

**HERBIVOROUS FISHES AS DETERMINANTS OF THE STRUCTURE OF
CORAL REEF COMMUNITIES: FARMERS, FORAGERS AND THEIR
INTERACTIONS**

Thesis submitted by
Daniela Monica Ceccarelli (BSc)
In October 2004

For the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
In Marine Biology
Within the School of Marine Biology and Aquaculture
James Cook University

STATEMENT OF ACCESS

I, the undersigned, the author of this thesis, understand that James Cook University will make it available for use within the University Library and, via the Australian Digital Theses network (unless granted an exemption), for use elsewhere.

I understand that, as an unpublished work, a thesis has significant protection under the Copyright Act and;

I do not wish to place any further restrictions on access to this work.

ABSTRACT

Herbivorous fish are considered integral to the maintenance of healthy coral reef ecosystems. However, the impacts of different kinds of herbivorous fishes on algal and coral assemblages, and the consequences of interactions among them, have not been fully assessed. Two groups of fish with very different feeding behaviours and potential impacts on benthic communities are the territorial herbivores, (primarily damselfish; termed ‘farmers’ throughout this thesis), and the more mobile, often schooling herbivores, (primarily parrotfish and surgeonfish; termed ‘foragers’). Although farmers have been attributed the status of keystone species on coral reefs, the importance of this group has not been sufficiently evaluated. Farmers can affect benthic communities through selective feeding, ‘weeding’, exclusion of foragers through aggression, and habitat selection. However, the specific mechanisms by which farmers maintain the typical algal turfs in their territories have not been isolated. The overall goal of this thesis was to assess the relative importance of farmers and foragers, and the interactions between them, in determining the structure and dynamics of benthic communities on coral reefs.

The specific objectives of this thesis were to explore the role of farmers on coral reefs, to distinguish their role from that of foragers, and to experimentally distinguish among the potential mechanisms by which farmers maintain the benthic assemblages within their territories. I collected extensive observational data to assess the spatial and temporal variability in farmer effects, both within and between reefs. A comparative study allowed me to determine the effects of several farmer species with previously unknown impacts. I then used a series of experiments to determine the effects of foragers on farmers, the effects of farmers on foragers, and to separate the mechanisms by which both groups and their interactions affect benthic communities. The first chapter of this thesis introduces common generalizations about the role of farmers, and questions their validity in relation to previously existing information.

In Chapter 2, I describe the spatial variability and seasonality in the effects of three farmer species on their territories on a coastal coral reef. There were distinct patterns of zonation in both farmers and benthic communities, and the effects of farmers on algal assemblages in their territories varied across reef zones. Each species in this study maintained territories with different algal assemblages, indicating that there is no general effect of farmers on algal composition. The overall benthic community was

strongly seasonal, but the composition of algal assemblages in farmer territories varied in response to episodic events (cyclones, coral bleaching, etc.). These results suggest that studies on farmer effects may need to take account of the reef zone and the season in which sampling takes place.

Chapter 3 establishes the effects of different farmer species on benthic communities and assesses levels of feeding selectivity as a possible mechanism for modifying algal assemblages inside territories. I compared the diets, territory composition and space occupation of ten farmer species across three geographic locations representing different reef types. Overall, farmer territories occupied between 11% and 60% of reef substrata, and between 52% and 100% of reef crest habitats, suggesting that they are likely to be important contributors to coral reef community structure. All the farmers included in these studies significantly modified the algal assemblages in their territories by promoting the abundance of preferred food items. Diets varied along a continuum from detritivory to herbivory, and both the distribution of farmers on the reef and the benthic composition of their territories reflected the proportions of algae and detritus in their diets. This suggests that diet can give a strong indication to the likely nature and magnitude of farmer effects on their territories. The differences among species make it overly simplistic to consider them a single ecological grouping, but their space occupation as a community, and consequently the spatial extent of their influence, has previously been underestimated.

In Chapter 4, I explored the effects of foragers on farmers, their territory sizes and the benthic communities in their territories. A forager exclusion experiment showed that foragers had a major impact on the dynamics of two abundant farmers (*Pomacentrus adelus* and *P. wardi*), and altered their relative abundance in favour of the larger species, *P. wardi*. Territory size was enlarged only briefly when foragers were absent, but the results suggest that foragers can hinder the ability of some farmers to maintain optimal quantity and quality of food algae in their territories. Foragers were previously only thought to affect farmers through the energetic cost of territory defence, but this study suggests that foragers may also determine relative densities of farmers and the composition of their territories.

Chapter 5 focusses on an experiment designed to distinguish between the effects of farmers and foragers on algae and corals, and to assess the effects of forager exclusion and direct farming as mechanisms by which farmers affect benthic communities. The experiment was conducted on an oligotrophic reef in Papua New

Guinea and is based on an orthogonal combination of a farmer removal treatment and a forager exclusion treatment. It showed that foragers had quantitatively greater and qualitatively different effects on benthic community structure than farmers. Where foragers were excluded, there were substantial increases in the cover and biomass of macro-algae and a decline in some corals, regardless of the presence of farmers. Where farmers were removed there was a moderate decline in the cover of some palatable algal species, regardless of whether foragers had access. No effect of the exclusion of foragers by farmers could be detected, providing the first experimental evidence that direct farming activities can be more important than forager exclusion in the promotion of distinct algal turfs in farmer territories.

In Chapter 6, the separate effects of foragers and farmers on algal succession, and their interactions, were tested on an inshore reef with high macroalgal cover. Grazing by foragers, farmer activities, and the *a priori* differences in the location of territories had different effects on algal succession on settlement tiles. Benthic communities developed differently where foragers were excluded by farmers, compared with where they were excluded by cages. Foragers did not suppress fleshy macroalgae, but inhibited succession to exclude calcified and crustose algae. Farmers had more dramatic effects on succession than foragers on this reef, suppressing macroalgae and promoting dense stands of palatable filamentous algae. The results suggest that territories were established in locations less suitable to the growth of fleshy macroalgae, and were subsequently “cultivated” by farmers. This study provides further evidence of the importance of farming as a mechanism for modifying benthic communities, and challenges the notion that foragers have stronger effects than farmers on all reef types.

In summary, not all farmers have the same dramatic effects on benthic communities as those emphasized in the literature. However, more species than previously thought have significant effects on their territories, suggesting that the spatial extent to which farmers influence coral reef communities may be greater than expected. The interactions between foragers and farmers are complex, and can have consequences not only for farmer population densities, but also for the quantity and food quality of algal turfs in farmer territories. It is becoming increasingly evident that the effects of farmers are not always limited to the aggressive exclusion of foragers, and that the relative importance of foragers and farmers may vary on different reef types. Both foragers and farmers play important roles in the maintenance of the existing benthic

structure of coral reefs, and it seems likely that the loss of either group could lead to significant shifts in coral reef community composition.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, my heartfelt thanks go to my supervisors, Dr. Geoff Jones and Dr. Laurence McCook, for their guidance and support in the field and during the writing process. This work would not have been possible without their ideas, advice and assistance. Thanks to them I have had the opportunity to work on interesting projects in stunning locations.

My thanks extend also to Prof. Terry Hughes, who took me on board his caging experiment at Orpheus Island. His positive attitude to my work was always a source of encouragement.

I am grateful for the financial assistance provided by a James Cook University Postgraduate Research Scholarship, which fed my family for over three years. I also received a JCU Completion Scholarship (2004), and grants for research projects include an ARC grant to Dr. Geoff Jones (2001), and a GBRMPA Augmentative Research Grant (2001), a DMRS Grant (2002) and an Equal Opportunity Bursary (2003) to myself. A big thank you to university staff for their cheerful and friendly assistance at all times.

Thank you to all those people who provided both helpful comments for the thesis and support throughout the last four years: Line Bay, Dr. Andy Lewis, Dr. Andrew Baird, Dr. Mark McCormick, Martial Depczynski, Dr. Guillermo Diaz-Pulido, Prof. Helene Marsh, Maria Rodrigues, Carolyn Pike and Peter Jackson. For help with statistics, my thanks go to Dr. Glenn De'ath and Dr. Phil Munday.

Hoping I haven't forgotten anyone, big thanks go to volunteers for their invaluable assistance in the field and in the lab: Shelley DeRuyter, Nik Taylor, Dave Williamson, Mike Emslie, Ji Sleeman, Claire Wong, Joe Isaac, Condo, Alison Sampey, Abbi MacDonald, John Claydon, and Joe Logo.

I would also like to thank my many friends who provided childcare: without them, much of this work would not have been possible. In particular, big thanks go to Paula Swanson, Fiona Pettiford, and Amanda Murrell. For the final lifesaving effort during the last week of writing (when both boys were at home with chickenpox), I would like to thank Sara Ceccarelli and Mish Dyer.

Last, but most certainly not least, I must thank my extended family: Salvatore Ceccarelli and Stefania Grando, Sara Ceccarelli, Mark Hannan, Andy Lewis and Mish Dyer. Without my partner, Peter Jackson, the house would have fallen down around us, the children would have starved, the garden would have withered and my sanity would have disappeared: thank you for your endless patience. Tai, Felix and Barney were constant reminders of the relative importance of study and Real Life.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

HERBIVOROUS FISHES AS DETERMINANTS OF THE STRUCTURE OF CORAL REEF COMMUNITIES: FARMERS, FORAGERS AND THEIR INTERACTIONS.....	I
STATEMENT OF ACCESS	I
ABSTRACT.....	II
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	VI
TABLE OF CONTENTS	VIII
LIST OF FIGURES.....	XII
LIST OF TABLES	XV
STATEMENT ON SOURCES	XVI
DECLARATION	XVI
CHAPTER 1: GENERAL INTRODUCTION.....	1
CHAPTER 2: SPATIAL AND TEMPORAL PATTERNS IN THE EFFECTS OF FARMERS ON BENTHIC COMMUNITIES ON A COASTAL CORAL REEF. 10	
Introduction.....	10
Materials and Methods.....	12
Study site and species	12
Spatial patterns in fish and benthic communities.....	13
Space occupation and territory composition.....	15
Results	16
Spatial patterns in fish and benthic communities.....	16
Temporal variation in fish abundance and benthic community structure.....	18
Space occupation of farmer territories	22
Benthic communities inside and outside territories: spatial patterns.....	24
Benthic communities inside and outside territories: temporal patterns	30
Discussion	38
Differences among farmer species.....	39
Differences between reef zones	40
Temporal patterns	43
Comparison with offshore reefs.....	44
Conclusions.....	45

CHAPTER 3: A MULTI-SPECIES COMPARISON OF FARMERS AND THEIR EFFECTS ON CORAL REEF ALGAL COMMUNITIES	46
Introduction.....	46
Materials and Methods.....	49
Study sites	49
Distribution of study species	52
Diet and selectivity	54
Comparisons of inside and outside territories	55
Territory size and space occupation.....	56
Results	57
Diet and selectivity	57
<i>Gut contents</i>	<i>57</i>
<i>Selectivity.....</i>	<i>59</i>
Comparison of benthic assemblages inside and outside territories	66
<i>Percent cover of benthos.....</i>	<i>66</i>
<i>Composition of algal turfs</i>	<i>73</i>
Distribution and space occupation	82
Discussion	86
What do farmers eat?	86
How do farmers influence algal communities?	88
How important are they?	91
Conclusions.....	92
CHAPTER 4: THE EFFECTS OF FORAGERS ON FARMERS AND THEIR TERRITORIES.....	93
Introduction.....	93
Materials and Methods.....	97
Study site and species	97
Experimental design	97
Sampling regime	98
Results	100
Farmer density and territory size.....	100
Algal turf biomass and percent cover	104
Composition of algal turf	108
Discussion	115

CHAPTER 5: CONTRASTING EFFECTS OF FORAGERS AND FARMERS ON CORAL REEFS	122
Introduction.....	122
Materials and methods	124
Study site and species	124
Abundance of foragers and farmers	124
Benthic communities inside and outside farmer territories.....	124
Forager exclusion and farmer removal experiment	125
Experimental protocol.....	128
Results	129
Farmer territories: space occupation and benthic communities.....	129
Validation of the experiment	130
Effect of farmer removal.....	134
Effects of foragers (in absence of farmers).....	135
Effects of farmers (in absence of foragers).....	138
Effects due to farmer defense against foragers	138
Discussion	139
CHAPTER 6: THE INTERACTION BETWEEN FARMERS AND FORAGERS AND THEIR INFLUENCE ON ALGAL SUCCESSION ON CORAL REEFS ..	143
Introduction.....	143
Materials and Methods.....	145
Study site and species	145
Territoriality in <i>Stegastes apicalis</i>	146
Experimental design	146
Experimental protocol.....	150
Data analysis.....	153
Results	153
<i>S. apicalis</i> aggression rates	153
Comparison 1: Succession inside and outside farmer territories.....	153
Comparison 2: Forager effects	160
Comparison 3: Direct farming effects.....	163
Comparison 4: Territory location effects	167
Comparison 5: Exclusion effect.....	172
Comparisons 6 and 7: Cage effects	173

Discussion	176
Succession inside and outside farmer territories	177
The effects of foragers on succession.....	178
The effects of farmers on succession	178
Does location matter?	180
Are farmers simply forager exclusion treatments?	181
Relative importance of farmers and foragers	182
The role of fertilization.....	182
Conclusions.....	183
CHAPTER 7: GENERAL DISCUSSION	184
Role of farmers.....	184
Role of foragers	187
Effects of foragers on farmers	189
Effects of farmers on foragers	190
Unresolved issues	191
Conclusions.....	193
REFERENCES.....	195
APPENDIX 1.....	203
 Ceccarelli, D. M., Jones, G. P. and McCook, L. J. (2001) Territorial damselfish as determinants of the structure of benthic communities on coral reefs. <i>Oceanography and Marine Biology: an annual review</i> 39, 355-389	203

LIST OF FIGURES

Chapter 1: General introduction

Figure 1. Flow diagram of relationships between foragers, farmers, algae and corals	9
--	---

Chapter 2: Spatial and temporal patterns in the effects of farmers on benthic communities on a coastal coral reef

Figure 1. Map of Magnetic Island and Nelly Bay	14
Figure 2. Spatial zonation patterns in farmers, benthos and algae.....	19
Figure 3. Temporal variability in farmer densities	20
Figure 4. Temporal variations in the dominant benthic components	21
Figure 5. Territory size and space occupation of farmer territories.....	23
Figure 6. Percent cover of algal turf and epiphytes.	26
Figure 7. Percent cover benthic components inside and outside <i>P. tripunctatus</i> territories.....	27
Figure 8. Percent cover of benthic components inside and outside <i>P. wardi</i> territories.....	29
Figure 9. Percent cover of benthic components inside and outside <i>S. apicalis</i> territories.....	31
Figure 10. Temporal changes in the percent cover of algal turf and epiphytes .	32
Figure 11. Temporal variation in the percent cover of sediment inside and outside <i>P. tripunctatus</i> territories.....	34
Figure 12. Temporal variation in the percent cover of <i>Polysiphonia</i> spp. inside and outside <i>P. tripunctatus</i> territories.....	35
Figure 13. Temporal variation in the percent cover of sediment inside and outside <i>P. wardi</i> territories.....	36
Figure 14. Temporal variation in the percent cover of <i>Amphiroa</i> spp. inside and outside <i>P. wardi</i> territories.....	37
Figure 15. Temporal variation in the percent cover of filamentous algae inside and outside <i>P. wardi</i> territories.....	38

Chapter 3: A multi-species comparison of farmers and their effects on coral reef algal communities

Figure 1. Maps of Magnetic Island, Orpheus Island and Kimbe Bay.....	50
Figure 2. Zonation patterns of farmer communities in three locations.....	53
Figure 3. Results of gut content analysis.	58
Figure 4. Selectivity indices for seven species of farmers.....	61
Figure 5. Selectivity indices for seven species of farmers (select algal taxa)....	62
Figure 6. Principal Components Analysis (PCA) of gut contents for Magnetic Island.....	64
Figure 7. PCA of gut contents for Kimbe Bay.....	65
Figure 8. Benthic composition inside and outside farmer territories.....	68
Figure 9a. PCA of benthic composition inside and outside farmer territories on Magnetic Island.....	71
Figure 9b. PCA of benthic composition inside and outside farmer territories on Orpheus Island.....	72
Figure 9c. PCA of benthic composition inside and outside farmer territories in Kimbe Bay.....	73
Figure 10. Algal turf composition inside and outside farmer territories.....	76
Figure 11a. PCA of algal turf composition inside and outside farmer territories on Magnetic Island.....	79
Figure 11b. PCA of algal turf composition inside and outside farmer territories on Orpheus Island.....	80
Figure 11c. PCA of algal turf composition inside and outside farmer territories in Kimbe Bay.....	81
Figure 12. Territory size by species and location.....	84
Figure 13. Space occupation by species and location.....	85

Chapter 4: The effects of foragers on farmers and their territories

Figure 1. Photographs of benthic communities in Pioneer Bay.....	96
Figure 2. Changes in densities of adult and recruitinf farmers.....	102
Figure 3. Temporal changes in territory area of two farmer species.....	103
Figure 4. Changes in turf biomass by treatment over time.....	105
Figure 5. Changes in the percent cover of algal turfs by treatment over time.	107
Figure 6. Changes in the percent cover of corticated red algae.....	111
Figure 7. Changes in the percent cover of fleshy macroalgae.....	112
Figure 8. Changes in the percent cover of <i>Polysiphonia</i> spp.....	113

Figure 9. Changes in the percent cover of *Hypnea* spp. 114

Chapter 5: Contrasting effects of foragers and farmers on coral reefs

Figure 1. Experimental design and planned comparisons 127

Figure 2. Densities of foragers and farmers on the study reefs 131

Figure 3. PCA of benthic community structure inside and outside territories of
Pomacentrus adelus and *Plectroglyphidodon lacrymatus*..... 132

Figure 4. The effects of farmer removal on benthic and algal turf communities
..... 136

Figure 5. The effects of foragers on benthic organisms..... 137

Figure 6. Effects of farmers on algal turf communities 139

Chapter 6: The interactions between farmers and foragers and their influence on algal succession on coral reefs

Figure 1. Sampling design 149

Figure 2. Diagram of the experimental racks..... 151

Figure 3. Incursion and attack rates in *S. apicalis* territories..... 154

Figure 4. Comparison of algal succession inside and outside farmer territories
(functional groups)..... 155

Figure 5. Comparison of algal succession inside and outside farmer territories
(individual taxa)..... 157

Figure 6. Changes in diversity inside and outside farmer territories 159

Figure 7. Effects of foragers (functional groups)..... 161

Figure 8. Effects of foragers on diversity 162

Figure 9. Effects of foragers (individual taxa)..... 163

Figure 10. Effects of farming (functional groups) 165

Figure 11. Effects of farming (individual taxa) 166

Figure 12. Effects of territory location (functional groups)..... 169

Figure 13. Effects of territory location on algal diversity 170

Figure 14. Effects of territory location (individual taxa)..... 171

Figure 15. Effects of exclusion (functional groups) 174

Figure 16. Effects of exclusion (individual taxa)..... 175

Figure 17. Effects of partial cages Peyssonnellidae..... 176

LIST OF TABLES

Chapter 2: Spatial and temporal patterns in the effects of farmers on benthic communities on a coastal coral reef

Table 1. Categorization of substratum zones. 15

Table 2. Analysis of Variance for percent cover by species and zones 25

Chapter 3: A multi-species comparison of farmers and their effects on coral reef algal communities

Table 1. Summary of locations and species used for sampling 51

Chapter 4: The effects of foragers on farmers and their territories

Table 1. Results of Repeated Measures ANOVA on densities of adult and recruit *P. wardi* and *P. adelus*, and their territory sizes..... 101

Table 2. Results of Repeated Measures ANOVA on characteristics of algal turf collected inside the territories of *P. wardi*, *P. adelus* and *H. plagiometapon*, and outside territories..... 106

Chapter 5: Contrasting effects of foragers and farmers on coral reefs

Table 1. Summary of taxa present in each functional group..... 133

Table 2. Summary of the effects of each comparison..... 134

Chapter 6: The interactions between farmers and foragers and their influence on algal succession on coral reefs

Table 1. Functional groups used to classify algae..... 152

Table 2. MANOVA results for analysis of algal community structure 158

STATEMENT ON SOURCES

DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis is my own work and has not been submitted in any form for another degree or diploma at any university or other institution of tertiary education. Information derived from the published or unpublished work of others has been acknowledged in the text and a list of references is given.
