

Participation in Physics and rigorous Mathematics
and a consideration of educational, economic
and political influences.

Thesis submitted by
John Cyril Ridd BSc, AKC, PGCE, BA, BEd.
in March 2003

for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in
the School of Mathematical and Physical Sciences
James Cook University.

I, the undersigned, the author of this thesis, understand that James Cook University of North Queensland will make it available for use within the University Library and, by photographic or electronic means, allow access to users in other approved libraries. All users consulting this thesis will have to sign the following statement:

"In consulting this thesis I agree not to copy or closely paraphrase it in whole or in part without the written consent of the author; and to make proper written acknowledgement for any assistance which I have obtained from it"

Beyond this, I do not wish to place any restriction on access to this thesis.

J. C. Ridd.

Acknowledgements

I would like to take this opportunity to express my gratitude to my supervisor Professor M. Heron for the advice, enthusiasm, encouragement and constructive criticism that he has provided during the period of my candidature.

It is also important to acknowledge the remarkable assistance that has been provided by the staff of the Queensland Board of Senior Secondary Studies who made a plethora of detailed information freely available. My thanks also to the school principals who not only gave me a mass of information and skilled opinion but who, by their extraordinary response rate, provided me with an important psychological boost. In particular the principals, staff and especially the students of the five survey schools provided an unrivalled insight into the realities of subject selection.

My thanks to all of my family, John and Julia Bell, Michael and Sue Ridd and Peter and Cheryl Ridd for their constant encouragement and, when required, valuable criticism. Most of all to my wife Elaine who, in addition to providing some candid but constructive comments endured six years with a husband who was even more irascible than usual.

Declaration

I declare that this thesis is my own work and has not been submitted in any form for any other degree or diploma at any university or other institution of tertiary education. Information derived from the published or unpublished work of others has been acknowledged in the text and a list of references is given.

Preface.

The work reported in this thesis was based on a number of separate but interconnected pieces of research that were performed during a six year Ph.D. candidature:

An initial and then on going examination of Mathematics and physical Science enrolments at Tertiary level in a number of countries including Australia. Evidence of both demand and supply side influences were noted.

An initial and then on going examination of Secondary enrolments in Physics, Chemistry and rigorous Mathematics, primarily in Australia and with a strong focus on Queensland.

Queensland state legislation pertaining to Statutory bodies involved in Secondary education and some consequences arising from that legislation were examined.

A major survey of opinions of Queensland Secondary Principals in respect of Mathematics and physical Science with emphasis on the condition of the lower Secondary level. That survey had a 70% response rate.

An examination of student outcomes at the end of Year 10 in both physical Science and Mathematics. That examination involved a consideration of the scant hard data in existence together with an inspection of popular text-books.

A survey of the opinions of all the Year 12 students in five schools who had just completed their study of Maths C.

A survey of approximately 300 Year 10 students in the five schools at the time they were making their subject selections for Years 11 and 12. The survey examined student motivation, attitudes and knowledge of the Year 11/12 subjects.

A detailed examination and analysis of the Overall Position (OP) implications of the concurrent study of Maths B, Maths C and Physics for the students in the five schools.

An examination of the OP effect of that concurrent study by gender-viewed in terms of comparative advantage.

The performance of females and males in a number of Year 12 subjects was examined. That examination was over the whole state and considered subject performance in comparison to a measure of general ability.

Publications.

Ridd, J. and Heron, M. (1998) Science in crisis?-Participation in Physics. *A.N.Z. Physicist*.35 pp. 255-260

Ridd, J. (2000). Year 9 and 10 structures in Queensland and possible implications for subsequent studies in Mathematics and Physics. *The Physicist*. 37(3). Pp94-98

Ridd, J. (2002) Attainment in Maths and Science to Year 10 in Queensland: a tragedy in one Act. Conference paper, ASERA July 2002.

Ridd, J. (2002) A Ricardian approach to subject selection. *Journal of Institutional Research*, Vol.11(2). Melbourne.

ABSTRACT

In this thesis the level of participation in Physics and the allied discipline of rigorous Mathematics at Tertiary and upper Secondary level is examined. Various possible supply side constraints are considered, in particular the condition of Maths and Physics in lower Secondary schools in Queensland. Some of the effects of weak Maths and Physics in that part of the education chain are examined indicating that there is a commonality of interest between many school students, especially males, and the disciplines per se.

Participation in Physics at Tertiary level is in decline in USA, Canada and Germany as well as in Australia. There are indications from both Germany and USA that those declines are not entirely explicable by a consideration of demand side influences, supply side factors must have some influence. Because it may be possible to manipulate supply side influences, the work reported here concentrates on those issues, in particular in Queensland.

Participation in Physics and especially rigorous Mathematics in the last two years of Secondary schooling has been in medium to long term decline across Australia. In Queensland that decline is mainly a decline in male participation. The student decisions not to study those subjects are made at the end of Year 10. Hence their educational experiences prior to that time are important. Clear evidence is presented from a large sample of school Principals in Queensland that there is a high degree of concern in the schools about the condition of both Mathematics and Science in Years 8,9 and 10.

An inappropriate structure of relevant Statutory Authorities in Queensland has led to there having been no collection for 15 years of data vis-à-vis student outcomes up to the end of year 10. The only exception being a single but excellent study for Mathematics that showed that outcomes are highly variable and frequently weak, particularly for algebra.

For physical Science there is no data but indications from textbooks are that very little numerical Science is studied. Hence there is a discontinuity at the Year10/11 interface.

It is known that participation in the physical Sciences is highly dependent on previous educational experiences. The discontinuity referred to will affect participation in Physics and Maths C, the most rigorous Mathematics in Queensland at the Year11/12 levels. An analysis of effects on student Overall Position (the equivalent of ENTER) consequent to the concurrent study of Maths B, Maths C and Physics shows that students are advantaged in OP terms by that concurrent study. Hence the decision by an increasing number of capable students not to take those subjects may have a deleterious effect on their final outcomes. A survey of students from five North Queensland schools confirms that students who are taking Maths B/Maths C/Physics are comfortable with it and recognise that it has been to their advantage. Another part of that survey demonstrates a degree of ignorance about both Physics and Maths C amongst the Year 10 students at the time that they are making their subject selections. It is noteworthy that the advantage gained by taking the combination Maths B, Maths C and Physics is at least as noticeable for males as for females. Consequently it is an area of comparative advantage for males. An examination of male/female performance in rigorous Mathematics and numerical Science across the whole state demonstrates that, contrary to received wisdom, females are not performing better than males of similar general ability or have relatively improved their performance over the last decade at least.

It is suggested that a major overhaul of both Mathematics and physical Sciences in lower Secondary schools in Queensland is required. Such an improvement would tend to raise participation levels in both Physics and rigorous Mathematics to the advantage of many students, particularly males and provide a larger pool of qualified students from which Tertiary physical Science and Engineering Departments could draw.

The condition of both Mathematics and physical Sciences in Years 8/9/10 is at best highly variable, at worst poor, to the detriment of many thousands of

students and the related disciplines Mathematics and Physics. It is suggested that Parliament, the Statutory bodies, schools and Tertiary Education Faculties need to accept that a problem exists, accept a part of the responsibility for that problem and act decisively to rectify the situation.

CONTENTS

<u>Chapter 1</u>	Participation in Physics and rigorous Mathematics	1
	1.1 Overseas Tertiary enrolments	3
	1.1.1 Canada	3
	1.1.2 USA	7
	1.1.3 Germany	8
	1.2 Enrolment trends-Australia-Tertiary	11
	1.3 Overseas Secondary	19
	1.3.1 United Kingdom	19
	1.4 Enrolment trends-Australia Secondary	21
	1.5 Queensland	28
	1.5.1 Tertiary	28
	1.5.2 Secondary	28
	1.6 Enrolment discussion	40
<u>Chapter 2</u>	The importance of lower Secondary schooling and the condition of Mathematics and Science in Queensland.	42
	2.1 Introduction	43
	2.2 Assessment structures in Queensland	47
	2.3 The legislation of 1988	48
	2.4 Method of survey	49
	2.5 Responses from Principals	50
	2.5.1 Time allocations	50
	2.5.2 Internal organisation	52
	2.5.3 Perceptions of 'standards'	53
	2.5.4 Other related concerns	56
<u>Chapter 3</u>	Algebra, the essential tool	59
	3.1 Introduction	60
	3.2 Algebra as a tool	61
	3.3 Some influences on algebraic outcomes	64

3.4	Algebra at the end of Year 10	68
3.5	Discontinuity in mathematics at the Year 10/11 interface in Queensland	75
3.6	Use of algebra in early secondary science in Queensland	75
3.7	Discontinuity in physics at the Year 10/11 interface in Queensland	77
<u>Chapter 4</u>	Influence of subject selection on final Secondary school results (Overall Position) in Queensland.	79
4.1	Introduction	80
4.2	The Queensland OP system: an analytical opportunity	81
4.3	Methods	84
4.4	Relation between SAI and OP	86
4.5	SAI outcomes: Maths B, with and without concurrent Maths C	86
4.6	SAI outcomes: Physics, with and without concurrent Maths C	91
4.7	Opinions of student in Year 12 Maths C	94
4.8	Student reasons for subject selection.	97
4.8.1	Students in year 12 Maths C	97
4.8.2	Opinions of students in year 10	97
4.9	Discussion	100
<u>Chapter 5</u>	Male performance in rigorous Maths and the physical Sciences in Queensland.	102
5.1	Male performance, introduction	103
5.2	Female/Male OP performance in Queensland	104
5.3	Female/Male OP performance cf QCS.	106
5.3.1	General	106
5.3.2	Female/Male performance, Maths B,	107

	with/without concurrent Maths C. 5 schools.	
5.3.3	Female/Male performance, Physics, with/without concurrent Maths C	108
5.4	Comparison of Female/Male OP performance with general ability measure (QCS). State-wide.	110
5.4.1	Female/Male performance in Physics	110
5.4.2	Female/Male performance in Maths C	114
5.4.3	Female/Male performance in French	116
5.4.4	Female/Male performance in Maths B	117
5.4.5	Female/Maths performance in Chemistry	119
5.4.6	Female/Male OP performance: discussion	120
5.5	The scaling tests: historical Female/Male performance	122
5.6	Summary	127
<u>Chapter 6</u>	<u>Summation</u>	129
6.1	Summary of participation in Physics and rigorous Mathematics	130
6.2	Importance of lower Secondary schooling	132
6.3	Political/governmental/economic considerations	132
6.4	Outcome audit failure	134
6.5	Physics: a numerical science	135
6.6	The centrality of Mathematics	135
6.7	Condition of Maths	137
6.8	Discontinuity at the Year 10/11 interface	138
6.9	Algebra in Years 8/9/10	138
6.10	OP implications of subject selection	140
6.11	Female/Male performance in rigorous maths and Physics	141
6.12	Summary	142
6.13	Suggested remedial action	144
<u>Appendix 1</u>		147

Part A Covering letter to survey of principals	147
Part B Survey of information from, and opinions of principals of Queensland secondary schools.	149
<u>Appendix 2</u>	151
Part A Responses to survey question 7.	151
Part B General comments.	156
<u>Appendix 3</u>	166
Part A Survey of opinions of Year 12 Maths C students.	166
Part B Survey of opinions of Year 10 students.	168
Part C Verbatim comments of students in Year 12 Maths C. Five Schools combined. By gender.	171
<u>Appendix 4</u>	174
The calculation of Overall Position OP-simplified.	174
<u>Appendix 5</u>	177
Tertiary subject definitions: Department of Education, Science and Training.	177
<u>Appendix 6</u> The Core Skills Test	180
<u>References</u>	197

List of Tables

No.	<u>Title</u>	Page
<u>1.1</u>	Numbers enrolled at Canadian universities, 1986-1995.	4
<u>1.2</u>	Canadian enrolments as a percentage of total enrolments.	5
<u>1.3</u>	Number of new enrolments in first year Physics-Germany.	8
<u>1.4</u>	Number of first Year students, first semester-Heidelberg.	10
<u>1.5</u>	Australian totals for First Year enrolments.	12
<u>1.6</u>	Australian commencing enrolments, Physics and Chemistry 1989-2000	14
<u>1.7</u>	Australian commencing enrolments in Physics and Chemistry 2001	15
<u>1.8</u>	Australian commencing enrolments in Mathematics 1989-2000	16
<u>1.9</u>	Australian commencing enrolments in Mathematics 2001	17
<u>1.10</u>	Commencing and Third year Physics enrolments.	17
<u>1.11</u>	Edexcel Physics Numbers, London.	20
<u>1.12</u>	Australian enrolments, Physics/Chemistry. 1992-1995.	21
<u>1.13</u>	Participation change 1992-1996 as a percentage of 1992 numbers.	23
<u>1.14</u>	Physics enrolments, Victoria, 1997 to 2001.	23
<u>1.15</u>	Physics enrolments, New South Wales, 1997- 2001.	24
<u>1.16</u>	Physics Female/Male comparison, 1992-1996.	24
<u>1.17</u>	Chemistry Female/Male comparison.	25
<u>1.18</u>	Changes in participation in the most rigorous Mathematics.	26
<u>1.19</u>	Third Year Physics enrolments in Queensland, 1994-1999.	28
<u>1.20</u>	Physics enrolments, number of schools and mean enrolment per school. Queensland 1981-1994.	29
<u>1.21</u>	Physics student enrolments(4 semesters), number of schools and mean enrolment per school. Queensland 1992-2001.	31
<u>1.22</u>	Maths C enrolments, number of schools and mean enrolment per school. Queensland 1981-1994.	33
<u>1.23</u>	Maths C student enrolments(4semesters), number of schools and mean enrolment per school. Queensland 1992-2001.	34
<u>1.24</u>	Physics enrolments by gender, Queensland 1997-2001.	35
<u>1.25</u>	Maths C enrolments by gender, Queensland 1981-2001.	36

<u>1.26</u>	Enrolments Maths B, Maths C; Maths C as a percentage of Maths B, Queensland, 1992-2001.	37
<u>1.27</u>	Chemistry enrolments, Queensland, 1981-2001.	38
<u>2.1</u>	Correlation between ENTER score and various input factors.	44
<u>2.2</u>	Correlation between ENTER and Year 9 Literacy/Numeracy by State.	45
<u>2.3</u>	Differences in 'standards'-opinions of principals.	54
<u>2.4</u>	Standards differences: opinions as to level of concern.	54
<u>2.5</u>	Dependability of Maths/Science standards at Year 10 exit.	56
<u>3.1</u>	Teacher perceptions of Year 11 maths classes knowledge and ability to use various algebraic procedures. By item and by percentage of groups in three reliability levels.	71
<u>4.1</u>	QCS results. Mean and standard deviation for all students, selected subject cohorts.	81
<u>4.2</u>	Relation between mean SAI and OP band lower boundaries.	86
<u>4.3</u>	Maths B SAI means with and without concurrent study of Maths C.	87
<u>4.4</u>	Mean SAIs for Maths B, combined schools, with and without concurrent Maths C.	88
<u>4.5</u>	Probabilities that randomly selected (MB took MC) Maths B SAI > (MB no MC) Maths B SAI; by groups, to 2 decimal places.	89
<u>4.6</u>	Physics SAIs; combined schools, with and without concurrent Maths C.	91
<u>4.7</u>	Probabilities that randomly selected (Physics took MC) Physics SAI > (Physics no MC) Physics SAI by groups, to 2 decimal places.	92
<u>5.1</u>	Distribution of OP eligible students, by order band/sex.	105
<u>5.2</u>	Maths B. SAI outcomes, with/without concurrent Maths C. total schools and by gender.	108
<u>5.3</u>	Physics SAI outcomes, with/without concurrent Maths C. total schools and by gender.	109
<u>5.4</u>	Student results, Very High Achievement, High Achievement and Total of all 5 Levels of Achievement. Physics, 1997.	111
<u>5.5</u>	Mean and standard deviation of QCS results, Physics cohort 1997	111
<u>5.6</u>	'Predicted' and actual numbers of VHA/HA results, by gender, Physics 1992-2001.	114
<u>5.7</u>	'Predicted' and actual numbers of VHA/HA results, by gender,	115

Maths 2 1992-1994, Maths C 1996-2001, Maths 2+Maths C 1995.

<u>5.8</u>	'Predicted' and actual numbers of VHA/HA results, by gender, French, 1992, 1997, 2001.	116
<u>5.9</u>	Upper Levels of Achievement and QCS results, Maths B, 1992, 1997, 2001.	117
<u>5.10</u>	'Predicted' and actual numbers of VHA/HA results, by gender, Maths B, 1992, 1997, 2001.	118
<u>5.11</u>	Upper Levels of Achievement and QCS results, Chemistry, 1992, 1997, 2002.	119
<u>5.12</u>	'Predicted' and actual numbers of VHA/HA results, by gender, Chemistry, 1992, 1997,2001.	120
<u>5.13</u>	ASAT basic data, selected subjects, 1973 to 1988. (rounded to nearest integer)	123
<u>5.14</u>	QCS mean and standard deviation, all students in total and by gender, 1992-2001.	124
<u>5.15</u>	QCS outcomes by item difficulty, Hard (H), Medium (M), Easy (E), by total(H+M+E), by Writing Task (WT), by Total Score and gender.	125
<u>5.16</u>	Mean QCS outcomes by test section, total and gender. Physics. 1992-2000	126

List of figures

No.	Title	Page
<u>1.1</u>	Numbers enrolled at Canadian universities, 1986-1995.	4
<u>1.2</u>	Number of new enrolments in first year Physics, Germany.	9
<u>1.3</u>	Australian totals for first year enrolments.	12
<u>1.4</u>	Australian commencing enrolments	14
<u>1.5</u>	London Edexcel Physics	20
<u>1.6</u>	Physics enrolments and student numbers per school, Qld. 1981-1994	30
<u>1.7</u>	Physics student numbers (4 semesters) and number/school.	31
<u>1.8</u>	Maths C student numbers and number per school, 1981-1994	33
<u>1.9</u>	Maths C student numbers (4 semesters) and number/school.	34
<u>1.10</u>	Participation numbers in Maths C as a percentage of numbers enrolled in Maths B	37
<u>1.11</u>	Total and Female/Male participation trends in Chemistry.	39
<u>5.1</u>	Two normalised Gaussian Distributions.	112

Acronyms and abbreviations

AIP	American Institute of Physics.
ASAT	Australian Scholastic Aptitude Test. Replaced by QCS. (qv).
CSP	Canada Scholarship Program.
DEETYA	Commonwealth Department of Employment, Education, Training and Youth.
DEST	Commonwealth Department of Education, Science and Training.
Edexcel	A major London based secondary school examinations authority
EFTSU	Equivalent Full Time Student Unit.
ENTER	Equivalent National Tertiary Entrance Rank.
E.U.	European Union.
FASTS	Federation of Australian Scientific and Technological Societies.
LSAYR	Longitudinal Survey of Australian Youth. There are over twenty of these, LSAYR 22 is the most frequently referred to in this thesis.
OP	Overall Position. The Queensland equivalent of ENTER. (qv). See Appendix 4.
QBSSSS	Queensland Board of Senior Secondary Studies. Now superseded by QSA (qv). QBSSSS was frequently referred to as BOSSSS. Responsible for all studies and assessment in Years 11 and 12 only.
QCS	Queensland Core Skills Test. A test used in the Scaling process leading to the OP. See Appendix 4.
QSA	Queensland Studies Authority. The present single studies authority. The successor to QBSSSS, TEPA and QSCC. (qv)
QSCC	Queensland Schools Curriculum Council. Responsible for curriculum in Years 1 to 10. No assessment responsibilities.
SAI	Subject Achievement Indicator. See Appendix 4.
SCAT	Secondary Catholic.
SGOV	Secondary Government.
SIND	Secondary Independent.
TEPA	Tertiary Entrance Procedures Authority.
TIMSS	Third International Maths and Science Study.
WT	Writing Task. A part of QCS. (qv).