

# JCU ePrints

This file is part of the following reference:

**Smith, Luke Darren (2005) *Resilience and recovery of coral communities on an isolated reef system in Western Australia following a catastrophic mortality event*. PhD thesis, James Cook University.**

Access to this file is available from:

<http://eprints.jcu.edu.au/17233>



Resilience and Recovery of Coral Communities on an Isolated  
Reef System in Western Australia Following a Catastrophic  
Mortality Event

Thesis submitted by

Luke Darren SMITH B.Sc. (Hons) JCU

In December 2005

For the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

In the School of Marine Biology and Aquaculture at

James Cook University

## Statement of Access

I, the undersigned, author of the work, understand that James Cook University will make this thesis available for use within the University Library and, by the Australian digital thesis network, for use elsewhere.

I understand that, as a unpublished work, a thesis has significant protection under the copyright act and; I do not wish to place any further restriction on access to this work.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

## Statement of Sources

### Declaration

I declare that this thesis is my own work and has not been submitted in any form for another degree or diploma at any university and other institute of tertiary education. Information derived from the published or unpublished work of others has been acknowledged in the text and a list of references is given.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

## **Statement of the contribution of others**

During my postgraduate studies, overall supervision was provided by Professor Terry Hughes (TPH) and Dr Andrew Heyward (AJH). This research was primarily funded by Australian Institute of Marine Science.

Other collaborations: Numerous people have assisted with my PhD research over the years; many by providing stimulating intellectual input (see Acknowledgements). However, some have co-authored research papers that resulted from my postdoctoral research.

Chapter 3: James Bird undertook the modelling to hindcast the water temperatures at Scott Reef in 1998. Steve Delean provided assistance with statistics. TPH, and AJH provided editorial and research input. Currently, a paper is in preparation (see Appendix 1, research paper #13).

Chapter 4: TPH and AJH and James Gilmour provided editorial assistance and intellectual input. Currently a paper is in review (see Appendix 1, paper #11).

Chapter 5: Max Rees and AJH and James Gilmour provided input into this chapter and are co-authors in the resultant research paper (Appendix 1, paper #9).

Chapter 6: Steve Delean assisted with the statistical analysis. My supervisors contributed to the intellectual work. This chapter forms part of a research paper that is in review (see Appendix 1, paper #12).

Chapter 7: Richard Brinkman assisted in downloading and representing the drogue track data.

## **Acknowledgements**

Firstly, I wish to thank my PhD supervisors, Terry Hughes and Andrew (Smiley) Heyward. Terry always provided encouragement, intellectual input and a good coffee every time I turned up in Townsville. I thank Smiley for his input, enthusiasm and ability to always tell a good fishing story. In addition, I thank Smiley for always supporting my PhD studies within AIMS.

There have been numerous people who have helped me undertake this research. I thank the more than 20 people that have assisted me with the fieldwork. I would especially like to acknowledge Max Rees, Stuart Field, David Hocking, Kim Brooks and Jamie Colquhoun, thanks lads. In addition, I thank the crews of the Australian Customs, WA Fisheries and AIMS vessels for their enthusiasm and assistance, without them this research would not have happened.

Intellectual input over the journey was provided by Andrew Baird, Morgan Pratchett, Julian Caley, Bob Black, Andrew Negri and Stuart Field. I especially thank James Gilmour, a good friend and a person who assisted greatly over the years as a sounding board and a reviewer.

Finally thanks to my friends and family. To all the crew who put up with me saying “its almost there”, cheers. To my family; Mum, Dad, Steve, Grandma, Dave, Marn and Jazz, thanks for all your support over the years. To my girls Asha and Ruby, who have helped little with my PhD studies but who have definitely changed my life. To Em, who has always supported my study, even as finishing dates came and went, thanks. Finally to Nan and Pop who encouraged the Smith clan to spend all their holidays at the beach shack down south, and who first showed a small boy the wonders of the sea. Thank you.

## **Abstract**

Coral reefs are increasingly exposed to disturbances acting over a range of spatial scales. At a global scale, there is growing concern that a changing climate will affect the long-term health and resilience of coral reefs. Climate change is predicted to increase seawater temperatures and cause extensive and recurrent mass bleaching of corals. In 1998, seawater temperature anomalies in the world's oceans affected a large proportion of coral reefs, many of which suffered catastrophic levels of mortality. This thesis provides quantitative data on the direct impacts of a severe bleaching event at an isolated reef system, Scott Reef in northwest Australia, during the actual period of elevated seawater temperatures and in the months and years following it. I assess the recovery of coral communities in the five years following the disturbance, including the changes in recruitment, benthic cover and population size-structures. Overall, this thesis provides a key dataset to further our understanding of the impacts of severe bleaching events on coral communities and the processes of replenishment and recovery.

While many studies have documented the patterns of bleaching among species of corals at the time of elevated sea-water temperatures few have shown how these patterns of bleaching vary during the period of elevated sea-water temperatures and directly following it. To determine the short- and longer-term effects of bleaching on the community structure of corals, I quantified the changes in the percentage cover of different taxa, three and six months after a mass-bleaching event, at the Scott Reef system. The overall result of the mass bleaching event at Scott Reef was a major shift in community structure from one dominated by a diverse range of scleractinian and alcyonarian corals to one dominated by turf and coralline algae. It resulted in the death of the majority of zooxanthallae corals at all of the study locations at Scott Reef, with

relative decreases in the mean cover of hard corals of between 75% and 89%, depending on the reef habitat and depth. In addition, major differences were seen in the timing of mortality between different genera of corals.

In addition, I investigate how the severe bleaching event at the Scott Reef affected recruitment rates of corals, and consequently, the resilience of the resident coral communities. Coral cover and rates of sexual recruitment were quantified from two years before to five years after the bleaching event. The mass mortality of hard corals in 1998 caused a 97% decrease in recruitment rates at the Scott Reef system decreasing from a mean of  $39.1 (\pm 12.6 \text{ s.e.})$  recruits  $\text{yr}^{-1}$  prior to the bleaching to a mean of  $1.3 (\pm 0.2 \text{ s.e.})$  after it. I attribute this decline in coral recruitment to both the extent and severity of the bleaching and the loss of reproductive corals on Scott Reef, and the isolation ( $> 240 \text{ km}$ ) of the reef system. Satellite-tracked drogues released in the region showed larval transport times to the Scott Reef system are likely to be greater than 25 days, longer than the optimal competency period for most coral larvae.

To understand changes in percent coral cover I measured the changes in the number of colonies of different size and/or stage classes of three common groups of corals at the Scott Reef system. The data showed that the bleaching event affected all life stages (ie juvenile, small adults and large adults) of each coral group surveyed. In addition, the number of juvenile corals in the families Acroporidae and Pocilloporidae five years after the bleaching was unexpectedly high, given the very low rates of recruitment.

To elucidate the recovery of the reef communities at Scott Reef I quantified the changes in their structure over nine years; four years before and five years after the catastrophic bleaching event. Almost six years after the bleaching, percentage cover of hard corals had returned to approximately 40% of their pre-bleaching cover and the

community was returning to its previous percent cover, with evidence of an increasing rate of recovery in the later years. In fact, coral communities at some monitoring sites had almost returned to their pre-bleaching percent cover by 2003. It is likely that the survival and growth rates of corals at the Scott Reef system are relatively high. As a consequence, the coral communities are recovering, and at a faster rate than would be predicted, based in the severity of the bleaching event and the reduction in coral recruitment rates. In part, I attribute this recovery to the lack of many anthropogenic stressors that reduce the population growth rates of corals and promote the growth of competitors. These results suggest the resilience of coral communities to extreme, but infrequent (decadal) disturbances, and highlight the potential extent to which human activities may be compromising this resilience elsewhere.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>CHAPTER 1: General Introduction.....</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 Thesis Outline.....	9
<b>CHAPTER 2: Timing of spawning and recruitment at an isolated reef system.....</b>	<b>11</b>
2.1 Introduction.....	11
2.2 Material and Methods.....	13
2.2.1 Seasonality of Reproduction.....	13
2.2.2 Seasonality of Recruitment.....	14
2.3 RESULTS.....	15
2.3.1 Evidence of an autumn spawning.....	15
2.3.1 2.3.2 Evidence of a spring spawning.....	16
2.3.2 2.3.3 Evidence of a two spawning events.....	16
2.3.3 2.3.4 Seasonality of coral recruitment.....	17
2.4 Discussion.....	17
<b>CHAPTER 3: Short-term response of coral communities to a severe bleaching event.....</b>	<b>26</b>
3.1 Introduction.....	26
3.2 Material and Methods.....	27
3.2.1 Water Temperatures.....	27
3.2.2 Long-term monitoring of coral communities.....	28
3.2.3 Statistical Analysis.....	29
3.3 Results.....	31
3.3.1 Elevated sea-surface temperatures.....	31
3.3.2 Qualitative observations of coral bleaching of Scott Reef.....	32
3.3.3 Quantitative impacts of the mass bleaching: the first six months..	33
3.3.4 Overall effects of bleaching events on benthic communities.....	35
3.4 Discussion.....	37
<b>CHAPTER 4: System-wide decline in coral cover and recruitment.....</b>	<b>54</b>
4.1 Introduction.....	54
4.2 Methods.....	56
4.3 Results.....	59
4.4 Discussion.....	61
<b>CHAPTER 5: Changes in population size-structure of three groups of scleractinian corals.....</b>	<b>71</b>

5.1	Introduction.....	71
5.2	Materials and Methods .....	73
5.2.1.	Percentage cover of corals .....	73
5.2.2.	Population structure of corals .....	73
5.3	Results.....	74
5.3.1.	Pre-bleaching percentage cover and population structure .....	74
5.3.2	Post-bleaching percent cover and population structure .....	75
5.4	Discussion .....	77
<b>CHAPTER 6: Long-term dynamics of an isolated coral reef: effects of a severe bleaching event.....</b>		<b>83</b>
6.1	Introduction.....	83
6.2	Material and Methods .....	85
6.2.1.	Long-term monitoring.....	85
6.2.2	Data analysis .....	86
6.3	RESULTS .....	87
6.3.1.	Changes in percent cover of hard and soft corals .....	87
6.3.2.	Changes in coral cover at location level .....	88
6.3.3.	Changes in percent cover of different coral families .....	89
6.3.4.	Changes in community structure .....	90
6.4	DISCUSSION .....	91
<b>CHAPTER 7: Surface currents suggest reproductive isolation of Scott Reef .....</b>		<b>102</b>
7.1	Introduction.....	102
7.2	Material and Methods .....	103
7.3	Results.....	104
7.4	Discussion .....	105
<b>CHAPTER 8: General Discussion .....</b>		<b>113</b>
<b>References .....</b>		<b>116</b>
<b>APPENDIX 1 List of Publications during this thesis .....</b>		<b>129</b>
<b>APPENDIX 2 Manuscript from Chapters Two and Seven .....</b>		<b>131</b>
<b>APPENDIX 3 Manuscript from Chapter Six .....</b>		<b>131</b>

## TABLE OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1	Location of the Scott Reef system.....	6
Figure 1.2	Three-dimensional figure of the Scott Reef system showing the steep continental slope.....	6
Figure 1.3	Dual enhanced Landsat image of Scott Reef.....	7
Figure 1.4	Mean monthly sea-water temperatures and wind speeds at Scott Reef.....	8
Figure 2.1	Location of study sites at Scott Reef.....	23
Figure 2.2	Seasonality of reproduction and recruitment of acroporid corals at Scott Reef in 1996 and 1997.....	24
Figure 2.3	Mean monthly sea-water temperatures and wind speeds at Scott Reef.....	25
Figure 3.1	Location of monitoring sites at Scott Reef.....	42
Figure 3.2	Temperature data from depth of 16 metres of Location SL4 showing the high spike in water temperatures.....	43
Figure 3.3	Modelled temperature profile at Scott Reef for the period February - April 1998.. ..	44
Figure 3.4	Thermal induced coral bleaching at Scott Reef in June 1998, two months after the initial onset of the event;.....	45
Figure 3.5	Mean percent cover ( $\pm$ std error) of all hard and soft corals at Scott Reef during three surveys between November 1997 and November 1998.....	46
Figure 3.6	Mean percent cover ( $\pm$ std error) of four major coral taxa at Scott Reef during three surveys between November 1997 and November 1998. ...	47
Figure 3.7	PCA bi-plot of benthic community changes, as a result of the thermally-induced bleaching event at four locations at Scott Reef. ...	48
Figure 3.8	Mortality of hard and soft coral (mean $\pm$ s.e.) as a result of the thermally-inducing bleaching event at Scott Reef in 1998. ....	49
Figure 3.9	PCA bi-plot of benthic community changes, as a result a thermally-induced bleaching event at all reef slope monitoring locations at Scott Reef.....	50
Figure 4.2:	Position of the Scott Reef system and the monitoring locations.....	68
Figure 4.3:	Mean ( $\pm$ s.e.) percent cover of hard corals (line) and their rates of recruitment (bar) for sites at each monitoring location on the reef slope, from 1995 to 2004.....	69
Figure 4.4:	The relative decreases in the mean percent cover and rate of recruitment for three of the dominant coral families at Scott Reef, before and after the 1998 bleaching event. ....	70
Figure 5.1	Position of Scott Reef and the three study locations (L) off north-western Australia.....	80
Figure 5.2	Changes in the percentage cover of Acropora, Isopora and Pocilloporidae between surveys conducted in October each year. ....	81

---

Figure 5.3	Changes in the population structure of Acropora and Pocilloporidae between surveys conducted in October each year.....	82
Figure 6.1	Location of monitoring locations at Scott Reef .....	95
Figure 6.3	Percent coverage (mean $\pm$ s.e.) for major families of scleractinian coral; Acroporidae, Pocilloporidae and Poritidae average across all monitoring sites between 1994 and 2003. ....	98
Figure 6.4	The relationship between percent recovery to pre-bleaching levels of individual monitoring locations (ie 1997 vs 2003) and percent mortality suffered as a result of the 1998 bleaching event at Scott Reef, for hard coral and soft coral. ....	99
Figure 6.5	PCA bi-plot of benthic community changes over ten years (eight visits) at Scott Reef.....	100
Figure 7.1	Davis type near-surface drifter released at Scott Reef in August 2003. ....	108
Figure 7.2	Trajectory of surface drifter deployed from Scott Reef, September 2003. Yellow dots indicate date.....	109
Figure 7.3	Trajectory of surface drifter deployed from Ashmore Reef, April 2004.. ....	110
Figure 7.4	Trajectory of surface drifter deployed from Mermaid Reef, April 2004. Yellow dots indicate date.....	111

**TABLE OF TABLES**

Table 1.1	The presence and size of eggs within colonies of <i>Acropora hyacinthus</i> and <i>A. spicifera</i> .....	21
Table 2.2	Species observed to spawn or have pigmented eggs during one or more years in Autumn (March / April), and Autumn and Spring (October / November).....	22
Table 3.1	The mean percent cover of corals at the different habitats across the Scott Reef system and their relative decreases following the bleaching in 1998.....	51
Table 3.2	Mortality of the major coral groups associated with the bleaching event in 1998 averaged across monitoring locations at Scott Reef. ....	52
Table 3.3	Comparison of mean coral abundance in three sampling periods between November 1997 and November 1998.....	53
Table 4.1	The percentage cover of corals at the different habitats across the Scott Reef system and their relative decreases following the bleaching in 1998.....	65
Table 4.2:	Temporal mixed-model contrasts comparing mean coral cover and mean recruitment between specific years. ....	66
Table 4.3:	Mixed model contrasts comparing mean coral cover and mean recruitment in the years prior to the 1998-bleaching compared to the years after, for each monitoring location and averaged across all locations., ....	67
Table 6.1	Temporal trends in major groups of corals in the years prior to the thermal induced bleaching event (1994 – 1997). ....	101
Table 6.2	Temporal trends in major groups of corals in the six years following the 1998 bleaching event (1998-2003). ....	101
Table 7.1	Far-field lagrangian drifter deployment summary .....	112