

Modelling Sub-Reef Thermodynamics to  
Predict Coral Bleaching:  
A Case Study at Scott Reef, WA

by

James C. Bird

Sc.B. with Honours from Brown University, USA

Advisors: T. Hardy and L. Bode

MASTERS THESIS

March 2005

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Masters  
of Engineering Science by Research at James Cook University.

**STATEMENT OF ACCESS**

I, the undersigned, author of this work, understand that James Cook University will make this thesis available for use within the University Library and, via the Australian Digital Theses network, for use elsewhere.

I understand that, as an unpublished work, a thesis has significant protection under the Copyright Act and;

I do not wish to place any further restriction on access to this work.

~~Or~~

~~I wish this work to be embargoed until :~~

~~Or~~

~~I wish the following restrictions to be placed on this work :~~

*[Handwritten signature]*



Signature


25/3/05  
Date

Appendix 3

STATEMENT OF SOURCES

DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis is my own work and has not been submitted in any form for another degree or diploma at any university or other institution of tertiary education. Information derived from the published or unpublished work of others has been acknowledged in the text and a list of references is given.



Signature

25/3/05

Date

25/3/05  
Date

[Signature]  
Signature

Statement of Contribution

Fees: Waived by James Cook University

Stipend support: Australian-American Fulbright Commission

Supporting institutions external (AIMS)

Supervision: Thomas Hardy, Craig Steinberg (AIMS), and Lance Bode

I, the undersigned, the author of this work, declare that the electronic copy of this thesis provided to the James Cook University Library is an accurate copy of the print thesis submitted, within the limits of the technology available.

Other collaborators: Woodside Energy Ltd and NOAA, and Atmospheric Administration National Environmental Science and Information Services

Statistical support: Steve Deegan (AIMS)

Editorial assistance: Craig Steinberg (AIMS), Thomas Hardy, Lance Bode, Richard

Binkman (AIMS), Kathleen Corvcon (AIMS)



25/3/05

Signature

Date

Research assistance: I Mason, Craig Steinberg (AIMS), Richard Binkman (AIMS), Luke Smith (AIMS)

Project costs: \$600,000 in field data, \$4,000 in AIMS beach fees, and \$1,000 in transport to AIMS all paid for by the joint project between AIMS and Woodside Energy Ltd. Additional project costs, such as JCU supervision and computer resources were provided by JCU.

Use of infrastructure internal to JCU: JCU's supercomputer used for numerical simulations.

## Statement of Contribution

**Fees:** Waived by James Cook University

**Stipend support:** Australian–American Fulbright Commission

**Supporting institutions external to JCU:** Australian Institute of Marine Science (AIMS)

**Supervision:** Thomas Hardy, Craig Steinberg (AIMS), and Lance Bode

**Other collaborations:** Woodside Energy Ltd. and NOAA / NESDIS (National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration /National Environmental Satellite, Data, and Information Service)

**Statistical support:** Steve Delean (AIMS) [suggested statistical models and reviewed statistical analysis]

**Editorial assistance:** Craig Steinberg (AIMS), Thomas Hardy, Lance Bode, Richard Brinkman (AIMS), Kathleen Corriveau [all edited thesis manuscript]

**Research assistance:** Luciano Mason [2D modelling], Craig Steinberg (AIMS), Richard Brinkman (AIMS) [oceanography], Luke Smith (AIMS) [coral ecology].

**Project costs:** \$600,000 in field data, \$4,000 in AIMS bench fees, and \$3,000 in transport to AIMS all paid for by the joint project between AIMS and Woodside Energy Ltd. Additional project costs, such as JCU supervision and computer resources were provided by JCU.

**Use of infrastructure internal to JCU:** *Hydra* supercomputer used for numerical simulations.

This thesis research forms part of a three-year project between AIMS and Woodside Energy Ltd. The overall design and goals of the project were developed by my advisors at AIMS prior to my involvement. Additionally, all field measurements were collected by AIMS before I began the project. My contributions were to develop the methodology to achieve the overall design and goals, process and analyse the field data, develop appropriate forcings for the numerical models, and analyse the results.

## **Acknowledgements**

This project and thesis would not have been possible without the help and commitment of several people. I would like to thank my supervisors Tom Hardy, Craig Steinberg, and Lance Bode, as well as my unofficial advisors Lou Mason and Richard Brinkman, for the invaluable support and guidance with which they all provided me over the course of this project. I would also like to thank Janice Lough, Terry Done, Steve Delean, and Severine Choukroun for their advice and support.

Additionally, this thesis would not have been written without the emotional support of my family and friends. I thank my flatmates for helping me to keep my work in perspective, and my girlfriend, Kathleen Corriveau. Although she was physically living halfway around the world, she was always by my side and in my heart.

## Abstract

Coral bleaching occurs when corals become stressed, which typically occurs during periods of elevated water temperatures. If water temperatures remain elevated for a sufficient length of time, the corals often die. Coral bleaching affects reefs around the world and the recent increase in the frequency and severity of bleaching episodes has raised considerable concern.

A clear understanding of the physics that elevate water temperatures may improve coral bleaching predictions and lead to more effective reef management. Currently, the best method to detect bleaching-like conditions is through a time integration of sea surface temperatures observed by satellite. Unfortunately, these observations only reveal the thermal structure for the top millimetre of water averaged over large areas (presently 2500 km<sup>2</sup>). The aim of this study is to use environmental physics to predict water temperatures at the reef and sub-reef scales. The study then goes a step further and translates these thermodynamic models into bleaching predictions.

Simulations are run using atmospheric and oceanographic data from Scott Reef, a 40 km-wide atoll 300 km off the northwest coast of Australia. Scott Reef presents an ideal test site as it experienced a severe bleaching event in 1998 that was well documented. Averaged coral cover in exposed sites dropped from 54% to less than 10% over the top 30 metres. Additionally, the bathymetry around Scott Reef has been thoroughly surveyed and in 2003 an extensive array of oceanographic instruments was deployed for three months at strategic locations.

A one-dimensional turbulence model is used to determine the vertical temperature structure of the water column around Scott Reef. Scott Reef is in a data-sparse region so that all of the heat fluxes have to be estimated from atmospheric conditions recorded at distant weather stations. The model results are verified with the 2003 field data. By driving the model with the appropriate atmospheric conditions, the simulated temperature profiles match the field observations. The model is next used to hindcast the temperature profiles during the 1998 bleaching event. Simulations indicate that anomalously-warm water most likely reached depths of 30 metres, a result that supports the claim that the deep bleaching was due to thermal stress.

Field observations confirm that water currents around Scott Reef are predominantly tidal. Additionally, the observations demonstrate that the upper layers of certain regions within Scott Reef cool during strong tides. This finding is characteristic of tidal cooling, a common phenomenon where tides mix cooler, deeper water with warmer surface water.

A map of sub-reef regions at Scott Reef that might experience tidal cooling is revealed by the numerical modelling. In a novel approach, stratified waters from the vertical model can be well-mixed in zones identified by a two-dimensional hydrodynamic model. There is a strong correlation between areas where bleached corals survived and locations that are predicted to have access to cooler well-mixed deep waters.

The techniques used in this work are applicable to other reef systems. Therefore the results in this thesis are significant as they improve two aspects of coral bleaching prediction. First, the methods can determine if coral at different depths are at risk of bleaching. Second, the methods can distinguish regions within individual reefs that are more susceptible to coral bleaching.



# Table of Contents

<b>PREFACE</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>CHAPTER 1 – INTRODUCTION</b> .....	<b>3</b>
CORAL BLEACHING .....	3
SPATIAL VARIABILITY IN BLEACHING .....	5
<i>Reaction to Stress</i> .....	5
<i>Location of Stress</i> .....	6
PREDICTING CORAL BLEACHING AND MORTALITY .....	7
<i>Remote Sensing Approach</i> .....	8
<i>Bayesian Belief Network Approach</i> .....	9
LIMITATIONS OF PREDICTION APPROACHES .....	10
<i>Bleaching at Depth</i> .....	10
<i>Physical Mechanism of Thermal Stress</i> .....	13
PROJECT OBJECTIVES .....	14
<b>CHAPTER 2 – SCOTT REEF OCEANOGRAPHIC OBSERVATIONS</b> .....	<b>16</b>
OCEANOGRAPHIC PROCESSES IN NORTHWEST AUSTRALIA .....	16
FIELD SITES AT SCOTT REEF .....	18
DATA ANALYSIS AND RESULTS .....	20
<i>Jerlov Water Type</i> .....	20
<i>Predominant Currents</i> .....	21
<i>Tidal Analysis</i> .....	22
<i>North Scott tidal asymmetry and stratification</i> .....	24
<i>Temperature Inversion</i> .....	26
<i>Evidence of Benthic Advection in Lagoon</i> .....	29
<i>Tidal Intrusions</i> .....	30
<i>Similar thermal features</i> .....	35
SUMMARY AND CONCLUDING REMARKS.....	36
<b>CHAPTER 3 – HEAT TRANSFER AT SCOTT REEF</b> .....	<b>37</b>
HEAT BALANCE.....	37
METHODS TO DETERMINE METEOROLOGICAL CONDITIONS.....	39
<i>Satellite Images</i> .....	40
<i>SST time series</i> .....	41
<i>Cloud Cover</i> .....	42
<i>Shortwave Radiation</i> .....	43
<i>Uncertainty in Cloud Fraction &amp; Shortwave Radiation</i> .....	47
<i>Air Temperature, Pressure, and Wind</i> .....	48
<i>Estimating Humidity</i> .....	52
BULK FORMULAS .....	58
<i>Shortwave Flux</i> .....	58
<i>Longwave Flux</i> .....	59
<i>Latent &amp; Sensible Heat Flux</i> .....	59
SUMMARY AND CONCLUDING REMARKS.....	60
<b>CHAPTER 4 – MODELLING VERTICAL TEMPERATURE STRUCTURE</b> .....	<b>61</b>
THE WATER-COLUMN NUMERICAL MODEL .....	61
<i>Temperature Boundary Conditions</i> .....	62
<i>Processes that contribute to vertical mixing</i> .....	63
<i>Wind Stress</i> .....	63
<i>Tidal Currents / Bottom Friction</i> .....	63
<i>Internal Mixing</i> .....	63
MODEL SETUP .....	64
MODEL RESULTS .....	66
<i>Building up the Model: Effect of Mixing Processes</i> .....	66
<i>Convection only from surface cooling</i> .....	66

<i>Comparison with observed SST and XBT Profile</i> .....	71
<i>Effect of Turbidity on Water Temperatures</i> .....	74
<i>Linking water temperature features with atmospheric conditions</i> .....	78
<i>Sensitivity Analysis</i> .....	80
HINDCAST OF 1998 BLEACHING CONDITIONS .....	82
<i>Estimation and Effect of Initial Profile</i> .....	82
<i>1998 Temperature Profile</i> .....	85
<i>Comparison with observed SST and XBT Profile</i> .....	86
VERTICAL TEMPERATURE ANOMALIES AND CORAL BLEACHING .....	88
SUMMARY AND CONCLUDING REMARKS .....	91
<b>CHAPTER 5 – SCOTT REEF MIXING AND THERMODYNAMICS</b> .....	<b>92</b>
SPATIAL VARIABILITY IN CORAL MORTALITY AT SCOTT REEF .....	92
<i>Coral Cover Surveys</i> .....	92
<i>Accounting for Coral Taxonomy</i> .....	94
TIDAL MIXING .....	95
HYDRODYNAMIC MODEL DEVELOPMENT .....	97
<i>Calculating tidal forcing on the boundary</i> .....	97
<i>Bathymetry</i> .....	98
CORAL BLEACHING HAZARD MAP .....	99
<i>Tidal cooling map</i> .....	99
HYDRODYNAMIC MODEL VALIDATION .....	101
CORAL BLEACHING HAZARD MAP RESULTS .....	104
<i>Velocity Map</i> .....	104
<i>Tidal Mixing Map</i> .....	106
<i>Tidal cooling map</i> .....	107
<i>Cooling Exposure Map</i> .....	108
CORRELATION BETWEEN HAZARD MAPS AND CORAL SURVIVAL .....	112
COOLING IN FIELD DATA .....	114
SUMMARY AND CONCLUDING REMARKS .....	116
<b>CHAPTER 6 – CONCLUSIONS</b> .....	<b>117</b>
<b>APPENDIX A – NOMENCLATURE</b> .....	<b>120</b>
<b>APPENDIX B – MOORING AND TRANSECT SUMMARY</b> .....	<b>121</b>
<b>APPENDIX C – DATA PROCESSING</b> .....	<b>126</b>
<b>APPENDIX D – TIDAL ANALYSIS</b> .....	<b>132</b>
TIDAL HEIGHTS .....	132
TIDAL CURRENTS .....	134
<b>APPENDIX E – SST ITERATION PROCEDURE</b> .....	<b>135</b>
<b>REFERENCES</b> .....	<b>139</b>

## List of Tables

Table 4.1: The relative effect of the uncertainties in the meteorological conditions on the water temperature.....	81
Table 5.1: Correlation between coral survival and tidal cooling.....	113
Table D.1: Tidal elevation constituents from Harmonic Tidal Analysis.....	130
Table D.2: Tidal current constituents from Harmonic Tidal Analysis.....	131

## List of Figures

Figure 1.1: Healthy and bleached corals lying side by side.....	5
Figure 1.2: Location of Scott Reef.....	14
Figure 2.1: Jerlov water types around Australia.....	17
Figure 2.2: Field sites at Scott Reef during 2003 field campaign.....	18
Figure 2.3: Cartoon illustrating a mooring and transect.....	19
Figure 2.4: Location of CTD casts in March and June of 2003.....	19
Figure 2.5: Observed light extinction at Scott Reef.....	20
Figure 2.6: Relative magnitude and direction of observed currents.....	21
Figure 2.7: The speed and direction of current observed at Site A.....	22
Figure 2.8: Comparison between observed current and those predicted by tidal analysis.....	24
Figure 2.9: Ponding effect observed in North Scott.....	25
Figure 2.10: Unusual temperature drop in North Scott during spring tides.....	26
Figure 2.11: An inverse temperature profile is stabilized by a halocline.....	27
Figure 2.12: Temperature, salinity, and cloud cover time-series leading to the development of an inverse profile.....	27
Figure 2.13: Irregular temperature and salinity profiles observed near Site F.....	28
Figure 2.14: Temperatures at Site D at varying depths.....	29
Figure 2.15: Temperature, salinity, and density profiles at Site F.....	30

Figure 2.16: All of the temperature records plotted together demonstrate that there are distinct cooling periods that correlate with spring tides.....	31
Figure 2.17: The temperatures at Site D during one week of spring tides shows that cooling occurs at varying depths during the incoming tide.....	31
Figure 2.18: The temperature and depth record of a ‘swinging’ logger at Site B.....	33
Figure 2.19: The temperature at Site B plotted as a function of depth and time.....	33
Figure 2.20: Temperatures measured during the flood and ebb tide at Site B.....	34
Figure 2.21: The common trend of the temperatures measured.....	35
Figure 3.1: Sea Surface Temperature observed at Scott Reef from 1998-1999.....	37
Figure 3.2: Cartoon of the fluxes in the heat balance.....	38
Figure 3.3: The locations of the meteorological sites used in this study.....	39
Figure 3.4: SST image around Scott Reef.....	40
Figure 3.5: Satellite image of Scott Reef that illustrates position and cloud detection..	41
Figure 3.6: Sea Surface Temperature observed at Scott Reef in 1998 and 2003.....	42
Figure 3.7: Estimation of daily-averaged shortwave radiation at Broome.....	44
Figure 3.8: Estimation of daily-averaged shortwave radiation at Scott Reef.....	45
Figure 3.9: Estimation of half-hourly shortwave radiation at Scott Reef.....	46
Figure 3.10: Uncertainty in cloud fraction estimates.....	48
Figure 3.11: Scatter plot of air temperature recorded simultaneously at Browse Island, Adele Island, and Scott Reef prior to 1996.....	50
Figure 3.12: Atmospheric pressure scatter plot between sites.....	50
Figure 3.13: Wind speed scatter plot between sites.....	51
Figure 3.14: Relative humidity measurements at Troughton Island and Kuri Bay.....	53
Figure 3.15: A climatological humidity curve.....	54
Figure 3.16: The location of humidity measurements collected by the <i>Franklin</i> as it passed Scott Reef in 1995, 1999, and 2000.....	55
Figure 3.17: Comparison of measured humidity and the climatological record.....	55
Figure 3.18: Comparison between weather station and ship humidity records.....	56
Figure 3.19: 68% confidence intervals for the climatological humidity.....	57

Figure 3.20: Flow diagram showing how meteorological conditions are converted in heat and momentum flux estimations using appropriate bulk formula.....	58
Figure 4.1: Simulated temperature profiles in the absence of any mixing due to wind, currents and internal processes.....	67
Figure 4.2: Simulated temperature profiles with wind stress.....	68
Figure 4.3: Simulated temperature profiles with bottom friction and wind stress.....	69
Figure 4.4: Temperature profiles that include the effects of internal waves, bottom friction and wind stress.....	70
Figure 4.5: The effect of internal waves on temperature profile.....	71
Figure 4.6: Comparison of modelled and observed sea surface temperature.....	72
Figure 4.7: Comparison of modelled and observed vertical temperature profile.....	73
Figure 4.8: Temperature profiles simulated for Jerlov type I water clarity.....	75
Figure 4.9: The effect of water clarity on sea surface temperature.....	76
Figure 4.10: The effect of water clarity on vertical temperature profile.....	77
Figure 4.11: Simulated and observed temperatures share distinct features.....	78
Figure 4.12: Meteorological conditions surrounding a distinctive cooling period.....	79
Figure 4.13: Heat fluxes and wind stress surrounding a distinctive cooling period.....	79
Figure 4.14: Climatological temperature profile in the vicinity of Scott Reef.....	83
Figure 4.15: Effect of initial profile on simulated water temperature profiles.....	84
Figure 4.16: Comparison of modelled water temperature profiles from 1998, 2003, and the climatological average.....	85
Figure 4.17: Modelled water temperature for the period February to April 1998.....	86
Figure 4.18: Comparison of simulated temperatures (1998) with sea surface temperature observations and a temperature profile record.....	87
Figure 4.19: HotSpot products: a prototype vertical water column through time is plotted next to the established spatial NOAA NESDIS satellite product.....	89
Figure 4.20: Degree-Heating-Week products: a prototype vertical water column version and the established spatial NOAA NESDIS satellite product.....	90
Figure 5.1: Coral cover data are collected along 90 transects at Scott Reef.....	93
Figure 5.2: Plot showing the percentage of coral survival at each of the monitoring locations after the 1998 coral bleaching event.....	93

Figure 5.3: The percentage survival after the 1998 coral bleaching event is shown for each of the five most common families at each of the six locations.....	94
Figure 5.4: The effects of tidal mixing on simulated water temperature profiles.....	95
Figure 5.5: A map and a 3-D rendering of Scott Reef bathymetry.....	98
Figure 5.6: An example of how tidal mixing can lead to cooling.....	100
Figure 5.7: Observed and modelled sea-surface elevation around Scott Reef.....	101
Figure 5.8: Observed, tidally predicted, and modelled currents in the north-south and east-west directions at Site D.....	102
Figure 5.9: Hodograph plot of the simulated and observed currents at Sites D and F.....	103
Figure 5.10: Hodograph plot of the simulated and observed currents at Site H.....	104
Figure 5.11: Near-maximum spring tide velocities around Scott Reef.....	105
Figure 5.12: Tidal mixing map that identifies stratified and well-mixed regions.....	106
Figure 5.13: A map of tidal cooling at Scott Reef estimated from a temperature profile during the height of the 1998 coral bleaching period.....	107
Figure 5.14: XBT profile used to generate cooling map.....	108
Figure 5.15: Cooling exposure map using XBT profile.....	109
Figure 5.16: Cooling exposure map using GOTM profile.....	110
Figure 5.17: Cooling exposure map using CARS profile .....	111
Figure 5.18: Illustration that both the current velocity and the cooling exposure correlate with coral survival.....	112
Figure 5.19: Cooling exposure map of Scott Reef indicating Sites D, E, F, and G....	114
Figure 5.20: Observed temperatures from Locations D, E, F, and G.....	115
Figure B.1: Temperature records for loggers believed to be at 20, 27, and 35 metres below surface at Site D.....	122
Figure B.2: Modified temperatures for loggers at Site D.....	123
Figure E.1: Predicted SST using a simple iteration technique.....	125
Figure E.2: Predicted SST using a modified iteration technique.....	126

## **Preface**

This thesis describes how a combination of thermodynamic and hydrodynamic models can be used to improve coral bleaching prediction. The model results have been compared to extensive field observations at Scott Reef, an isolated reef off the coast of northwest Australia. That said, the techniques presented within this thesis are not restricted to a particular geographic location and it is the author's hope that they might one day improve coral bleaching predictions worldwide.

In the introduction I discuss coral bleaching and why it is becoming an increasingly important issue. The spatial patterns that have been observed during bleaching events are mentioned with particular emphasis on how they may be caused. I describe two methods that are used to predict where coral bleaching is most likely to occur. I then identify the limitations of these techniques and outline how the work carried out in this project addresses these issues.

The second chapter focuses on the local oceanography around the test site, Scott Reef. I review what is currently known about the oceanography in the area and describe the 2003 field campaign, which was completed prior to my involvement in the project. Almost half of the work in the thesis involved compiling and analysing the field data; therefore considerable attention is given in explaining all the required steps. Finally, the noteworthy oceanographic characteristics are discussed; the results form a foundation that is referred to often in later chapters.

The third chapter describes the techniques used to estimate the heat transfer across the air-sea interface. The heat transfer depends on atmospheric conditions and the methods used to approximate these conditions are described. Finally, I discuss how the atmospheric conditions are applied to approximate the heat fluxes.

The fourth chapter explains how a numerical model was used to calculate the water temperature at various depths around Scott Reef. Simulations are first performed to calibrate and validate the model with the field data collected in 2003. The model is then run to calculate the temperature profiles which may have been present during the 1998 bleaching episode at Scott Reef. The impact of these temperature profiles on coral bleaching is discussed.

The fifth chapter investigates whether certain regions around Scott Reef are persistently cooler than other regions. Coral records at Scott Reef demonstrate that the coral mortality in 1998 differed among the sites sampled. Under the assumption that the spatial variability may be due to tidal mixing, a hydrodynamic model is used to calculate the tidal currents around the reef. Tidal currents and local bathymetry are combined to estimate mixing and potential cooling around the reef. Finally, the results are related to coral records as well as to temperature data.

The sixth and final chapter summarizes the techniques and results presented in this thesis. The two key objectives of the thesis are reiterated: first the investigation of water temperature at various depths, and second the examination of whether certain spatial locations are more susceptible to coral bleaching. I summarize the results of the numerical simulations and describe how these simulations are helpful in predicting coral bleaching. Finally, future research initiatives are identified and briefly discussed.