female), (b) mean egg size, and (c) mean fecundity/weight and longevity. 46

Chapter 3

- Figure 3.1:** Map showing the geographic origin of breeding pairs along the Great Barrier Reef. 60
- Figure 3.2:** The relationships between mean egg size and maternal body size (SL) in *P. biaculeatus*, *A. akindynos*, and *A. melanopus*. 63
- Figure 3.3:** The relationships between mean fecundity (egg number) and maternal body size (SL) in *P. biaculeatus*, *A. akindynos*, and *A. melanopus*. 65
- Figure 3.4:** Temporal variation in the yearly mean egg volumes (mm³) of *A. melanopus* from a low- and high-latitude location over three consecutive years. 69

Figure 3.5: Temporal variation in the yearly mean relative fecundity of *A. melanopus* from a low- and high-latitude location over three consecutive years. 70

Chapter 4

Figure 4.1: Diagram of the experimental design. 85

Figure 4.2: Mean growth rates of *A. melanopus*, *A. akindynos*, and *P. biaculeatus* offspring from the respective locations. 90

Figure 4.3: 3-way interactions of ANCOVA, showing growth reaction norms of the different populations in the two experimental temperatures and feeding regimes. 93

Figure 4.4: Mean survival of the respective populations in each of the four experimental treatments. 96

Figure 4.5: The relationships between survival and growth rate in each species and location. 97

Chapter 5

Figure 5.1: Swimming apparatus used in the present study: a) lateral view, b) top view. Arrows indicate the direction of water circulation. 116

Figure 5.2: Mean absolute swimming speeds (U-crit) and body sizes (SL) of the three species from the respective locations. 117

Figure 5.3: Interaction effect of geographic location and experimental temperature on the mean swimming performance (U-crit) of *A. akindynos*, *A. melanopus*, and *P. biaculeatus*. 121

Figure 5.4: Average difference in swimming performance between 23°C and 28°C in populations of the three species at the low-latitude, mid-latitude, and high-latitude locations. 122